# Mysteriously high Δ<sup>14</sup>C of the glacial atmosphere: Influence of <sup>14</sup>C production and carbon cycle changes

3 4

5

Ashley Dinauer<sup>1,\*</sup>, Florian Adolphi<sup>1,2</sup>, Fortunat Joos<sup>1</sup>

6 <sup>1</sup>Climate and Environmental Physics, Physics Institute and Oeschger Centre for Climate Change Research,

7 University of Bern, Sidlerstrasse 5, 3012 Bern, Switzerland

8 <sup>2</sup>Quaternary Sciences, Department of Geology, Lund University, Sölvegatan 12, 22362 Lund, Sweden

9 \*To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: ashley.dinauer@climate.unibe.ch

10

11 Abstract. Despite intense focus on the ~190 permil drop in atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C during Heinrich Stadial 1 ~17.4 to 12 14.6 kyr BP, the specific mechanisms responsible for the apparent  $\Delta^{14}$ C excess in the glacial atmosphere have 13 received considerably less attention. The computationally efficient Bern3D earth system model of intermediate 14 complexity, designed for long-term climate simulations, allows us to address a very fundamental but still elusive 15 question concerning the atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C record: How can we explain the persistence of relatively high  $\Delta^{14}$ C values 16 during the millennia after the Laschamp event? Large uncertainties in the pre-Holocene <sup>14</sup>C production rate, as well 17 as in the older portion of the  $\Delta^{14}$ C record, complicate our qualitative and quantitative interpretation of the glacial 18  $\Delta^{14}$ C elevation. Here we begin with sensitivity experiments that investigate the controls on atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C in 19 idealized settings. We show that the interaction with the ocean sediments may be much more important to the 20 simulation of  $\Delta^{14}$ C than had been previously thought. In order to provide a bounded estimate of glacial  $\Delta^{14}$ C change, 21 the Bern3D model was integrated with five available estimates of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate as well as reconstructed 22 and hypothetical paleoclimate forcing. Model results demonstrate that none of the available reconstructions of past 23 changes in <sup>14</sup>C production can reproduce the elevated  $\Delta^{14}$ C levels during the last glacial. In order to increase 24 atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C to glacial levels, a drastic reduction of air-sea exchange efficiency in the polar regions must be 25 assumed, though discrepancies remain for the portion of the record younger than  $\sim$ 33 kyr BP. We end with an 26 illustration of how the  $^{14}$ C production rate would have had to evolve to be consistent with the  $\Delta^{14}$ C record, by 27 combining an atmospheric radiocarbon budget with the Bern3D model. The overall conclusion is that the remaining 28 discrepancies with respect to glacial  $\Delta^{14}$ C may be linked to an underestimation of  $^{14}$ C production and/or a biased-29 high reconstruction of  $\Delta^{14}$ C over the time period of interest. Alternatively, we appear to still be missing an important 30 carbon cycle process for atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C.

31

#### 32 1 Introduction

33

34 The cosmogenic radionuclide radiocarbon (<sup>14</sup>C) is a powerful tracer for the study of several ocean processes including

- 35 deep ocean circulation and ventilation. Past changes in atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C/C (i.e.,  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , in permil; corresponding to  $\Delta$
- 36 from Stuiver and Polach, 1977), as recorded in absolutely dated tree rings, plant macrofossils, speleothems, corals,

37 and foraminifera, have been interpreted as possibly reflecting real changes in the ocean's large-scale overturning

38 circulation (Siegenthaler et al., 1980). The extended 54,000-year record of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  from the latest IntCal compilation

39 (i.e., IntCal13; Reimer et al., 2013) and from two Hulu Cave stalagmites (Cheng et al., 2018) suggests that large

40 millennial-scale variations in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  have occurred during the last glacial, compared to the relatively small (~30 ppm)

41 change in atmospheric  $CO_2$  over the same time period (Fig. 1). When interpreting the implications of such changes, it 42

is important to note that  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is controlled not only by global carbon cycle processes but also by variations in the

43 atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C production rate. Therefore, the use of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  as an indicator of past oceanic conditions, particularly

44 those associated with air-sea exchange efficiency and deep ocean ventilation rates, requires reliable estimates of the

- 45 <sup>14</sup>C production rate over time.
- 46

47 The vast majority of all <sup>14</sup>C production changes are the result of either solar or geomagnetic modulation of 48 the cosmic ray flux reaching the Earth (Masarik and Beer, 1999; Poluianov et al., 2016). Fig. 1 shows several different 49 proxy records of the global production rate of <sup>14</sup>C in relative units covering the full range of the <sup>14</sup>C dating method, 50 based on geomagnetic field data from marine sediments (Laj et al., 2000; Laj et al., 2004; Nowaczyk et al., 2013; 51 Channell et al., 2018) and on <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>36</sup>Cl measurements in polar ice cores (Adolphi et al., 2018). A fundamental 52 difference between these reconstruction methods is that paleointensity-based estimates of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate, by 53 definition, do not reflect changes in the solar modulation of the cosmic radiation, whereas ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based 54 estimates give the combined influence of solar and geomagnetic modulation on radionuclide production. Of note is 55 the striking coherence in all three records  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , paleointensity-based production, and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based 56 production) of the Laschamp excursion (~41 kyr BP), when the Earth's geomagnetic dipole field briefly reversed and 57 its intensity was close to zero (Nowaczyk et al., 2012; Laj et al., 2014). According to reconstructions and production 58 rate models, this large geomagnetic event caused a doubling of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate, leading to the highest  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ 59 values over the last 54 kyr. Relatively high  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values continued until ~25 kyr BP, then gradually diminished to 60 preindustrial levels, interrupted by a sharp drop in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  during Heinrich Stadial 1 (HS1) ~17.4 to 14.6 kyr BP 61 (sometimes called the "mystery interval"; Broecker and Barker, 2007). While the Laschamp geomagnetic excursion 62 appears to be responsible for the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  peak at ~41 kyr BP, the production rate estimates during much of the pre-63 Holocene period are subject to considerable uncertainty.

64

65 Paleointensity-based reconstructions are sensitive to coring disturbances of poorly consolidated sediments. 66 The last 50 kyr are represented by the relatively slushy uppermost few meters of recovered marine sediment cores 67 (Channell et al., 2018). Channell et al. (2018) preferentially selected cores recovered using conventional piston and 68 square barrel gravity coring methods, and from sites with high mean (> 15 cm kyr<sup>-1</sup>) sedimentation rates, so as to 69 minimize the influence of drilling disturbance, and reached very different production rates than, e.g., Laj et al. (2000). 70 On the other hand, ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be records are affected by changes in the transport and deposition of atmospheric <sup>10</sup>Be, 71 which may overprint the production rate changes (e.g., Heikkilä et al., 2013). Furthermore, in order to calculate the

- 72 ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be deposition fluxes, snow accumulation rates must be known for each specific ice core, which themselves
- 73 have uncertainties on the order of 10 to 20 percent that propagate into the ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes (Gkinis et al., 2014;

Rasmussen et al., 2013). The large uncertainties associated with the reconstruction of past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production

- hamper our ability to predict reliably the extent to which production changes contributed to high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels.
- 76 Only if estimates of past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production are robust can one improve assessments of the relative importance
- of the two fundamental mechanisms responsible for glacial-interglacial  $\Delta^{14}$ C changes: (1) production changes and (2)
- 78 carbon cycle changes.
- 79

80 Earlier model studies have focused heavily on the ~190 permil drop in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  during HSI and on the deglacial 81 trends in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  after HS1 (Muscheler et al., 2004; Broecker and Barker, 2007; Skinner et al., 2010; Mariotti et al., 82 2016; Delaygue et al., 2003; Marchal et al., 2001; Huiskamp and Meissner, 2012; Hain et al., 2014). Historically, the 83 younger portion of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record has received more attention than the glacial section because of the early emphasis 84 on the general climatic trends of the North Atlantic stadials (HS1 and the Younger Dryas [YD]) and the Bølling-85 Allerød (BA) warm period, and on the important role of an exceptionally aged (14C-depleted) deep-water mass in the 86 pulsed rise of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> during the last glacial termination (e.g., Skinner et al., 2017). Less research over the 87 last few decades has studied the specific mechanisms responsible for high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels. The model studies 88 that are available point out the difficulties in simulating the correct glacial  $\Delta^{14}$ C<sub>atm</sub> levels (Hughen et al., 2004; Köhler 89 et al., 2006). These studies demonstrate with box models that glacial levels of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  cannot be attained without 90 invoking significant changes in ocean circulation, air-sea gas exchange, and carbonate sedimentation. However, the 91 box models were not able to reproduce  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values higher than 700 permil, and these results still need to be 92 scrutinized with models of higher complexity. To our knowledge, no three-dimensional ocean biogeochemical model 93 has yet simulated the 50,000-year record of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . Many questions remain unanswered, in particular: What 94 mechanism can account for the persistence of relatively high  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values during the millennia after the Laschamp 95 excursion?

96

97 The expected time scale for sustaining elevated levels of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  after a production peak is on the order of 98 thousands of years, a time scale tied to the mean lifetime of <sup>14</sup>C (~8223 years; Audi et al., 2003; Bé et al., 2013) and 99 the time required for deep ocean ventilation (on the order of 1000 years or more; Primeau, 2005). Specifically, 100 Muscheler et al. (2004) demonstrate that the characteristic time constant for equilibration of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  after a 101 perturbation in atmospheric production is 5000 years. By this analysis, the Laschamp event, which lasted only about 102 1500 to 2000 years (Laj et al., 2000), was insufficient to sustain the high  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm values observed over the next ~15,000 103 years. The lack of significant changes (only  $\sim 10$  percent) in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> during the time period of interest raises 104 the question of what causes variations in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , but not CO<sub>2</sub>, on millennial time scales? The obvious answers are: 105 cosmic ray modulation and air-sea gas exchange. Ultimately, no explanation for high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels can be 106 complete in the absence of more robust estimates of the pre-Holocene <sup>14</sup>C production rate, as well as a good 107 understanding of the ocean carbon cycle under glacial climate conditions.

108

109 One of the major challenges associated with modelling glacial-interglacial climate cycles is that it is currently
 110 not possible to reproduce climate and atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> variations on the basis of orbital forcing alone. Problems

111 include the complexity of the Earth system, making it difficult to represent all the relevant processes in models, and 112 the long time scales involved, making simulations covering tens of thousands of years costly in computation time. 113 Glacial-interglacial simulations with dynamic ocean and land models of intermediate complexity have begun to 114 emerge, but these models are not yet able to reproduce the reconstructed variations in important proxy data or the 115 timing of CO<sub>2</sub> variations during the last glacial termination (Brovkin et al., 2012; Ganopolski and Brovkin, 2017; 116 Menviel et al., 2012). A wide variety of mechanisms, both physical and biological, centered on or connected with the 117 ocean, as well as exchange processes with the land biosphere, marine sediments, coral reefs, and the lithosphere, are 118 thought to play a role in explaining the glacial-interglacial variations in atmospheric CO2 (Archer et al., 2000; Fischer 119 et al., 2010; Wallmann et al., 2016; Galbraith and Skinner, 2020), but how they interacted over time under the influence 120 of orbital forcing remains elusive. We appear to still be missing a single framework in which these mechanisms are 121 linked to each other in a predictable manner. As long as there are still large gaps in our understanding of the glacial 122 climate and associated ocean carbon cycle, a convenient way to examine the impact of the possible mechanisms on 123 atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels, and here on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , is to perform sensitivity experiments and scenario-based simulations 124 with models. This allows us to investigate specific phenomena in idealized settings, permitting us to investigate in 125 detail which parameters and processes are most important in controlling  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels.

126

127 In this paper we extend previous modelling efforts concerning the record of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  with respect to three 128 issues: (1) the sensitivity of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  response to carbon cycle changes and the potential importance of marine 129 sediments, (2) the simulation of  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm covering the time range of the IntCal13 radiocarbon calibration curve (50,000 130 years), the primary focus being the explanation of high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels, and (3) a new 50,000-year record of the 131 <sup>14</sup>C production rate, as inferred by deconvolving the reconstructed histories of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> with a prognostic 132 carbon cycle model and considering the uncertainties associated with the glacial-interglacial ocean carbon cycle. In 133 the following sections we first introduce the Bern3D earth system model of intermediate complexity and describe the 134 carbon cycle scenarios for forcing it. We then use step changes in the <sup>14</sup>C production rate and in selected parameters 135 of the ocean carbon cycle model to gain insight into the transient and equilibrium response of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . After these 136 sensitivity experiments we present the results of paleoclimate simulations forced by available reconstructions of past 137 changes in <sup>14</sup>C production together with reconstructed and hypothetical carbon cycle changes accompanying glacial-138 interglacial climate cycles. Finally, we present results for a first attempt to reconstruct the glacial history of the <sup>14</sup>C 139 production rate using the Bern3D model forced with reconstructed variations in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> as well as a wide 140 range of carbon cycle scenarios. We end with a comparison of three fundamentally different (model-based, 141 paleointensity-based, and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based) reconstructions of atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C production.

