

Interactive comment on “Tree-ring based spring precipitation reconstruction in the Sikhote-Alin Mountain Range” by Olga Ukhvatkina et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 25 May 2020

Dear authors, dear Editors

I was now able to read the manuscript carefully, and must concluded that its current form does not convince me for publication, simply because the overall quality is neither sufficient for Clim Past nor for any other peer-reviewed journal. This being said, I applaud the author for their important attempt to develop new tree-ring chronologies in this very remote part of the Far East of Russia.

The English style and grammar both require thorough improvement throughout the entire text, including the many figure captions that lack the necessary level of information needed to understand the (often rather overloaded) figures. Partly associated with an imprecise choice of words, the manuscript's structure is sometimes challenged by weak and confusing chains of arguments.

In addition to those limitations that could be solved by involving an English native speaking co-author well experienced in dendroclimatology (there are many that would likely be interested in this study), I am not fully convinced that the TRW dataset (sample size and age structure), the standardization applied (age-dependent splines) and the chronology option used (residuals) are indeed ideal (?) for the development of robust precipitation reconstructions (in terms of a useful signal-to-noise ratio).

Finally, I recommend removing all of the spectral analyses and its vague and misleading interpretation, because the time-series are too short to reveal any meaningful patterns and behavior.

In summary, my feeling is that a carefully revised version of this study, in which the authors describe the bio-geographic aspects of the highly interesting region in more detail and also better emphasize the ecological and (paleo)climatological relevance of tree-ring research, should be submitting to a more specialised journal. Moreover, I believe that stable isotopes could help improving the climate signal substantially (see for instance, Nakatsuka et al. (2020) <https://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2020-6/>).

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2020-49>, 2020.

[Printer-friendly version](#)[Discussion paper](#)