- 142
- 143 2 Materials and methods
- 144
- 145 2.1 Brief description of the Bern3D model
- 146

- 147 Simulations are performed with the computationally efficient Bern3D earth system model of intermediate complexity
- 148 (version 2.0), which is designed for long-term climate simulations over several tens of thousands of years. The Bern3D
- 149 couples a frictional geostrophic 3-D ocean general circulation model (Edwards et al., 1998; Edwards and Marsh, 2005;
- 150 Müller et al., 2006), a 2-D energy-moisture balance atmosphere model (Ritz et al., 2011), an ocean carbon cycle model
- 151 (Müller et al., 2008; Tschumi et al., 2008; Parekh et al., 2008), a chemically active 10-layer ocean sediment model
- 152 (Heinze et al., 1999; Tschumi et al., 2011; Roth et al., 2014; Jeltsch-Thömmes et al., 2019), and a four-box model 153

representing carbon stocks in the terrestrial biosphere (Siegenthaler and Oeschger, 1987). The coarse-resolution ocean

- 154 model is implemented on a 41 x 40 horizontal grid, with 32 logarithmically spaced layers in the vertical. The seasonal
- 155 cycle is resolved with 96 time steps per year. The tracers carried in the ocean model include temperature, salinity,
- 156 dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), dissolved organic carbon (DOC), carbon isotopes (<sup>14</sup>C and <sup>13</sup>C) of DIC and DOC,
- 157 alkalinity (Alk), phosphate, silicate, iron, dissolved oxygen (O<sub>2</sub>), preformed dissolved oxygen (O<sub>2,pre</sub>), and an "ideal
- 158 age" tracer. The ideal age is set to zero in the surface layer, increased by  $\Delta t$  in all interior grid cells at each time step
- 159 of duration  $\Delta t$ , and transported by advection, diffusion, and convection. Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub>, and <sup>13</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> are also
- 160 carried as tracers in the atmosphere model. For a more complete description of the Bern3D model, the reader is referred
- 161 to Appendix A.
- 162

#### 163 2.2 Implementation of the <sup>14</sup>C tracer

164

165 Natural radiocarbon (14C) is a cosmogenic radionuclide produced in the atmosphere by cosmic radiation. Once 166 oxidized to <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub>, it participates in the global carbon cycle. Atmospheric <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> invades the ocean by air-sea gas 167 exchange, where it is subject to the same physical and biogeochemical processes that affect DIC. The only difference 168 is that <sup>14</sup>C is lost by radioactive decay (half-life of 5700  $\pm$  30 years; Audi et al., 2003; Bé et al., 2013). The governing 169 natural processes, namely, atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C production, air-sea gas exchange, physical transport and mixing in the 170 water column, biological production and export of particulate and dissolved matter from the surface ocean, particle 171 flux through the water column, particle deposition on the sea floor, remineralization and dissolution in the water 172 column and the sediment pore waters, and vertical sediment advection and sediment accumulation, are explicitly 173 represented in the Bern3D model (see Fig. 2). Air-sea gas exchange is parameterized using a modified version of the 174 standard gas transfer formulation of OCMIP-2, with exchange rates that vary across time and space (see Appendix A 175 for more details).

176

177 Radiocarbon measurements are generally reported as  $\Delta^{14}$ C, i.e., the ratio of  ${}^{14}$ C to total carbon C relative to 178 that of the AD 1950 atmosphere, with a correction applied for fractionation effects, e.g., due to gas exchange and 179 photosynthesis (see Stuiver and Polach, 1977). In this model study,  $\Delta^{14}$ C is treated as a diagnostic variable using the 180 two-tracer approach of OCMIP-2. Rather than treating the  ${}^{14}C/C$  ratio as a single tracer, fractionation-corrected  ${}^{14}C$  is carried independently from the carbon tracer. The modelled <sup>14</sup>C concentration is normalized by the standard ratio of 181 182 the preindustrial atmosphere ( ${}^{14}r_{std} = 1.170 \text{ x } 10^{-12}$ ; Orr et al., 2017) in order to minimize the numerical error of

183 carrying very small numbers. For comparison to observations,  $\Delta^{14}C$  is calculated from the normalized and 184 fractionation-corrected modelled <sup>14</sup>C concentration as follows:

185

$$186 \qquad \Delta^{14}C = 1000({}^{14}r' - 1) \tag{1}$$

187

188 where  ${}^{14}r'$  is the ratio of  ${}^{14}$ C/C in either atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> or oceanic DIC divided by  ${}^{14}r_{std}$ , depending on the reservoir 189 being considered. The approach taken to simulate atmospheric  ${}^{14}$ CO<sub>2</sub> is analogous to the approach used for CO<sub>2</sub>, 190 except that the equation includes the terms due to atmospheric production and radioactive decay. For simulations 191 where the sediment model is active, the oceanic DIC tracer sees a constant input from terrestrial weathering, whereas 192 there is no weathering input of DI<sup>14</sup>C to the ocean (see Appendix A for more details).

193

194 In the preindustrial spin-up simulation needed to initialize the Bern3D model, atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> is held 195 constant at 278.05 ppm and  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  at 0 permil. During this integration time the ocean inventories of carbon and  $^{14}C$ 196 adjust to the forcing fields. The resulting changes after >50,000 years of integration are negligibly small. Fig. 3 shows 197 the steady-state  $\Delta^{14}$ C distribution in the surface (< 100 m) and deep (> 1500 m) ocean for the preindustrial control run. 198 The large-scale distribution of modelled oceanic  $\Delta^{14}$ C broadly resembles the observed pattern in the Global Ocean 199 Data Analysis Project (GLODAP; Key et al., 2004). That final state (i.e., the end of the preindustrial spin-up) is used 200 to diagnose the <sup>14</sup>C production rate for the preindustrial atmosphere, such that the rate of <sup>14</sup>C production is balanced 201 by radioactive decay and the net fluxes out of the atmosphere. For transient simulations, an adjustable scale factor is 202 applied to the preindustrial steady-state value of 443.9 mol  $^{14}$ C per year (1.66 atoms cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) in order to account for 203 production changes induced by solar and/or geomagnetic modulation. These production changes are derived from, 204 e.g., available reconstructions of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate in relative units, as detailed in Sect. 2.5. Note the preindustrial 205 spin-up results in steady-state values for weathering-derived inputs of DIC, Alk, P, and Si of 0.46 Gt C per year, 34.37 206 Tmol HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> per year, 0.17 Tmol P per year, and 6.67 Tmol Si per year, respectively. These terrestrial weathering 207 rates were chosen to balance the sedimentation rates on the sea floor and are held fixed and constant throughout the 208 simulations.

209

#### 210 2.3 Model configurations

211

We focus in this paper on the response of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  to changes in <sup>14</sup>C production and the ocean carbon cycle. For a deeper mechanistic understanding of the driving processes, step response experiments are first performed (see Sect. 3.1). These simulations include perturbations of the steady-state <sup>14</sup>C/C distribution under preindustrial conditions. We investigate the impact of step changes in (1) the <sup>14</sup>C production rate ("higher production" scenario), (2) wind stress and vertical diffusivity ("reduced deep ocean ventilation" scenario), and (3) the gas transfer velocity ("enhanced permanent sea ice cover" scenario). After a step change at time 0, the simulations are run to near-equilibrium over a 50,000-year integration. The following model configurations and therefore exchanging carbon reservoirs are

- considered: atmosphere–ocean (OCN), atmosphere–ocean–land (OCN-LND), atmosphere–ocean–sediment (OCN SED), and atmosphere–ocean–land–sediment (ALL).
- 221

Next we examine the influence of changes that are transient in nature. We simulate  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  over the full range of the <sup>14</sup>C dating method (i.e., 50 to 0 kyr BP) (see Sect. 3.2 and 3.3). These transient simulations are initialized at 70 kyr BP using model configuration ALL, and forced by reconstructed changes in <sup>14</sup>C production (see Sect. 2.5) over a 70,000-year integration. The first 20,000 years of the integration are considered a spin-up. Although the full record is simulated, we focus our analysis on the millennial-scale variation in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  before incipient deglaciation at ~18 kyr BP. Eight model runs are carried out for each production rate reconstruction, using different combinations of forcing fields and parameter values as described next.

229

#### 230 2.4 Carbon cycle scenarios

231

In our transient simulations with the Bern3D model, eight scenarios based on different assumptions about the global carbon cycle are considered, the details of which are summarized in Table 1. The goal is to investigate the extent to which changes in the ocean carbon cycle could explain high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels, given available reconstructions of past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production. We therefore consider a wide range of carbon cycle scenarios, including some extreme cases. A note of caution. Because millennial-scale  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  variations during the last glacial are what we are interested in, we do not attempt to reproduce abrupt climate perturbations such as Dansgaard-Oeschger warming events in the model runs.

239

240 In the first scenario (MOD), the model is run with fixed preindustrial boundary conditions for the Earth's 241 orbital parameters, radiative forcing due to well-mixed greenhouse gases, and ice sheet extent. As a consequence, 242 atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> remains approximately constant at the preindustrial level of 278.05 ppm over the simulation. The 243 second scenario (PAL) considers reasonably well-known climate forcing over the last glacial-interglacial cycle. 244 Simulations under this scenario are initialized with output from a previous spin-up simulation forced by glacial 245 boundary conditions with respect to orbital parameters (Berger, 1978), greenhouse gas radiative forcing based on 246 reconstructed atmospheric greenhouse gases (Köhler et al., 2017; Enting, 1987), and ice sheet extent. In simulations 247 under PAL, the model is integrated until 0 kyr BP following the reconstructed histories of the former. Ice sheets for 248 the preindustrial and Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) states are taken from Peltier (1994) and linearly scaled using the 249 global benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack of Lisiecki and Stern (2016), which is a global ice volume proxy. Changes in the albedo, 250 salinity and latent heat flux associated with the ice sheet buildup or melting are also taken into account (Ritz et al., 251 2011). Note that, although the radiative forcing for  $CO_2$  is prescribed, the atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration is allowed 252 to evolve freely, except in the simulations described in Sect. 2.5.

253

254 Model scenario PAL appears to still be missing an important process or feedback for atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, as it 255 cannot reproduce the observed low glacial CO<sub>2</sub> level without invoking additional changes (see, e.g., Tschumi et al., 256 2011; Menviel et al., 2012; Roth and Joos, 2013; Jeltsch-Thömmes et al., 2019). Variations in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> govern 257 how fast  $\Delta^{14}$ C signatures are passed between the atmosphere and ocean. Gross fluxes of <sup>14</sup>C between the atmosphere 258 and ocean, and vice versa, scale with atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> and its  ${}^{14}C/C$  ratio. It is therefore important to reproduce low 259 glacial atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in at least some of the model scenarios, thereby capturing the influence of 260 temporal changes in  $CO_2$  on the air-sea exchange of <sup>14</sup>C. In this study, we consider six scenarios that invoke additional 261 changes to force the model toward the observed low glacial CO<sub>2</sub> concentration. In addition to the PAL forcing, a time-262 varying scale factor F(t) is applied to some combination of tunable model parameters: wind stress scale factor  $\tau$ , 263 vertical diffusivity  $K_V$ , gas transfer velocity  $k_w$ , CaCO<sub>3</sub>-to-particulate organic carbon (POC) export ratio rr, and POC 264 remineralization length scale  $\ell_{POC}$ . For the preindustrial period, the value of F(t) is fixed at 1, whereas the theoretical 265 LGM value was chosen in order to achieve an atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration close to the LGM level of ~190 ppm 266 (see Table 1), as determined by sensitivity experiments. Note that the same values of F(t) apply to any of the model 267 parameters considered in a given scenario. To obtain intermediate values, F(t) is linearly scaled using the global 268 benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack (see Fig. 1). For the spin-up needed to initialize these simulations, the glacial spin-up simulation 269 of PAL was integrated for 50,000 model years, with tunable parameters adjusted to their appropriate glacial values. 270 Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> drawdown of up to  $\sim 100$  ppm is achieved over this 50,000-year integration. From that final spun-271 up state, the model is run forward in time until 0 kyr BP with PAL and F(t) forcing.

272

273 The first of these scenarios (CIRC) allows us to test the sensitivity of the model results with respect to changes 274 in ocean circulation. Tunable model parameters  $\tau$  and  $K_V$  were reduced to 40 percent of their preindustrial values 275 throughout the global ocean during the LGM (i.e.,  $F_{\tau,K_V} = 0.4$ ). Such a drastic change in the wind stress field is not 276 realistic. Rather, these changes should be viewed as "tuning knobs" that force the ocean model into a poorly ventilated 277 state with an "older" ideal age and <sup>14</sup>C-depleted deep waters, as suggested for the glacial ocean (e.g., Sarnthein et al., 278 2013; Skinner et al., 2017). In the model's implementation, a change in wind stress does not affect the gas transfer 279 velocity  $k_w$ , unlike in the real ocean where changes in wind stress and wind speed act together. The influence of a 280 change in air-sea exchange efficiency on the model results was investigated in a second scenario (VENT) where  $k_w$ 281 is reduced in the model's north (> 60°N) and south (> 48°S) polar areas in addition to global reductions of  $\tau$  and  $K_V$  $(F_{\tau,K_V,k_w} = 0.4)$ . A 60 percent reduction of  $k_w$  is unlikely to be correct but is a straightforward way to reduce the 282 283 model's gas exchange efficiency. In the third scenario (VENTx), reduction of polar  $k_w$  to 0 percent of its preindustrial 284 value was tested ( $F_{\tau,K_V} = 0.4$ ;  $F_{k_w} = 0.0$ ). Here,  $k_w$  remains fixed at 0 percent during the last glacial and is adjusted 285 to its preindustrial value via a linear ramp across the last glacial termination (~18 to 11 kyr BP). In this scenario, sea 286 ice would permanently cover 100 percent of the Southern Ocean during the last glacial, which is not supported by the 287 sea ice reconstructions of Gersonde et al. (2005) and Allen et al. (2011), and also the high-latitude (> 60°N) North 288 Atlantic and Arctic Ocean, for which there is some evidence (Müller and Stein, 2014; Hoff et al., 2016).

289

We end by investigating the sensitivity of the model results to changes in the parameters controlling the export production of CaCO<sub>3</sub> and the water column remineralization of POC. Model scenario BIO considers changes of the CaCO<sub>3</sub>-to-POC export ratio (and thus also the CaCO<sub>3</sub>-to-POC rain ratio; Archer and Maier-Reimer, 1994)

- 293  $(F_{rr} = 0.8)$  and POC remineralization length scale (Roth et al., 2014)  $(F_{\ell_{POC}} = 1.2)$ . These changes impact the global
- 294 carbon cycle by influencing the vertical gradients of DIC, Alk, and nutrients in the water column. A change in the
- fluxes of POC and CaCO<sub>3</sub> to the sea floor drives a change in the magnitude of their removal by sedimentation on the

sea floor. A modest reduction in the export ratio during the last glacial is compatible with reconstructed variations in

- 297 carbonate ion concentrations (Jeltsch-Thömmes et al., 2019). How the depth of POC remineralization changed over
- time is still unknown. The last two scenarios consider the combined effect of physical and biogeochemical changes:
- 299 PHYS-BIO ( $F_{\tau,Kv,kw,tr} = 0.7$ ) and PHYS-BIOx ( $F_{\tau,Kv,kw,tr} = 0.8$ ;  $F_{\ell_{POC}} = 1.2$ ).
- 300

#### 301 2.5 Measurement- and model-based reconstruction of <sup>14</sup>C production

302

303 Our ability to attribute past changes in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  to climate-related changes in the ocean carbon cycle is limited by our 304 ability to reconstruct a precise and accurate history of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate. Past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production can be 305 estimated from geomagnetic field reconstructions and from <sup>10</sup>Be measurements in polar ice cores. For ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-306 based estimates, we use the ice-core radionuclide stack of Adolphi et al. (2018), which is based on  ${}^{36}$ Cl data from the 307 GRIP ice core (Baumgartner et al., 1998), and on <sup>10</sup>Be data from the GRIP (Yiou et al., 1997; Baumgartner et al., 308 1997; Wagner et al., 2001; Muscheler et al., 2004; Adolphi et al., 2014) and GISP2 (Finkel and Nishiizumi, 1997) ice 309 cores. It also includes <sup>10</sup>Be data from the NGRIP, EDML, EDC, and Vostok ice cores around the Laschamp 310 geomagnetic excursion (Raisbeck et al., 2017). It has been extended to the present using the <sup>10</sup>Be stack of Muscheler 311 et al. (2016). All ice cores were first placed on the same time scale (GICC05) before <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes were calculated. This 312 70,000-year <sup>10</sup>Be stack provides relative changes of <sup>14</sup>C production rates under the assumption that <sup>14</sup>C and <sup>10</sup>Be 313 production rates are directly proportional, as indicated by the most recent production rate models (e.g., Herbst et al., 314 2017).

315

316 For paleointensity-based estimates, we employ (1) the North Atlantic Paleointensity Stack, or NAPIS, by Laj 317 et al. (2000) as extended by Laj et al. (2002), (2) the Global Paleointensity Stack, or GLOPIS, by Laj et al. (2004), (3) 318 a high-resolution paleointensity stack from the Black Sea (Nowaczyk et al., 2013), and (4) a paleointensity stack from 319 Iberian Margin sediments (Channell et al., 2018). In principle, stacks of widely distributed cores (NAPIS/GLOPIS) 320 are expected to yield a better representation of the global geomagnetic dipole moment, whereas the paleointensity 321 stacks from the Black Sea and the Iberian Margin avoid some of the problems associated with coring disturbances. 322 The four different paleointensity stacks were converted to <sup>14</sup>C production rates using the production rate model of 323 Herbst et al. (2017), the local interstellar spectrum of Potgieter et al. (2014), and assuming a constant solar modulation 324 potential of 630 MeV.

325

326 An alternative approach to estimating the <sup>14</sup>C production rate is to combine an atmospheric radiocarbon 327 budget with a prognostic carbon cycle model. Here simulations are performed with the Bern3D model and forced by 328 reconstructed changes in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub>, as well as reconstructed and hypothetical carbon cycle changes, over the 329 last 50 kyr. Both the IntCal13 calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2013) and the recent Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  dataset (Cheng et al., 2018) are used. Note that although the forthcoming IntCal20 calibration curve (Reimer et al., in press) will be the new standard atmospheric radiocarbon record for the last 55,000 years, essentially all data underlying IntCal20 before 13.9 kyr BP are tied to the Hulu Cave dataset, either via time scales (Lake Suigetsu plant macrofossil data) or marine reservoir corrections (marine records). Hence, the IntCal20 and Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  records are very similar and using IntCal20 would not impact our conclusions.

335

The <sup>14</sup>C production rate Q is calculated, each model year, from the air-sea <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> flux ( $F_{as}$ ), the atmosphereland <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> flux ( $F_{ab}$ ), the loss of <sup>14</sup>C due to radioactive decay, and the change ( $\dot{I}_a$ ) in the atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C inventory ( $I_a$ ):

- 339
- $340 \qquad Q = F_{as} + F_{ab} + \lambda I_a + \dot{I}_a$
- 341

where  $\lambda$  is the radioactive decay constant for <sup>14</sup>C, i.e.,  $\lambda = \ln 2/5700$  years = 1.2160 x 10<sup>-4</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. The radioactive decay term  $\lambda I_a$  and the change in inventory  $\dot{I}_a$  follow the reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> records, whereas  $F_{as}$  and  $F_{ab}$  are explicitly computed by the model. The  $F_{as}$  term depends strongly on the carbon cycle scenario under consideration (see Sect. 2.4 and Table 1). For comparison with other reconstructions, Q is converted into a relative value by normalizing it by the preindustrial value.

- 347
- 348 3 Results and discussion
- 349
- 350 **3.1** Atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C response to step changes
- 351

We use step changes in the <sup>14</sup>C production rate, and in selected carbon cycle parameters, to gain insight into the characteristic magnitude and time scale of the corresponding  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  changes (Fig. 4). Besides variations of the production rate, changes in ocean circulation and air-sea gas exchange are considered the most important factors affecting  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . Their effect on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  can be understood in terms of their effect on the reservoir sizes involved in the global carbon cycle and on the exchange rates between the reservoirs. We investigate the relative importance of the major global carbon reservoirs (atmosphere, terrestrial biosphere, ocean, and sediments) by considering four different model configurations (see Sect. 2.3), with particular emphasis on the role of marine sediments.

359

In model studies, the process of sedimentation (defined here as the difference between deposition and remineralization/dissolution of material on the sea floor) is often neglected because it is a relatively minor flux. In the Bern3D model, sedimentation removes only about 0.46 Gt C and 45.31 mol <sup>14</sup>C per year in the preindustrial steady state. Indeed, the interaction with the ocean sediments has little influence on the global mean value of oceanic  $\Delta^{14}$ C and therefore  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , as long as the total oceanic amount of carbon remains approximately constant (Siegenthaler et al., 1980); however, this is not always true, particularly in the case of millennial-scale climate perturbations. This is demonstrated by the differences between the model runs with and without sediments (i.e., ALL versus OCN-LND,

(2)

- and OCN-SED versus OCN) as shown in Fig. 4. The response of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  to various perturbations depends on the
- 368 magnitude of the change in the ocean carbon inventory, with a larger change achieved by considering the interaction
- 369 with the ocean sediments and the imbalance between weathering and sedimentation (see Fig. 5e,f). In order to facilitate
- 370 our discussion, we will make only direct comparisons between model runs ALL and OCN-LND, which both include
- 371 the four-box terrestrial biosphere model. We note that the <sup>14</sup>C exchange rate between the atmosphere and the terrestrial
- biosphere is only of minor importance for long time scales of millennia and more.
- 373

#### 374 **3.1.1** Change of <sup>14</sup>C production

375

376 At steady state, the relative change of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is equal to the relative change of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate, irrespective of 377 the individual reservoirs considered. Fig. 4 shows that  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  increases by about 100 permil (or 10 percent) when the 378 production rate is increased by 10 percent. In model run ALL,  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  increases approximately exponentially to its 379 new steady-state value with a characteristic time constant T of about 6170 years (i.e.,  $1 - 1/e \approx 63$  percent of the 380 total change in  $\Delta^{14}$ C<sub>atm</sub> occurs within 6170 years). This e-folding time scale is close to the mean lifetime of <sup>14</sup>C (~8223) 381 years), which is modulated by the time required for  $\Delta^{14}$ C to equilibrate between the atmosphere and the ocean (i.e., 382 the time scale for deep ocean ventilation, of the order of hundreds of years to 1000 years or more). In the next section, 383 we will investigate the effect of ocean carbon cycle processes on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ .

384

385 Note that for simplicity, we investigated only step changes in atmospheric production, although, in reality, 386  ${}^{14}C$  production varies continuously over time due to changes in the solar and/or geomagnetic modulation of the cosmic 387 radiation. This results in a non-steady state value of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ .

388

#### 389 3.1.2 Change of ocean circulation

390

The exchange rate between the surface and deep ocean is mainly determined by physical transport and mixing processes. The overall effect of these processes is to transport <sup>14</sup>C-enriched surface waters to the thermocline and deep ocean, where waters are typically <sup>14</sup>C-depleted. In addition, the nutrient supply by transport and mixing plays an important role in determining the production and export of biogenic material from the surface ocean, constituting a second pathway for transporting <sup>14</sup>C to the deep ocean.

396

In the Bern3D model, the tunable model parameters affecting the ventilation of the deep ocean include a scale factor  $\tau$  for the wind stress field and vertical diffusivity  $K_V$ . Fig. 4 shows the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  response after a sudden decrease of  $\tau$  and  $K_V$  by 50 percent. Although a halving of  $\tau$  and  $K_V$  does not represent a realistic change, the resulting state of the ocean's large-scale overturning circulation can be interpreted in terms of the "ideal age" of water, which represents the average time since a water mass last made surface boundary contact. The new steady-state ideal age after a halving of  $\tau$  and  $K_V$  is almost three times greater than the preindustrial steady-state value (i.e., ~1664 years versus ~613 years). This "ageing" of the ocean is achieved through a weakening and shoaling of the global meridional

- 404 overturning circulation as evident from a moderate reduction in the meridional overturning stream function for the 405 Indo-Pacific Ocean from about 14 to 9.5 Sv (1 Sv =  $10^6 \text{ m}^3 \text{ s}^{-1}$ ), and a very strong reduction from about 18 to 8 Sv in 406 the Atlantic meridional overturning stream function, consistent with evidence for the glacial ocean. Here, as expected, 407 the overall effect of deep water ageing is a stronger vertical  $\Delta^{14}$ C gradient in the water column and a subsequent 408 increase in  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm. The exact nature of the  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm response, however, depends on the carbon reservoirs considered.
- 409

410 If the ocean sediment reservoir is neglected, the time required for  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  to adjust to step changes in  $\tau$  and 411  $K_{\rm V}$  is relatively short.  $\Delta^{14}$ C<sub>atm</sub> increases rapidly to its new steady-state value of ~159 permil, with a time constant T of 412 about 600 years. This increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  can be explained by the fact that, owing to a weaker and shallower 413 overturning circulation, a comparatively large amount of carbon is moved from the atmosphere to the ocean. More 414 specifically, the atmospheric carbon inventory decreases by 14.6 percent, whereas the atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C inventory 415 decreases by only 1.1 percent (Fig. 5c). The <sup>14</sup>C being produced in the atmosphere is therefore diluted by a smaller 416 carbon inventory, increasing the atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C/C ratio; this asymmetry in the drawdown of CO<sub>2</sub> and <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> is what 417 permits the increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . Since the ocean carbon inventory changes by only +0.2 percent, the mean  $\Delta^{14}C$  value 418 for the global ocean is nearly unaffected, a decrease of only ~11 permil in the new steady state (Fig. 6g).

419

In the model run where the sediment model is active, there are two distinct time constants. A rapid increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  occurs, ~143 permil in the first few hundred years, then  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  gradually decreases to its final value of ~91 permil after tens of thousands of years. Reduced deep ocean ventilation is again responsible for the rapid  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ change and the respective time constant (T = ~480 years). The second time constant of ~23,390 years is due to the relatively long time required for the ocean carbon inventory to adjust to the ocean circulation-driven imbalance between weathering and sedimentation.

426

427 The process of ocean circulation interacts with the efficiency of the ocean's biological carbon pump, via its 428 impact on export production, ocean interior oxygen levels, and seawater carbonate chemistry/equilibria. This has 429 important implications for the sedimentation of biogenic material on the sea floor and, on a time scale of tens of 430 thousands of years, the total oceanic amount of carbon. Through this coupling of ocean circulation and sea floor 431 sedimentation via the biological carbon pump, a halving of  $\tau$  and  $K_V$  leads to a 9.8 percent increase of the ocean carbon 432 inventory in the new steady state (Fig. 5e). Qualitatively, a reduction in the ocean's overturning circulation leads to a 433 lower surface nutrient supply, which limits the production and export of biogenic material from the surface ocean. 434 This, in turn, decreases the fluxes of POC and CaCO<sub>3</sub> to the sea floor, with major consequences for the magnitude of 435 their removal by sedimentation. At the same time, a constant input of DIC, Alk, and nutrients is added to the ocean 436 from terrestrial weathering which is no longer balanced by sedimentation on the sea floor (this is what permits a larger 437 ocean carbon inventory). The overall effect is a gradual reduction of oceanic  $\Delta^{14}$ C by ~76 permil (Fig. 6g), which 438 dilutes the initial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  peak by 52 permil.

439

#### 440 3.1.3 Change of gas transfer velocity

442 It takes about a decade for the isotopic ratios of carbon to equilibrate between the atmosphere and a  $\sim$ 75-m thick 443 surface mixed layer by air-sea gas exchange (Broecker and Peng, 1974). A consequence of this is that the surface 444 ocean is undersaturated with respect to  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  (see Fig. 3). The choice of gas transfer velocity  $k_w$  as a function of 445 wind speed is critical for the efficiency of air-sea gas exchange. A reduction of  $k_w$  corresponds to a higher resistance 446 for gas transfer across the air-sea interface, which means that the <sup>14</sup>C produced in the atmosphere escapes into the 447 surface ocean at a slower rate. The effect of a lower  $k_w$  is a larger air-sea gradient of  $\Delta^{14}$ C and higher  $\Delta^{14}$ C<sub>atm</sub> values. 448 In contrast, the  $\Delta^{14}$ C value for the surface ocean is nearly unaffected so long as the ocean carbon inventory remains 449 approximately constant, since the vertical gradient of  $\Delta^{14}$ C in the ocean is dominated by physical transport and mixing 450 processes. Although the exact nature of the gas transfer velocity under glacial climate conditions remains unclear,  $k_w$ 451 represents a straightforward way to reduce the model's air-sea exchange efficiency due to theoretical changes in wind

- 452 stress, sea ice, etc.
- 453

454 Fig. 4 shows how  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  responds to a perturbation in the gas transfer velocity. In the model run without 455 sediments, reduction of  $k_w$  to 0 percent of its preindustrial value, in the model's north (> 60°N) and south (> 48°S) 456 polar areas, leads to a moderate increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  in the new steady state. The amplitude of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  change is ~42 457 permil, which is achieved with an e-folding time scale T of about 180 years. This relatively short time constant can be 458 explained by the multidecadal time scale required for  $\Delta^{14}$ C to equilibrate between the model's atmosphere, upper 459 ocean, and terrestrial biosphere. As shown in Fig. 6, the mean  $\Delta^{14}$ C values for the surface, deep, and global ocean in 460 the new steady state are only slightly different from the preindustrial steady-state values, as expected from the fact 461 that the ocean carbon inventory remains relatively stable.

462

463 Interestingly, if sediments are included in the model, the final value of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is much higher (~91 permil). 464 In this case, a perturbation in  $k_w$  leads to a very rapid initial increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  (~42 permil), and a much slower 465 subsequent increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  (~49 permil). The latter has an e-folding time scale T of about 14,200 years. This slow 466 doubling of the initial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  increase is unexpected, but can be explained by the fact that a reduction of  $k_w$  involves 467 also a reduction of air-sea  $O_2$  gas exchange in the deep water formation regions, decreasing the oceanic oxygen that 468 is available for transport to the deep ocean. This, in turn, implies lower oxygen concentrations in the water column 469 and the sediment pore waters, decreasing the rate of POC remineralization in the sediments. Reducing this has the 470 overall effect of enhancing POC sedimentation on the sea floor, causing the ocean carbon inventory to decrease. As 471 shown in Fig. 5f, the total oceanic amount of carbon decreases by 5.9 percent in the new steady state, resulting in 472 elevated  $\Delta^{14}$ C values for the surface (+56 permil), deep (+30 permil), and global (+37 permil) ocean as well as for the 473 atmosphere (+91 permil) (see Fig. 6). Note that the increase in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is not accompanied by a significant change in 474 the atmospheric carbon inventory, which decreases by only 2.2 to 3.3 percent. The air-sea equilibration time scale for 475  $CO_2$  by gas exchange is about 1 year for a ~75-m thick surface mixed layer (Broecker and Peng, 1974), which is much 476 smaller than the ventilation time scale for the deep ocean (on the order of several hundred years or more). One would 477 therefore expect that the oceanic uptake of  $CO_2$  demonstrates only a very small response to changes in  $k_w$ .

479 Overall, findings from these sensitivity experiments demonstrate that (1) the response of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  to changes 480 in the internal parameters of the ocean carbon cycle, in contrast to <sup>14</sup>C production changes, depends strongly on 481 whether or not the balance between terrestrial weathering and sedimentation on the sea floor is simulated, (2) the e-482 folding time scale for the initial adjustment of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  to ocean carbon cycle changes, i.e., changes in ocean circulation 483 and gas exchange, is shorter than that for production changes (i.e.,  $\sim 600$  years and  $\sim 180$  years versus  $\sim 6170$  years), 484 (3) air-sea gas exchange, in contrast to ocean circulation, has only a small effect on atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, given that gas 485 exchange is not the rate-limiting step for oceanic CO<sub>2</sub> uptake, and (4) on time scales of tens of thousands of years 486 changes in the balance between weathering and sedimentation can potentially diminish (or elevate) the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  value. 487 This is new, important information for future paleoclimate simulations and suggests that changes in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  may be 488 overestimated (or underestimated) in models that do not simulate the interaction between sea floor sediments and the 489 overlying water column.

490

478

#### 491 **3.2** Role of <sup>14</sup>C production in past atmospheric $\Delta^{14}$ C variability

492

493 We now consider the component of past  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  variability caused by production changes alone. Fig. 7 shows the 494 results of model runs using different reconstructions of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate, as inferred from paleointensity data 495 and from ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes. The global carbon cycle is assumed to be constant and under preindustrial conditions 496 for these simulations (i.e., scenario MOD is used). Our analysis is restricted to the glacial portion of the record (50 to 497 18 kyr BP), in part because this is the time period which experiences the largest production changes, and in part 498 because we did not attempt to reproduce the  $\sim$ 80 ppm change in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> that occurred during the last glacial 499 termination. As we have already noted, much research over the last decades has attempted to explain the observed 500 glacial-interglacial variations in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub>, and this was not the goal of this study.

501

502 At first glance, the millennial-scale structure of model-simulated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is comparable to that of the 503 reconstructions. These similarities appear to be highest for the oldest portion of the record, roughly before 30 kyr BP. 504 The model reproduces major features of the reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  variability such as the large changes associated with 505 the Laschamp (~41 kyr BP) and Mono Lake (~34 kyr BP) geomagnetic excursions. These two events are clearly 506 expressed as distinct maxima in all model-simulated records. A more detailed comparison reveals a high correlation 507 between the modelled and reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values between 50 and 33 kyr BP. Of note is the better agreement 508 with the new Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  dataset as compared to the IntCal13 calibration curve (i.e., Pearson correlation 509 coefficient r of 0.96 versus 0.91). This is likely due to the fact that the Laschamp excursion is smoothed/smeared out 510 during the stacking process of the IntCall3  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm datasets (Adolphi et al., 2018). The correlation between modelled 511 and reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is much weaker during the millennia after the Mono Lake excursion (33 to 18 kyr BP; r =512 0.52 to 0.64). While it is clear that much of the millennial-scale variation in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is driven by past changes in  $^{14}C$ 513 production, the model fails to reproduce the glacial level of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and also does not capture the ~15,000-year 514 persistent elevation of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  or the subsequent decrease of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  after ~25 kyr BP.

516 The reconstructions suggest that the highest values of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  occurred during the Laschamp excursion, with 517 a maximum value of ~595 permil at 41.1 kyr BP found in the IntCal13 record. The Hulu Cave record indicates even higher values for the Laschamp event  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm} = \sim 742$  permil, at 39.7 kyr BP). In contrast, the model is able to simulate 518 519 maximum  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values of only ~364 permil at 40.4 kyr BP, and ~236 permil at 40.5 kyr BP, as predicted by the paleointensity-based and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based production rate estimates, respectively. Although the model is unable to 520 521 reproduce the reconstructed values of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , the modelled amplitude of the variation in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  in response to the 522 Laschamp event shows a reasonable agreement with the reconstructed amplitude of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  change found in the 523 IntCal13 record (~240 permil). The  $\Delta^{14}$ C<sub>atm</sub> change predicted by paleointensity data has a maximal amplitude of about 524 320 permil, whereas the ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be data indicate a smaller amplitude (~224 permil). Note that the IntCal13 and 525 model-simulated amplitudes of the Laschamp-related  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  change are about two times smaller than that observed 526 in the Hulu Cave record (~575 permil), which is more likely to be correct.

527

515

528 Moving onto the full glacial record (50 to 18 kyr BP), there are considerable discrepancies between 529 reconstructed and modelled  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  ( $\Delta\Delta^{14}C$ ; see Fig. 7). The use of ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be data to predict past changes in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ 530 results in the largest  $\Delta \Delta^{14}$ C, with offsets between the records as high as ~544 to 558 permil (root-mean-square error 531 RMSE = 404 to 408 permil). Model-simulated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  given by paleointensity data varies widely between the four 532 available reconstructions, yielding  $\Delta\Delta^{14}$ C values of ~325 to 639 permil (*RMSE* = 206 to 455 permil). Note that the upper limit of the paleointensity-based  $\Delta\Delta^{14}$ C overlaps with the ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based  $\Delta\Delta^{14}$ C. Given the uncertainties 533 associated with the reconstruction of past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production, accurate predictions of its contribution to past 534 535 changes in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  are challenging. Nonetheless, the substantial systematic offsets between the reconstructed and 536 model-simulated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  records after ~33 kyr BP point toward insufficiently high <sup>14</sup>C production rates over this period 537 of time. The question arises as to whether another factor besides geomagnetic modulation of the cosmic ray intensity was responsible for elevated glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels. The effect of ocean carbon cycle changes on the evolution of 538 539  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is considered next.

540

### 541 3.3 Carbon cycle contribution to high glacial atmospheric $\Delta^{14}$ C levels

542

Here we investigate the magnitude and timing of the maximum possible  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  change during the last glacial period, obtained by running the Bern3D model with eight different carbon cycle scenarios (see Table 1). For the sake of clarity, we will discuss only the results of model runs using the mean paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate, though all available reconstructions were used. We emphasize that this is not a best-guess estimate of paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production. One should focus on the relative changes of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  between model scenarios, and how specific carbon cycle processes affect the glacial level of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ .

549

550 Modelled 50,000-year records of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> as well as their reconstructed histories are shown in Fig. 551 8. In order to provide a basis for comparison of modelling efforts, the results of model run MOD (which assumes a

- constant preindustrial carbon cycle) are presented. The influence of ocean carbon cycle changes on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  was tested in the other model runs. Interestingly, the forcing fields for model run PAL (orbital parameters, greenhouse gas radiative forcing, and ice sheet extent) have only a minimal impact on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . The PAL forcing fields also do not achieve sufficiently low glacial CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. Only a slight reduction of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> by ~20 ppm could be
- achieve sufficiently low glacial CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. Only a slight reduction of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> by  $\sim$ 20 ppm could be achieved, which unrealistically occurs during the last glacial termination (CO<sub>2</sub> = 258.07 ppm, at 14.6 kyr BP). With
- 557 hypothetical carbon cycle changes, the agreement between observed and modelled CO<sub>2</sub> during the last glacial period
- is good (as by design), but the deglacial  $CO_2$  rise is lagged and ~60 ppm too small at 11 kyr BP. Since this study
- focuses on glacial  $\Delta^{14}$ C<sub>atm</sub> levels before incipient deglaciation at ~18 kyr BP, we will not discuss the lag any further.
- 560

561 Model simulation of high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels can be significantly improved by considering hypothetical 562 carbon cycle changes in conjunction with PAL forcing. The amplitude of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  change is highest for runs CIRC, 563 VENT, and VENTx. This behavior is due to the fact that, owing to a reduction of  $\tau$ ,  $K_V$ , and  $k_w$ , strong vertical  $\Delta^{14}$ C 564 gradients in the ocean, as well as a large air-sea  $\Delta^{14}$ C gradient, are established. As shown in Fig. 8, a more sluggish 565 ventilation of deep waters is clearly expressed as an increase in the model ocean's global average ideal age and surface-566 and deep-water reservoir ages, where the latter two are calculated for the surface ocean and bottom water grid cells, 567 respectively. These are equivalent to radiocarbon reservoir age offsets following Soulet et al. (2016). The deep-water 568 reservoir age (i.e., B-Atm<sup>14</sup>C age offset, or B-Atm) provides a measure of the radiocarbon disequilibrium between 569 the deep ocean and the atmosphere, which arises due to the combined effect of air-sea gas exchange efficiency and 570 the deep ocean ventilation rate, whereas the effect of upper ocean stratification and/or sea ice on air-sea gas exchange 571 is particularly important for surface reservoir ages (i.e., surface R-age) (Skinner et al., 2019).

572

573 Driven by a reduction in ocean circulation, model run CIRC predicts a substantial increase in B-Atm during 574 the last glacial, which is defined here as 40 to 18 kyr BP to avoid biasing global mean estimates toward Laschamp 575 values. The global average glacial B-Atm predicted by CIRC is ~3225 <sup>14</sup>C years, representing an increase in B-Atm 576 of ~1599 <sup>14</sup>C years relative to the preindustrial value of ~1626 <sup>14</sup>C years. Model run VENT predicts a slightly larger 577 increase in glacial B-Atm due to the inhibition of air-sea gas exchange. The "oldest" glacial waters are found in model 578 run VENTx where air-sea gas exchange is severely restricted, yielding an increase in B-Atm of ~1912 <sup>14</sup>C years 579 (glacial B-Atm ~3538 <sup>14</sup>C years). The glacial B-Atm values given by runs CIRC, VENT, and VENTx, as well as the 580  $\sim$ 717 year increase in ideal age during the last glacial relative to preindustrial, suggest that the glacial deep ocean was 581 about two times older than its preindustrial counterpart. Comparison of our LGM B-Atm estimates (range of 3682 to 582 3962<sup>14</sup>C years) with the compiled LGM marine radiocarbon data of Skinner et al. (2017) demonstrate that the carbon 583 cycle scenarios are extreme, although it should be noted that Skinner et al. consider a wider depth range (~500 to 5000 584 m) of the ocean than we do. Skinner et al. (2017) predict a global average LGM B-Atm value of  $\sim$ 2048 <sup>14</sup>C years, an 585 increase of  $\sim 689^{-14}$ C years relative to preindustrial. Turning our comparison to surface reservoir ages, we note that 586 our global average LGM surface R-age of  $\sim 1132^{14}$ C years from runs VENT and VENTx is comparable to the  $\sim 1241$ 587 <sup>14</sup>C years obtained by Skinner et al. (2017) for the LGM. The model-based estimates of surface R-age from Butzin et al. (2017) indicate a much lower LGM value of ~780 <sup>14</sup>C years, and values ranging from 540 to 1250 <sup>14</sup>C years between 588

- 589 50 and 25 kyr BP. Note that these estimates are based on model-simulated values between 50°N and 50°S. If the polar
- 590 regions are included in the calculation (see Fig. 8c), their surface R-age estimates become comparable to our glacial
- 591 values (range of 911 to 1354 <sup>14</sup>C years), and between about 34 and 22 kyr BP can exceed them, including even those
- from model runs VENT and VENTx, unless  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> are prescribed (dashed colored lines in Fig. 8c) as in the
- 593 simulation by Butzin et al. (2017).
- 594

595 Indirect evidence for deep water ageing can be provided by the occurrence of depleted ocean interior oxygen 596 levels, due to the progressive consumption of dissolved oxygen during organic matter remineralization in the water 597 column. This situation is amplified by the slow escape of accumulating remineralized carbon in the ocean interior 598 (see, e.g., Skinner et al., 2017), leading to higher values of apparent oxygen utilization (AOU =  $O_{2,pre} - O_2$ ). These 599 two concepts (increased AOU and increased B-Atm) taken together signal a significant reduction in deep ocean 600 ventilation characterized by a decrease in the exchange rate between younger (higher  $\Delta^{14}$ C) surface waters and older 601 (14C-depleted), carbon-rich deep waters. Model runs CIRC, VENT, and VENTx do indeed indicate a large increase in 602 AOU of about 95 mmol  $m^{-3}$  from its preindustrial value of ~150 mmol  $m^{-3}$ . The reason for this AOU increase is that 603 a reduction of deep ocean ventilation permits enhanced accumulation of remineralized carbon in the ocean interior 604 and therefore a more efficient biological carbon pump. Model runs BIO, PHYS-BIO, and PHYS-BIOx allow us to 605 investigate the impact of other biological carbon pump changes on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> (i.e., changes in the CaCO<sub>3</sub>-to-606 POC export ratio and POC remineralization length scale). While these changes lead to an effective atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> 607 drawdown mechanism, model results confirm that their effect on  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is much less important (see Fig. 8).

608

609 Model run VENTx gives the best results with respect to glacial levels of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , with a maximum 610 underestimation of ~202 to 229 permil (*RMSE* = 103 to 110 permil) and a relatively good correlation (r = 0.79 to 611 0.91). Only one model parameter was changed for run VENTx as compared to runs CIRC and VENT, namely, the 612 polar gas transfer velocity  $k_w$  was reduced to 0 percent of its preindustrial value during the last glacial. In this extreme 613 scenario, we assume that sea ice cover extended in the northern hemisphere as far south as 60°N and in the southern 614 hemisphere as far north as 48°S, which is not supported by the reconstructions (Gersonde et al., 2005; Allen et al., 615 2011). Nonetheless, considering extreme assumptions about polar air-sea exchange efficiency under glacial climate 616 conditions is interesting for two reasons: (1) a change in gas exchange hardly affects the atmospheric  $CO_2$ 617 concentration, and (2) an additional change of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  could possibly be achieved on a time scale of tens of thousands 618 of years by changing the balance between weathering and sedimentation (see Sect. 3.1.3). This behavior has important 619 implications for the glacial atmosphere, which is characterized by high  $\Delta^{14}$ C levels in conjunction with low but 620 relatively stable CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. In contrast to a change in ocean circulation, air-sea gas exchange is a dedicated 621  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  "control knob" that can be invoked by models for a further increase of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  without changing atmospheric 622 CO<sub>2</sub>. Here, an additional increase in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  of ~130 permil relative to CIRC and VENT is achieved if gas exchange 623 is reduced permanently to 0 percent in the polar regions.

625 While the modelled  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values obtained by VENTx show rather good agreement with the reconstructions 626 between 50 and 33 kyr BP (r = 0.92 to 0.96; RMSE = 74 to 102 permil), considerable discrepancies remain for the 627 younger portion of the record. The analysis shown in Fig. 9 illustrates that even with extreme changes in the ocean 628 carbon cycle it is very difficult to reproduce the reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  values after ~33 kyr BP. During this period of 629 time, VENTx underestimates  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm by up to ~203 permil (*RMSE* = 118 to 128 permil), and is very poorly (r = 0.1) 630 correlated with the reconstructions, confirming that there are still considerable gaps in our understanding. Although it 631 may be possible that permanent North Atlantic-Arctic and Antarctic sea ice cover extended to lower and higher 632 latitudes than previously reconstructed, we conclude from our model study that even extreme assumptions about sea 633 ice cover are insufficient to explain the elevated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels after ~33 kyr BP. It appears instead that the glacial  ${}^{14}C$ 634 production rate was higher than previously estimated and/or the reconstruction of glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels is biased high. 635 The older portion of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record is based on data from archives other than tree rings (i.e., plant macrofossils, 636 speleothems, corals, and foraminifera) (Reimer et al., 2013), providing, except for the Lake Suigetsu plant macrofossil 637 data (Bronk Ramsey et al., 2012), only indirect measurements of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . Note that these data show uncertainty in 638 calendar age that propagate into the estimation of past  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels.

639

640 Large uncertainties in the pre-Holocene <sup>14</sup>C production rate also hamper our qualitative and quantitative 641 interpretation of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record. There is considerable disagreement between the available reconstructions of past 642 changes in <sup>14</sup>C production (Fig. 1). Paleointensity-based estimates typically predict higher <sup>14</sup>C production rates than 643 ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based ones. An exception is the paleointensity stack from Channell et al. (2018), which predicts lower 644 production rates. But, irrespective of the scatter, it is clear that all of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate estimates are insufficiently 645 high to explain the elevated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels during the last glacial. Given the uncertainties in these estimates, it is very 646 difficult to quantitatively describe the role of the ocean carbon cycle in determining the  $\Delta^{14}$ C and CO<sub>2</sub> levels in the 647 glacial atmosphere.

648

#### 649 **3.4 Reconstructing the** <sup>14</sup>C production rate by deconvolving the atmospheric $\Delta^{14}$ C record

650

651 The unresolved discrepancy between reconstructed and model-simulated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  raises the question how the  $^{14}C$ 652 production rate would have had to evolve to be consistent with the IntCal13 calibration curve or the new Hulu Cave 653  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  dataset. This question is addressed by deconvolving the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  reconstruction over the last 50 kyr, using the 654 Bern3D carbon cycle model forced with reconstructed histories of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> (see Eq. [2]). The carbon cycle 655 scenarios described in Table 1, with the exception of MOD, are used in order to provide an estimate of the uncertainty 656 associated with the model's glacial ocean carbon cycle. We note that the carbon cycle scenarios are not designed to 657 capture the specific features of the last glacial termination, and therefore the results of the deconvolution over this 658 time period must be considered very preliminary (and regarded as tentative). A detailed analysis of the Holocene <sup>14</sup>C 659 production rate is available in the literature (Roth and Joos, 2013). Finally, we consider the uncertainties associated 660 with the older portion of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record by deconvolving both the IntCal13 and Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  records. Hulu 661 Cave data overlap with IntCall3 between ~10.6 and 33.3 kyr BP (Cheng et al., 2018), as expected from the fact that IntCal13 between 10.6 and 26.8 kyr BP is based in part on Hulu Cave stalagmite H82 (Southon et al., 2012), whereas
there are substantial offsets before ~30 kyr BP.

664

665 Fig. 10 shows the new, model-based reconstruction of past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production compared with 666 available measurement-based reconstructions. Before the onset of the Laschamp excursion at ~42 kyr BP, production 667 rates as inferred from the Hulu Cave record are near modern levels, whereas those obtained from the IntCal13 record 668 are somewhat higher than modern. As expected, peak production occurs during the Laschamp event (~42 to 40 kyr 669 BP), with the Hulu Cave dataset yielding the largest amplitude (factor of ~2 greater than modern). The IntCal13 record 670 predicts a smaller amplitude of ~1.6 times the modern value. Both  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  records predict production minima at ~37 671 kyr BP (~7 percent higher than modern) and ~32 kyr BP (~5 percent higher than modern), interrupted by a prominent 672 peak (factors of  $\sim 1.5$  and  $\sim 1.4$ , respectively) during the Mono Lake geomagnetic excursion ( $\sim 34$  kyr BP), though the 673 details of the timing and structure differ between the two records. Between 32 and 22 kyr BP, model-based estimates 674 of the  ${}^{14}$ C production rate are ~1.3 times the modern value, which then decrease to around modern levels by HS1 (~18 675 kyr BP).

676

677 Model-based estimates of <sup>14</sup>C production during the last glacial are typically higher than paleointensity-based 678 and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based ones, as expected from Sect. 3.2. Between 32 and 22 kyr BP, the deconvolutions of the 679 IntCal13 and Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}$ Catm records give estimates that are about 17.5 percent higher than the reconstructions. It 680 is important to note that the differences between the reconstructions based on proxy data (i.e., paleointensity data and 681 ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes) are as large as the differences between our deconvolution results and the reconstructions (see 682 Table 2). As shown in Fig. 11, it is extremely difficult to reconcile the discrepancies between measurement- and 683 model-based <sup>14</sup>C production on the basis of carbon cycle changes alone. Nonetheless, the fact remains that two 684 independent estimates of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate (i.e., estimates inferred from paleointensity data and from ice-core 685 <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes) show systematically lower rates than those obtained by our model-based deconvolution of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , in 686 particular between 32 and 22 kyr BP. The differences between the production rate results shown in Fig. 10 and Fig. 687 11 and Table 2 stem from various uncertainties that are discussed next.

688

689 Uncertainties associated with the glacial ocean carbon cycle (Fig. 10, colored shading; Fig. 11, colored lines) 690 are systematic in our approach. The deconvolutions, e.g., of the Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record, under different model 691 scenarios are offset against one another, whereas the millennial-scale variability is maintained (see Fig. 11). We do 692 not attempt to resolve uncertainties associated with Dansgaard-Oeschger warming events and related Antarctic and 693 tropical climatic excursions in the model runs. Such climatic events may have influenced the atmospheric radiocarbon 694 budget, but their influence on long-term variations in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , and therefore inferred production rates, is presumably 695 limited. As may be expected, the lowest production rates (the lowest  $F_{as}$  values) are found in VENTx and the highest 696 in scenarios PAL and BIO, mirroring the high and low glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels achieved by these model scenarios as 697 discussed in Sect. 3.3. Note that there is a large uncertainty in the model-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate stemming from 698 uncertainties associated with the reconstruction of past changes in  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ , in particular the older portion of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ 

699 700

record.

701 A shortcoming of paleointensity-based reconstructions of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate is that they neglect changes 702 in the solar modulation of the cosmic radiation. The solar modulation potential, which describes the impact of the 703 solar magnetic field on isotope production, varied between 100 and 1200 MeV during the Holocene on decadal to 704 centennial time scales, with a median value of approximately 565 MeV (Roth and Joos, 2013). A halving of the solar 705 modulation potential (e.g., from 600 to 300 MeV) increases the <sup>14</sup>C production rate by about 25 percent for the modern 706 geomagnetic field strength (Roth and Joos, 2013; see their Fig. 13). This sensitivity remains similar when changes in 707 the strength of the geomagnetic field are limited as during the last ~35 kyr (Muscheler and Heikkilä, 2011). A shift to 708 lower solar modulation potential could have materialized if the sun spent on average more time in the postulated 709 "Grand Minimum" mode (Usoskin et al., 2014) during the last glacial than during the Holocene. The sensitivity of 710 isotope production to variations in solar modulation potential becomes large during the Laschamp event when the 711 intensity of the geomagnetic field was close to zero and changes in the solar modulation of the cosmic ray flux may 712 have a discernible impact on the high  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels found over this period. A reduction of the solar modulation 713 potential from 600 to 0 MeV would double <sup>14</sup>C production during times of zero geomagnetic field strength (Masarik 714 and Beer, 2009). However, it is likely that changes in the solar modulation potential were insufficient to explain the 715 discrepancy between paleointensity-based production rate estimates and the results of our deconvolution, in particular 716 for the post-Laschamp period and for the reconstruction by Channell et al. (2018). Uncertainties associated with the 717 paleointensity-based reconstructions stem also from uncertainties in estimating the age-scales of the marine sediments 718 and the geomagnetic field data.

719

720 The ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based reconstruction of past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production reflects, by definition, the combined 721 influence of changes in the solar and geomagnetic modulation of the cosmic ray flux reaching the Earth. This method, 722 therefore, avoids a fundamental shortcoming of reconstructions based on geomagnetic field data. The assumption is 723 that the <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>36</sup>Cl deposited on polar ice and measured in ice cores scales with the amount of cosmogenic isotopes 724 in the atmosphere. A difficulty is to extrapolate measurements from a single or a few locations to the global 725 atmosphere. Changes in climate influence atmospheric transport and deposition of <sup>10</sup>Be as well as the snow 726 accumulation rate, which affect the ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be concentration (Elsässer et al., 2015). Furthermore, the sensitivity of 727 <sup>10</sup>Be in polar ice versus the sensitivity of total production to magnetic field variations, or "polar bias", is a point of 728 debate, but atmospheric transport models (Heikkilae et al., 2009; Field et al., 2006) and data analyses (Bard et al., 729 1997; Adolphi and Muscheler, 2016; Adolphi et al., 2018) reach different conclusions about its existence and 730 magnitude. If a polar bias was present, it would lead to an underestimation of the geomagnetic modulation of the ice-731 core <sup>10</sup>Be flux, and therefore variations in the <sup>10</sup>Be-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate would also be underestimated. However, 732 the mismatch of up to ~544 to 558 permil between reconstructed and modelled <sup>10</sup>Be-based  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  during the last 733 glacial (see Fig. 7c) appears to be much too large to be reconciled by considering uncertainties in the polar bias alone.

- Furthermore, this mismatch with reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is qualitatively similar when using paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production rates that do not suffer from a polar bias (Fig. 7c).
- 736

Given the uncertainties associated with the proxy records, it may not be surprising that estimates of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate for the last 50 kyr, as obtained by three fundamentally different methods (geomagnetic field data from marine sediments, <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>36</sup>Cl measurements in polar ice cores, and model-based deconvolution of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ ), disagree with one another, typically by order 10 percent and sometimes by up to 100 percent. At the same time, it is intriguing that two independent estimates of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate (i.e., estimates inferred from paleointensity and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be data) give values that are systematically lower than what is required to match the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  reconstruction.

743

#### 744 4 Summary and conclusions

745

746 It is generally assumed that  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is controlled by abiotic processes such as atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C production, air-sea gas 747 exchange, and ocean circulation and mixing. Here, results from sensitivity experiments with the Bern3D earth system 748 model of intermediate complexity suggest that  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  is potentially quite sensitive to the interaction with the ocean 749 sediments on multimillennial time scales. This rather surprising result is due to the coupling of ocean circulation and 750 the sedimentation of biogenic material on the sea floor via the biological carbon pump, which has important 751 implications for the ocean carbon inventory. If the model's ocean carbon cycle is sufficiently perturbed, e.g., by 752 changing the inputs or parameters controlling ocean circulation and/or gas exchange, the imbalance between 753 weathering and sedimentation has a significant impact on the total oceanic amount of carbon. On time scales of tens 754 of thousands of years this slow change in the ocean carbon inventory influences the partitioning of <sup>14</sup>C/C between the 755 ocean and atmosphere, and thus also oceanic  $\Delta^{14}C$  and  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . This is important information for long-term climate 756 studies and paleoclimate modelling efforts concerning  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ . Note that the representation of terrestrial weathering 757 and sea floor sedimentation in the Bern3D is necessarily simplified compared to reality. Nonetheless, a change in the 758 ocean carbon inventory linked with the weathering/sedimentation balance should be discussed as one of the potentially 759 important factors affecting  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  during the last glacial period.

760

761 The reason for the high  $\Delta^{14}$ C values exhibited by the glacial atmosphere is still not clear. In order to 762 investigate potential mechanisms governing glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels, the Bern3D model is again used as a tool. Results 763 of model simulations forced only by production changes point out that none of the available reconstructions of the <sup>14</sup>C 764 production rate can explain the full amplitude of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  change during the last glacial. In order to test the sensitivity 765 of the model results with respect to the ocean carbon cycle state, various model parameters, i.e., different sets of 766 physical and biogeochemical parameters, were "tuned" to match the glacial CO<sub>2</sub> level. From this, we find that  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$ 767 is most sensitive to changes in physical model parameters, in particular those controlling ocean circulation and gas 768 exchange. In order to achieve an  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  value close to the glacial level, the gas transfer velocity in the polar regions 769 had to be reduced by 100 percent. If interpreted as being due to a greater extent of permanent sea ice cover, a reduction 770 in polar air-sea exchange efficiency is a possible explanation for high glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  levels. Although this hypothesis

is compelling, such a scenario is not supported by the proxy records of Antarctic sea ice cover (Gersonde et al., 2005; Allen et al., 2011) and the  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  ratio of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (Eggleston et al., 2016).

773

774 Atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C that is modelled at any point in time reflects <sup>14</sup>C production at that point, as well as the 775 legacy of past production and carbon cycle changes. The question arises as to whether our conclusions are affected by 776 unaccounted legacy effects, e.g., linked to the preindustrial spin-up simulation or model-diagnosed production rates. 777 Transient simulations forced by reconstructed changes in <sup>14</sup>C production (Sect. 3.2 and 3.3) are initialized at 70 kyr 778 BP, but their interpretation is restricted to the last 50,000 years of the integration to minimize legacy effects from 779 model spin-up. Available reconstructions of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate in relative units (Sect. 2.5) are applied as a scale 780 factor to the preindustrial steady-state absolute value, which is diagnosed by running the Bern3D model to equilibrium 781 under preindustrial boundary conditions. This approach represents an approximation and equilibrium conditions do 782 not fully apply. Indeed, there is a mismatch between reconstructed and modelled  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  at the preindustrial (see Fig. 783 8a). This mismatch is on the order of a few percent or less and adjusting the base level of production accordingly 784 would not remove the large mismatch between reconstructed and modelled  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  during the last glacial. In addition, 785 the uncertainty in the absolute value of the preindustrial production rate is on the order of 15%, primarily due to the 786 uncertainties in the preindustrial ocean radiocarbon inventory (see Roth and Joos, 2013, Sect. 3.2). This potential 787 systematic bias, however, does not affect our conclusions as we consider normalized production rate changes (see Fig. 788 7, 10, and 11).

789

790 Before model-simulated  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  can be taken seriously, it must be demonstrated that the reconstruction of 791 past changes in <sup>14</sup>C production is reliable. There is, however, a substantial amount of scatter in the paleointensity-792 based and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based estimates of <sup>14</sup>C production. Here we adopt an alternative approach to estimating the 793 <sup>14</sup>C production rate, which would indeed benefit from further constraints and lines of supporting evidence. Our 794 deconvolution-based approach assumes that the <sup>14</sup>C production rate can be derived from an atmospheric radiocarbon 795 budget, constructed using a prognostic carbon cycle model combined with the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record. Here, non-equilibrium 796 effects are fully accounted for by transient simulations where  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  and CO<sub>2</sub> are prescribed following their 797 reconstructed histories (Sect. 3.4). Yet, these simulations indicate that the discrepancy between measurement- and 798 model-based estimates of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate remains for the last glacial (Fig. 10b). This would suggest that 799 unaccounted legacy effects do not significantly affect our conclusions. Our model results imply that the glacial <sup>14</sup>C 800 production rate as inferred from paleointensity data and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes may be underestimated by about 15 801 percent between 32 and 22 kyr BP, a time interval which appears to be an important piece of the glacial-interglacial 802  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  puzzle. Note that our model-based estimates are associated with uncertainties arising from the reconstruction 803 of the older portion of the  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  record and from the model simulation of the glacial ocean carbon cycle (e.g., 804 uncertainties in the glacial ocean circulation and air-sea CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes). An improved understanding of the role of <sup>14</sup>C 805 production in past changes of  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  would open up the possibility of attributing model deficiencies to real changes 806 in the ocean carbon cycle, but there is as yet no emerging single record of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate.

808 Progress in several different areas may help to resolve the glacial-interglacial radiocarbon problem. 809 Additional records of glacial  $\Delta^{14}C_{atm}$  would help refine the older portion of the IntCal  $\Delta^{14}C$  record. Cosmogenic isotope 810 production records may be improved, e.g., by refining estimates of ice accumulation, by developing a better 811 understanding of <sup>10</sup>Be transport and deposition during the glacial, by recovering additional long and continuous 812 records from Antarctic ice cores and including marine <sup>10</sup>Be records, and by obtaining additional geomagnetic field 813 data. An expanded spatiotemporal observational coverage of  $\Delta^{14}$ C of DIC in the surface and deep ocean would help 814 narrow the time scales of surface-to-deep transport and air-sea equilibration of  $\Delta^{14}$ C, carbon and nutrients, and thereby 815 guide model-based analyses. Models should become more sophisticated and detailed in order to reproduce 816 successfully the glacial-interglacial changes in carbon and radiocarbon, by including exchange with sediments and the 817 lithosphere and by better representing coastal processes, and by representing a wide variety of paleo proxies such as 818  $\delta^{13}$ C, Nd isotopes, carbonate ion concentration, lysocline evolution, and paleo-productivity proxies in a 3-D dynamic 819 context for model evaluation. What is also missing are methods to quantify how the ocean carbon inventory, which 820 co-determines the <sup>14</sup>C/C ratio and thus the  $\Delta^{14}$ C values in the ocean and atmosphere, has changed over the last 50,000 821 years. Ultimately, an improved knowledge of <sup>14</sup>C production during the last glacial, as well as more robust constraints 822 on the prevailing climate conditions (e.g., ocean circulation, sea ice cover, and wind speed), are necessary to elucidate 823 the processes permitting mysteriously high  $\Delta^{14}$ C levels in the glacial atmosphere.

- 824
- 825
- 826

#### **Appendix A: Description of the Bern3D model**

827 The physical core of the Bern3D model is based on the 3-D rigid-lid ocean model of Edwards et al. (1998) as updated 828 by Edwards and Marsh (2005). The forcing fields for the model integration are monthly mean wind stress data taken 829 from NCEP/NCAR (Kalnay et al., 1996). Diapycnal mixing is parameterized with a uniform vertical diffusivity  $K_V$  of 830  $2 \ge 10^{-5}$  m s<sup>-1</sup>. The parameterization of eddy-induced transport is separated from that of isopycnal mixing, using the 831 Gent-McWilliams skew flux (Griffies, 1998). Running at the same temporal and horizontal resolution, the one-layer 832 energy-moisture balance atmosphere model performs an analysis of the energy budget of the Earth by involving solar 833 radiation, infrared fluxes, evaporation and precipitation, and sensible and latent heat. The zonally averaged surface 834 albedo climatology is taken from Kukla and Robinson (1980). Transport of moisture is performed by diffusion and 835 advection and heat by eddy diffusion.

836

837 The Bern3D ocean carbon cycle model is based on the Ocean Carbon-Cycle Model Intercomparison Project 838 (OCMIP-2) protocols. Air-sea gas exchange is parameterized using the standard gas transfer formulation adopted for 839 OCMIP-2, except that the gas transfer velocity  $k_w$  parameterization is a linear function of wind speed (Krakauer et 840 al., 2006) to which we have added a scale factor of 0.81 to match the observed global ocean inventory of bomb  $^{14}$ C 841 (Müller et al., 2008). It is assumed that CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> are well-mixed in the atmosphere. Surface boundary conditions 842 also include a virtual-flux term for biogeochemical tracers (e.g., DIC and Alk) to account for their dilution or 843 concentration due to implicit freshwater fluxes. Following OCMIP-2 biotic protocol, new production is partitioned 844 into particulate and dissolved organic matter. Modifications from the original OCMIP-2 biotic protocol include the

5 prognostic formulation of new/export production as a function of light, temperature, and limiting nutrient

- 846 concentrations, where the nutrient uptake follows Michaelis-Menten kinetics. The production of biogenic CaCO<sub>3</sub> and
  - 847 opal is computed on the basis of the modelled particulate organic carbon (POC) production and availability of silicate,
  - 848 with a maximum possible fraction of CaCO<sub>3</sub> material that can be produced. This threshold value is represented by the
  - 849 CaCO<sub>3</sub>-to-POC export ratio. In the preindustrial control run, the global mean export ratio *rr* is 0.082.
  - 850

851 Biogenic particles that have been produced in the 75-m production zone are redistributed over the water 852 column in order to parameterize the downward particle flux through the water column. A power-law model referred 853 to as the Martin curve is used to describe the vertical POC flux profile, whereas both CaCO<sub>3</sub> and opal export are 854 redistributed over the water column with an exponential curve. POC is remineralized instantaneously back to dissolved 855 form according to Redfield stoichiometry and with a 250-m length scale  $l_{POC}$  (i.e., in 250 m, the POC flux declines 856 by  $1 - 1/e \approx 63$  percent). Likewise, CaCO<sub>3</sub> and opal are dissolved within one time step, with *e*-folding depths of 857 5066 and 10,000 m, respectively. Biogenic particles reaching the model's sea floor form the upper boundary condition 858 of the 10-layer sediment model after Heinze et al. (1999) and Gehlen et al. (2006). The sediment model includes four 859 solid sediment components (POC, CaCO<sub>3</sub>, opal, and clay) and is based on the sediment advection and accumulation 860 scheme as in the work of Archer et al. (1993). The rate of POC remineralization in the sediments is primarily 861 determined by the pore water concentration of oxygen, whereas the mineral dissolution rate is governed by the 862 saturation state of sediment pore waters with respect to CaCO<sub>3</sub> or opal. Weathering (dissolution) of carbonate and 863 silicate rocks on land, phosphorous release by chemical weathering of rocks, and volcanic outgassing of CO<sub>2</sub> are 864 simulated as constant inputs of DIC, Alk (as bicarbonate ion, HCO3<sup>-</sup>), phosphate (P), and silicate (Si) to the ocean at 865 rates intended to balance their removal from the ocean by sedimentation on the sea floor. These weathering inputs are 866 added as a constant increment to each surface ocean grid cell along the coastlines. The preindustrial steady state of 867 the model is used to diagnose the weathering rates that are held fixed and constant throughout the simulations. Note 868 that the preindustrial spin-up results in steady-state values for weathering-derived inputs of DIC, Alk, P, and Si of 869 0.46 Gt C per year, 34.37 Tmol HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> per year, 0.17 Tmol P per year, and 6.67 Tmol Si per year, respectively. These 870 values are within the range of observational estimates (see, e.g., Jeltsch-Thömmes et al., 2019). Additional details 871 concerning the sediment model are provided in Tschumi et al. (2011), while the appendix of Jeltsch-Thömmes et al. 872 (2019) gives a detailed description of the atmosphere-ocean-sediment spin-up.

873

The exchange of any isotopic perturbation between the atmosphere and the terrestrial biosphere is simulated by use of the four-box model of Siegenthaler and Oeschger (1987). The terrestrial biosphere is represented by four well-mixed compartments (ground vegetation plus leaves, wood, detritus, and soils), with a fixed total carbon inventory of 2220 Gt C. Net primary production is balanced by respiration of detritus and soils, and is set to 60 Gt C per year.

880	<b>Data availability.</b> Model-simulated atmospheric $\Delta^{14}$ C presented in Fig. 7b and 8a, and model-based $^{14}$ C production
881	rates shown in Fig. 10a, are included in the Supplement. Other data generated or analyzed during this study can be
882	made available upon request to the corresponding author (A.D.).
883	
884	Author contribution. This study was designed by F.J. and A.D. with input from F.A. A.D. developed and
885	performed the model simulations. F.A. provided production data. A.D. wrote the manuscript with contributions from
886	the co-authors.
887	
888	Competing interests. The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.
889	
890	Acknowledgements. This work was made possible by the Swiss National Science Foundation (#200020_172476)
891	and by the UniBE international 2021 fellowship program of the U. Bern. F.A. was supported by the Swedish
892	Research Council (Vetenskaprådet DNR: 2016-00218).
893	
894	References
895	Neite entes
896	Adolphi F and Muscheler R · Synchronizing the Greenland ice core and radiocarbon timescales over the Holocene
897	- Bayesian wiggle-matching of cosmogenic radionuclide records. Climate of the Past 12, 15–30, 2016
898	Adolnhi F. Muscheler, R. Svensson, A. Aldahan, A. Possnert, G. Beer, J. Thiéhlemont, R. Persistent link
899	between solar activity and Greenland climate during the Last Glacial Maximum Nature Geoscience 7
900	662–666. 2014.
901	Adolphi, F., Ramsey, C. B., Erhardt, T., Edwards, R. L., Cheng, H., Turney, C. S., Muscheler, R.: Connecting
902	the Greenland ice-core and U/Th timescales via cosmogenic radionuclides: testing the synchroneity of
903	Dansgaard–Oeschger events, Climate of the Past, 14, 1755–1781, 2018.
904	Allen, C. S., Pike, J., and Pudsey, C. J.: Last glacial-interglacial sea-ice cover in the SW Atlantic and its potential
905	role in global deglaciation, Quaternary Science Reviews, 30, 2446–2458, 2011.
906	Archer, D., and Maier-Reimer, E.: Effect of deep-sea sedimentary calcite preservation on atmospheric CO <sub>2</sub>
907	concentration, Nature, 367, 260–263, 1994.
908	Archer, D., Lyle, M., Rodgers, K., and Froelich, P.: What controls opal preservation in tropical deep-sea sediments?,
909	Paleoceanography, 8, 7–21, 1993.
910	Archer, D., Winguth, A., Lea, D., and Mahowald, N.: What caused the glacial/interglacial atmospheric pCO <sub>2</sub>
911	cycles?, Reviews of Geophysics, 38, 159–189, 2000.
912	Audi, G., Bersillon, O., Blachot, J., and Wapstra, A. H.: The Nubase evaluation of nuclear and decay properties,
913	Nuclear Physics A, 729, 3–128, 2003.
914	Bard, E., Raisbeck, G. M., Yiou, F., and Jouzel, J.: Solar modulation of cosmogenic nuclide production over the last
915	millennium: comparison between <sup>14</sup> C and <sup>10</sup> Be records, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 150, 453–462,
916	1997.

- 917 Baumgartner, S., Beer, J., Wagner, G., Kubik, P., Suter, M., Raisbeck, G. M., and Yiou, F.: <sup>10</sup>Be and dust, Nuclear
- 918Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section B: Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms,919123, 296–301, 1997.
- Baumgartner, S., Beer, J., Masarik, J., Wagner, G., Meynadier, L., and Synal, H.-A.: Geomagnetic Modulation of
   the <sup>36</sup>Cl Flux in the GRIP Ice Core, Greenland, Science, 279, 1330–1332, 1998.
- Bé, M.-M., Chisté, V., Dulieu, C., Mougeot, X., Chechev, V., Kondev, F., . . . Wang, B.: Table of Radionuclides
  (Comments on evaluations), Monographie BIPM-5, 7, 2013.
- Berger, A. L.: Long-term variations of daily insolation and Quaternary climatic changes, Journal of the Atmospheric
   Sciences, 35, 2362–2367, 1978.
- Broecker, W., and Barker, S.: A 190‰ drop in atmosphere's Δ<sup>14</sup>C during the "Mystery Interval" (17.5 to 14.5 kyr),
   Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 256, 90–99, 2007.
- 928 Broecker, W. S., and Peng, T.-H.: Gas exchange rates between air and sea, Tellus, 26, 21–35, 1974.
- Bronk Ramsey, C., Staff, R. A., Bryant, C. L., Brock, F., Kitagawa, H., van der Plicht, J., Schlolaut, G., Marshall,
  M. H., Brauer, A., Lamb, H. F., Payne, R. L., Tarasov, P. E., Haraguchi, T., Gotanda, K., Yonenobu, H.,
  Yokoyama, Y., Tada, R., and Nakagawa, T.: A complete terrestrial radiocarbon record for 11.2 to 52.8 kyr
- 932 B.P., Science, 338, 370–374, 2012.
- Brovkin, V., Ganopolski, A., Archer, D., and Munhoven, G.: Glacial CO<sub>2</sub> cycle as a succession of key physical and
  biogeochemical processes, Climate of the Past, 8, 251–264, 2012.
- Butzin, M., Köhler, P., and Lohmann, G.: Marine radiocarbon reservoir age simulations for the past 50,000 years,
  Geophysical Research Letters, 44, 8473–8480, 2017.
- Channell, J. E., Hodell, D. A., Crowhurst, S. J., Skinner, L. C., and Muscheler, R.: Relative paleointensity (RPI) in
  the latest Pleistocene (10-45 ka) and implications for deglacial atmospheric radiocarbon, Quaternary
  Science Reviews, 191, 57–72, 2018.
- Cheng, H., Edwards, R. L., Southon, J., Matsumoto, K., Feinberg, J. M., Sinha, A., . . . Ning, Y.: Atmospheric
   <sup>14</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C changes during the last glacial period from Hulu Cave, Science, 362, 1293–1297, 2018.
- Delaygue, G., Stocker, T. F., Joos, F., and Plattner, G.-K.: Simulation of atmospheric radiocarbon during abrupt
   oceanic circulation changes: trying to reconcile models and reconstructions, Quaternary Science Reviews,
   22, 1647–1658, 2003.
- Edwards, N. R., and Marsh, R.: Uncertainties due to transport-parameter sensitivity in an efficient 3-D oceanclimate model, Climate Dynamics, 24, 415–433, 2005.
- Edwards, N. R., Willmott, A. J., and Killworth, P. D.: On the Role of Topography and Wind Stress on the Stability
  of the Thermohaline Circulation, Journal of Physical Oceanography, 28, 756–778, 1998.
- Eggleston, S., Schmitt, J., Bereiter, B., Schneider, R., and Fischer, H.: Evolution of the stable carbon isotope
  composition of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> over the last glacial cycle, Paleoceanography, 31, 434–452, 2016.
- Elsässer, C., Wagenbach, D., Levin, I., Stanzick, A., Christl, M., Wallner, A., . . . Dibb, J.: Simulating ice core <sup>10</sup>Be
  on the glacial-interglacial timescale, Climate of the Past, 11, 115–133, 2015.

- Enting, I. G.: On the use of smoothing splines to filter CO<sub>2</sub> data, Journal of Geophysical Research, 92, 10,977–
  10,984, 1987.
- Field, C. V., Schmidt, G. A., Koch, D., and Salyk, C.: Modeling production and climate-related impacts on <sup>10</sup>Be
  concentration in ice cores, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 111,
  https://doi.org/10.1029/2005JD006410, 2006.
- Finkel, R. C., and Nishiizumi, K.: Beryllium 10 concentrations in the Greenland Ice Sheet Project 2 ice core from 340 ka, Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 102, 26699–26706, 1997.
- Fischer, H., Schmitt, J., Lüthi, D., Stocker, T. F., Tschumi, T., Parekh, P., ... Wolff, E.: The role of Southern Ocean
   processes in orbital and millennial CO<sub>2</sub> variations A synthesis, Quaternary Science Reviews, 29, 193–
   205, 2010.
- Galbraith, E. D., and Skinner, L. C.: The Biological Pump During the Last Glacial Maximum, Annual Review of
   Marine Science, 12, 559–586, 2020.
- Ganopolski, A., and Brovkin, V.: Simulation of climate, ice sheets and CO<sub>2</sub> evolution during the last four glacial
  cycles with an Earth system model of intermediate complexity, Climate of the Past, 13, 1695–1716, 2017.
- Gehlen, M., Bopp, L. E., Aumont, O., Heinze, C., and Ragueneau, O.: Reconciling surface ocean productivity,
   export fluxes and sediment composition in a global biogeochemical ocean model, Biogeosciences, 3, 521–
   537, 2006.
- Gersonde, R., Crosta, X., Abelmann, A., and Armand, L.: Sea-surface temperature and sea ice distribution of the
   Southern Ocean at the EPILOG Last Glacial Maximum—a circum-Antarctic view based on siliceous
   microfossil records, Quaternary Science Reviews, 24, 869–896, 2005.
- Gkinis, V., Simonsen, S. B., Buchardt, S. L., White, J. W., and Vinther, B. M.: Water isotope diffusion rates from
  the NorthGRIP ice core for the last 16,000 years Glaciological and paleoclimatic implications, Earth and
  Planetary Science Letters, 405, 132–141, 2014.
- 976 Griffies, S. M.: The Gent-McWilliams Skew Flux, Journal of Physical Oceanography, 28, 831–841, 1998.
- Hain, M. P., Sigman, D. M., and Haug, G. H.: Distinct roles of the Southern Ocean and North Atlantic in the
  deglacial atmospheric radiocarbon decline, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 394, 198–208, 2014.
- Heikkilä, U., Beer, J., and Feichter, J.: Meridional transport and deposition of atmospheric <sup>10</sup>Be, Atmospheric
  Chemistry and Physics, 9, 515–527, 2009.
- Heikkilä, U., Phipps, S. J., and Smith, A. M.: <sup>10</sup>Be in late deglacial climate simulated by ECHAM5-HAM Part 1:
  Climatological influences on <sup>10</sup>Be deposition, Climate of the Past, 9, 2641–2649, 2013.
- Heinze, C., Maier-Reimer, E., Winguth, A. M., and Archer, D.: A global oceanic sediment model for long-term
  climate studies, Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 13, 221–250, 1999.
- Herbst, K., Muscheler, R., and Heber, B.: The new local interstellar spectra and their influence on the production
   rates of the cosmogenic radionuclides <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>14</sup>C, Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics, 122,
   23–34, 2017.
- Hoff, U., Rasmussen, T. L., Stein, R., Ezat, M. M., and Fahl, K.: Sea ice and millennial-scale climate variability in
  the Nordic seas 90 kyr ago to present, Nature Communications, 7, doi:10.1038/ncomms12247, 2016.

- Hughen, K., Lehman, S., Southon, J., Overpeck, J., Marchal, O., Herring, C., and Turnbull, J.: <sup>14</sup>C Activity and
  Global Carbon Cycle Changes over the Past 50,000 Years, Science, 303, 202–207, 2004.
- Huiskamp, W. N., and Meissner, K. J.: Oceanic carbon and water masses during the Mystery Interval: A model-data
   comparison study, Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 27, https://doi.org/10.1029/2012PA002368,
   2012.
- Jeltsch-Thömmes, A., Battaglia, G., Cartapanis, O., Jaccard, S. L., and Joos, F.: Low terrestrial carbon storage at the
   Last Glacial Maximum: constraints from multi-proxy data, Climate of the Past, 15, 849–879, 2019.
- Köhler, P., Muscheler, R., and Fischer, H.: A model-based interpretation of low-frequency changes in the carbon
   cycle during the last 120,000 years and its implications for the reconstruction of atmospheric Δ<sup>14</sup>C,
   Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems, 7, 1–22, 2006.
- 1000 Köhler, P., Nehrbass-Ahles, C., Schmitt, J., Stocker, T. F., and Fischer, H.: A 156 kyr smoothed history of the
  1001 atmospheric greenhouse gases CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O and their radiative forcing, Earth System Science Data,
  1002 9, 363–387, 2017.
- Kalnay, E., Kanamitsu, M., Kistler, R., Collins, W., Deaven, D., Gandin, L., . . . Joseph, D.: The NCEP/NCAR 40 Year Reanalysis Project, Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society, 77, 437–471, 1996.
- Key, R. M., Kozyr, A., Sabine, C. L., Lee, K., Wanninkhof, R., Bullister, J. L., . . . Peng, T.-H.: A global ocean
  carbon climatology: Results from Global Data Analysis Project (GLODAP), Global Biogeochemical
  Cycles, 18, https://doi.org/10.1029/2004GB002247, 2004.
- Kovaltsov, G. A., and Usoskin, I. G.: A new 3D numerical model of cosmogenic nuclide <sup>10</sup>Be production in the
   atmosphere, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 291, 182–188, 2010.
- 1010 Krakauer, N. Y., Randerson, J. T., Primeau, F. W., Gruber, N., and Menemenlis, D.: Carbon isotope evidence for the
  1011 latitudinal distribution and wind speed dependence of the air-sea gas transfer velocity, Tellus B: Chemical
  1012 and Physical Meteorology, 58, 390–417, 2006.
- 1013 Kukla, G., and Robinson, D.: Annual Cycle of Surface Albedo, Monthly Weather Review, 108, 56–68, 1980.
- Laj, C., Kissel, C., Mazaud, A., Channell, J. E., and Beer, J.: North Atlantic palaeointensity stack since 75ka
   (NAPIS-75) and the duration of the Laschamp event, Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of
   London. Series A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences, 358, 1009–1025, 2000.
- 1017Laj, C., Kissel, C., Mazaud, A., Michel, E., Muscheler, R., and Beer, J.: Geomagnetic field intensity, North Atlantic1018Deep Water circulation and atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C during the last 50 kyr, Earth and Planetary Science Letters,1019200, 177-190, 2002.
- Laj, C., Kissel, C., and Beer, J.: High resolution global paleointensity stack since 75 kyr (GLOPIS-75) calibrated to
   absolute values, Timescales of the Paleomagnetic Field, 145, 255–265, 2004.
- Laj, C., Guillou, H., and Kissel, C.: Dynamics of the earth magnetic field in the 10-75 kyr period comprising the
   Laschamp and Mono Lake excursions: New results from the French Chaîne des Puys in a global
   perspective, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 387, 184–197, 2014.
- Lisiecki, L. E., and Stern, J. V.: Regional and global benthic δ18O stacks for the last glacial cycle,
   Paleoceanography, 31, 1368–1394, 2016.

- Müller, J., and Stein, R.: High-resolution record of late glacial and deglacial sea ice changes in Fram Strait
   corroborates ice-ocean interactions during abrupt climate shifts, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 403,
   446–455, 2014.
- Müller, S. A., Joos, F., Edwards, N. R., and Stocker, T. F.: Water Mass Distribution and Ventilation Time Scales in
   a Cost-Efficient, Three-Dimensional Ocean Model, Journal of Climate, 19, 5479–5499, 2006.
- Müller, S. A., Joos, F., Plattner, G.-K., Edwards, N. R., and Stocker, T. F.: Modeled natural and excess radiocarbon:
   Sensitivities to the gas exchange formulation and ocean transport strength, Global Biogeochemical Cycles,
   22, https://doi.org/10.1029/2007GB003065, 2008.
- Marchal, O., Stocker, T. F., and Muscheler, R.: Atmospheric radiocarbon during the Younger Dryas: production,
   ventilation, or both?, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 185, 383–395, 2001.
- Mariotti, V., Paillard, D., Bopp, L., Roche, D. M., and Bouttes, N.: A coupled model for carbon and radiocarbon
  evolution during the last deglaciation, Geophysical Research Letters, 43, 1306–1313, 2016.
- Masarik, J., and Beer, J.: Simulation of particle fluxes and cosmogenic nuclide production in the Earth's atmosphere,
   Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 104, 12099–12111, 1999.
- Masarik, J., and Beer, J.: An updated simulation of particle fluxes and cosmogenic nuclide production in the Earth's
   atmosphere, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 114, https://doi.org/10.1029/2008JD010557,
   2009.
- Menviel, L., Joos, F., and Ritz, S. P.: Simulating atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, <sup>13</sup>C and the marine carbon cycle during the Last
   Glacial–Interglacial cycle: possible role for a deepening of the mean remineralization depth and an increase
   in the oceanic nutrient inventory, Quaternary Science Reviews, 56, 46–68, 2012.
- Muscheler, R., and Heikkilä, U.: Constraints on long-term changes in solar activity from the range of variability of
   cosmogenic radionuclide records, Astrophysics and Space Sciences Transactions, 7, 355–364, 2011.
- Muscheler, R., Beer, J., Wagner, G., Laj, C., Kissel, C., Raisbeck, G. M., . . . Kubike, P. W.: Changes in the carbon
   cycle during the last deglaciation as indicated by the comparison of <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>14</sup>C records, Earth and
   Planetary Science Letters, 219, 325–340, 2004.
- Muscheler, R., Adolphi, F., Herbst, K., and Nilsson, A.: The Revised Sunspot Record in Comparison to Cosmogenic
   Radionuclide-Based Solar Activity Reconstructions, Solar Physics, 291, 3025–3043, 2016.
- Nowaczyk, N. R., Arz, H. W., Frank, U., Kind, J., and Plessen, B.: Dynamics of the Laschamp geomagnetic
   excursion from Black Sea sediments, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 351-352, 54–69, 2012.
- 1056 Nowaczyk, N. R., Frank, U., Kind, J., and Arz, H. W.: A high-resolution paleointensity stack of the past 14 to 68 ka
   1057 from Black Sea sediments, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 384, 1–16, 2013.
- 1058 Orr, J. C., Najjar, R. G., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Bullister, J. L., Danabasoglu, G., . . . Yool, A.: Biogeochemical
   protocols and diagnostics for the CMIP6 Ocean Model Intercomparison Project (OMIP), Geoscientific
   1060 Model Development, 10, 2169–2199, 2017.

## Parekh, P., Joos, F., and Müller, S. A.: A modeling assessment of the interplay between aeolian iron fluxes and iron binding ligands in controlling carbon dioxide fluctuations during Antarctic warm events, Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 23, https://doi.org/10.1029/2007PA001531, 2008.

- 1064 Peltier, W. R.: Ice Age Paleotopography, Science, 265, 195–201, 1994.
- Poluianov, S. V., Kovaltsov, G. A., Mishev, A. L., and Usoskin, I. G.: Production of cosmogenic isotopes <sup>7</sup>Be, <sup>10</sup>Be,
   <sup>14</sup>C, <sup>22</sup>Na, and <sup>36</sup>Cl in the atmosphere: Altitudinal profiles of yield functions, Journal of Geophysical
   Research: Atmospheres, 121, 8125–8136, 2016.
- Potgieter, M. S., Vos, E. E., Boezio, M., De Simone, N., Di Felice, V., and Formato, V.: Modulation of Galactic
  Protons in the Heliosphere During the Unusual Solar Minimum of 2006 to 2009, Solar Physics, 289, 391–
  406, 2014.
- Primeau, F.: Characterizing Transport between the Surface Mixed Layer and the Ocean Interior with a Forward and
   Adjoint Global Ocean Transport Model, Journal of Physical Oceanography, 35, 545–564, 2005.
- Raisbeck, G. M., Cauquoin, A., Jouzel, J., Landais, A., Petit, J.-R., Lipenkov, V. Y., . . . Yiou, F.: An improved
   north-south synchronization of ice core records around the 41 kyr <sup>10</sup>Be peak, Climate of the Past, 13, 217–
   229, 2017.
- 1076 Rasmussen, S. O., Abbott, P. M., Blunier, T., Bourne, A. J., Brook, E. J., Buchardt, S. L., . . . Winstrup, M.: A first
  1077 chronology for the North Greenland Eemian Ice Drilling (NEEM) ice core, Climate of the Past, 9, 2713–
  1078 2730, 2013.
- 1079 Reimer, P., Bard, E., Bayliss, A., Beck, J., Blackwell, P., Ramsey, C., . . . Van der Plicht, J.: IntCal13 and Marine13
  1080 Radiocarbon Age Calibration Curves 0-50,000 Years cal BP, Radiocarbon, 55, 1869–1887, 2013.
- 1081 Reimer, P., Austin, W.E.N., Bard, E., Bayliss, A., Blackwell, P. G., Ramsey, C. B., . . . Talamo, S.: The IntCal20
   1082 Northern Hemisphere radiocarbon age calibration curve (0-55 kcal BP), Radiocarbon, in press.
- 1083 Ritz, S. P., Stocker, T. F., and Joos, F.: A Coupled Dynamical Ocean–Energy Balance Atmosphere Model for
   1084 Paleoclimate Studies, Journal of Climate, 24, 349–375, 2011.
- Roth, R., and Joos, F.: A reconstruction of radiocarbon production and total solar irradiance from the Holocene <sup>14</sup>C
   and CO<sub>2</sub> records: implications of data and model uncertainties, Climate of the Past, 9, 1879–1909, 2013.
- Roth, R., Ritz, S. P., and Joos, F.: Burial-nutrient feedbacks amplify the sensitivity of atmospheric carbon dioxide to
   changes in organic matter remineralisation, Earth System Dynamics, 5, 321–343, 2014.
- Sarnthein, M., Schneider, B., and Grootes, P. M.: Peak glacial <sup>14</sup>C ventilation ages suggest major draw-down of
   carbon into the abyssal ocean, Climate of the Past, 9, 2595–2614, 2013.
- Siegenthaler, U., and Oeschger, H.: Biospheric CO<sub>2</sub> emissions during the past 200 years reconstructed by
   deconvolution of ice core data, Tellus, 39B, 140–154, 1987.
- Siegenthaler, U., Heimann, M., and Oeschger, H.: <sup>14</sup>C Variations Caused by Changes in the Global Carbon Cycle,
   Radiocarbon, 22, 177–191, 1980.
- Skinner, L. C., Fallon, S., Waelbroeck, C., Michel, E., and Barker, S.: Ventilation of the Deep Southern Ocean and
   Deglacial CO<sub>2</sub> Rise, Science, 328, 1147–1151, 2010.
- Skinner, L. C., Primeau, F., Freeman, E., de la Fuente, M., Goodwin, P. A., Gottschalk, J., ... Scrivner, A. E.:
  Radiocarbon constraints on the glacial ocean circulation and its impact on atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Nature
  Communications, 8, doi:10.1038/ncomms16010, 2017.

- Skinner, L. C., Muschitiello, F., and Scrivner, A. E.: Marine Reservoir Age Variability Over the Last Deglaciation:
   Implications for Marine Carbon Cycling and Prospects for Regional Radiocarbon Calibrations,
   Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 34, 1807–1815, 2019.
- Soulet, G., Skinner, L. C., Beaupré, S. R., and Galy, V.: A Note on Reporting of Reservoir <sup>14</sup>C Disequilibria and
   Age Offsets, Radiocarbon, 58, 205–211, 2016.
- Southon, J., Noronha, A. L., Cheng, H., Edwards, R. L., and Wang, Y.: A high-resolution record of atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C
  based on Hulu Cave speleothem H82, Quaternary Science Reviews, 33, 32–41, 2012.
- 1107 Stuiver, M., and Polach, H. A.: Discussion: Reporting of <sup>14</sup>C Data, Radiocarbon, 19, 355–363, 1977.
- Tschumi, T., Joos, F., and Parekh, P.: How important are Southern Hemisphere wind changes for low glacial carbon
   dioxide? A model study, Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 23,
   https://doi.org/10.1029/2008PA001592, 2008.
- 1111Tschumi, T., Joos, F., Gehlen, M., and Heinze, C.: Deep ocean ventilation, carbon isotopes, marine sedimentation1112and the deglacial CO2 rise, Climate of the Past, 7, 771–800, 2011.
- Usoskin, I. G., Hulot, G., Gallet, Y., Roth, R., Licht, A., Joos, F., . . . Khokhlov, A.: Evidence for distinct modes of
  solar activity, Astronomy & Astrophysics, 562, 1–4, 2014.
- Wagner, G., Beer, J., Masarik, J., Muscheler, R., Kubik, P. W., Mende, W., . . . Yiou, F.: Presence of the solar de
  Vries cycle (~205 years) during the last ice age, Geophysical Research Letters, 28, 303–306, 2001.
- Wallmann, K., Schneider, B., and Sarnthein, M.: Effects of eustatic sea-level change, ocean dynamics, and nutrient
  utilization on atmospheric pCO<sub>2</sub> and seawater composition over the last 130 000 years: a model study,
  Climate of the Past, 12, 339–375, 2016.
- Yiou, F., Raisbeck, G. M., Baumgartner, S., Beer, J., Hammer, C., Johnsen, S., . . . Yiou, P.: Beryllium 10 in the
  Greenland Ice Core Project ice core at Summit, Greenland, Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans, 102,
  26783–26794, 1997.

- Table 1. Summary of model scenarios considered in this study. Initial conditions refer to the boundary conditions used for the precursor spin-up simulation needed to initialize the transient simulation. These correspond either to preindustrial (PI) or last glacial conditions. The paleoclimate forcing fields, i.e., Orb-GHG-Ice, are reconstructed changes in orbital parameters (Berger, 1978), greenhouse gas radiative forcing based on reconstructed atmospheric greenhouse gas histories (Köhler et al., 2017), and varying ice sheet extent scaled using the global benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack of Lisiecki and Stern (2016). Numbers refer to the scale factor values applied to the tunable model parameters  $\tau$  (wind stress scale factor),  $K_V$  (vertical diffusivity),  $k_w$  (gas transfer velocity), rr (CaCO<sub>3</sub>-to-POC export ratio), and  $\ell_{POC}$ (POC remineralization length scale) at the last glacial maximum (LGM). These values were chosen in order to achieve an atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration close to the LGM level, and are varied over time using the global benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack. See Roth et al. (2014) for the Bern3D model parameter set. In all scenarios, the fully coupled model configuration, including the major global carbon reservoirs (atmosphere, terrestrial biosphere, ocean, and sediments),
- 1150 is used.

	Tunable parameters: scale factor at LGM						
Scenario	Initial conditions	Paleoclimate forcing	τ	K <sub>V</sub>	k <sub>w</sub>	rr	$\ell_{POC}$
MOD	PI	-	-	-	-	-	-
PAL	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	-	-	-	-	-
CIRC	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	0.4	0.4	-	-	-
VENT	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	0.4	0.4	0.4	-	-
VENTx	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	0.4	0.4	0.0	-	-
BIO	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	-	-	-	0.8	1.2
PHYS-BIO	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	0.7	0.7	0.7	0.7	-
PHYS-BIOx	Glacial	Orb-GHG-Ice	0.8	0.8	0.8	0.8	1.2

Table 2. Production rate estimates in relative units inferred from three fundamentally different reconstruction methods: geomagnetic field data from marine sediments, <sup>10</sup>Be and <sup>36</sup>Cl measurements in polar ice cores, and model-based deconvolution of atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C. Laj00, Laj04, Now13, and Chn18 refer to the paleointensity-based reconstructions of Laj et al. (2000), Laj et al. (2004), Nowaczyk et al. (2013), and Channell et al. (2018), respectively. Adp18 refers to the ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be-based reconstruction of Adolphi et al. (2018). Int13 and Hul18 refer to the model-based reconstructions from this study, using the IntCal13 calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2013) and the new Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}$ C dataset (Cheng et al., 2018). The bold numbers show the mean production rates during the last glacial (50 to 18

1169 kyr BP).

		Mean production rate (relative units)						
Time (kyr BP)	Laj00	Laj04	Now13	Chn18	Adp18	Int13	Hul18	
50 to 42	1.08	1.04	1.12	1.08	1.01	1.23	1.14	
42 to 37	1.57	1.56	1.71	1.36	1.44	1.45	1.67	
37 to 32	1.19	1.09	1.35	0.98	1.10	1.25	1.28	
32 to 22	1.22	1.15	1.29	0.92	0.99	1.31	1.31	
22 to 18	1.31	1.20	1.17	0.81	0.98	1.11	1.11	
50 to 18	1.25	1.18	1.31	1.01	1.08	1.28	1.29	



- 1188 Fig. 1. Comparison of various paleoclimate records for the last 54 kyr. (a) Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> from the data compilation
- 1189 of Köhler et al. (2017). The light red envelope shows the uncertainty (2 $\sigma$ ). (b) Atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C reconstructed from
- 1190 <sup>14</sup>C measurements on tree rings, plant macrofossils, speleothems, corals, and foraminifera. The light blue envelope
- 1191 shows the uncertainty  $(2\sigma)$  in the IntCal13 calibration curve (Reimer et al., 2013), whereas the Hulu Cave data (Cheng
- 1192 et al., 2018) are shown with error bars (1 $\sigma$ ). Hulu Cave data are consistent with IntCal13 between ~10.6 and 33.3 kyr
- 1193 BP. For both records  $\Delta^{14}$ C values were adjusted to the presently accepted value of the radiocarbon half-life (5700
- 1194 years). (c) <sup>14</sup>C production rate in relative units reconstructed from paleointensity data (Laj et al., 2000; Laj et al., 2004;
- 1195 Nowaczyk et al., 2013; Channell et al., 2018) and from polar ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes (Adolphi et al., 2018). The heavy
- 1196 dark gray line is the mean paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate. (d) Global benthic  $\delta^{18}$ O stack, a proxy for ice
- volume, from Lisiecki and Stern (2016). Three vertical light gray bars indicate the Laschamp excursion (~41 kyr BP),
- 1198 when the Earth's geomagnetic dipole field intensity was close to zero, the Mono Lake geomagnetic excursion ( $\sim$ 34
- 1199 kyr BP), and the last glacial termination (~18 to 11 kyr BP), respectively.



Fig. 2. Schematic diagram of the Bern3D carbon cycle model. The fully coupled model includes the major global
carbon reservoirs (atmosphere, terrestrial biosphere, ocean, and sediments) and the exchange fluxes between them.
Biogeochemical processes, namely, air-sea gas exchange, biological export production, and particle flux through the
water column, are parameterized by refined OCMIP-2 formulations. Details concerning the model are provided in
Sect. 2 and Appendix A.



Fig. 3. Steady-state distribution of  $\Delta^{14}$ C in the surface (< 100 m) and deep (> 1500 m) ocean for the preindustrial control run (right), compared to the distribution of  $\Delta^{14}$ C based on the Global Ocean Data Analysis Project (GLODAP).



1246	Fig. 4. Response o	f atmospheric $\Delta^{14}$	C to step changes in <sup>1</sup>	<sup>4</sup> C production	, followed by step	changes in the tunable mode	ł
------	--------------------	-----------------------------	-----------------------------------	---------------------------	--------------------	-----------------------------	---

- 1247 parameters of the ocean carbon cycle. (a)  $^{14}$ C production Q is increased at time 0 from 100 to 110 percent of its
- 1248 preindustrial value ("higher production" scenario). (b) Wind stress scale factor  $\tau$  and vertical diffusivity  $K_V$  are
- 1249 decreased at time 0 from 100 to 50 percent of their preindustrial values ("reduced deep ocean ventilation" scenario).
- 1250 (c) Gas transfer velocity  $k_w$  is decreased at time 0 from 100 to 0 percent of its preindustrial value at the north (> 60°N)
- 1251 and south (> 48°S) poles ("enhanced permanent sea ice cover" scenario). Four model configurations are considered.
- 1252 The dark turquoise line shows the model results using the atmosphere–ocean (OCN) configuration, the light turquoise
- 1253 line is the atmosphere–ocean–land (OCN-LND) configuration, the light brown line is the atmosphere–ocean–sediment
- 1254 (OCN-SED) configuration, and the dark brown line is the atmosphere–ocean–land–sediment (ALL) configuration.



- 1276 Fig. 5. Changes in carbon reservoir sizes and the sedimentation flux for the scenarios "reduced deep ocean ventilation"
- 1277 (left) and "enhanced permanent sea ice cover" (right). The change in atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C is also shown (a, b). Anomalies
- 1278 are expressed here as differences relative to the preindustrial steady state (in percent). Turquoise lines show the model
- 1279 results using configuration OCN-LND (without sediments) and brown lines are configuration ALL (with sediments).
- 1280 The y-axis on the left-hand side of each panel refers to changes in the <sup>14</sup>C inventory, whereas the y-axis on the right-
- 1281 hand side of each panel refers to changes in the carbon inventory or flux.



1307

Fig. 6. Change in  $\Delta^{14}$ C for the atmosphere, surface ocean, deep ocean, and global ocean for the scenarios "reduced deep ocean ventilation" (left) and "enhanced permanent sea ice cover" (right). Anomalies are expressed here as differences relative to the preindustrial steady state (in permil). Turquoise lines show the model results using configuration OCN-LND (without sediments) and brown lines are configuration ALL (with sediments).





Fig. 7. Component of atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C variability caused by production changes alone. (a) Relative <sup>14</sup>C production rate as inferred from paleointensity data (gray) and from polar ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be fluxes (purple). The heavy dark gray line is the mean paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate. (b) Modelled  $\Delta^{14}$ C records based only on <sup>14</sup>C production changes, compared with the reconstructed IntCal13 and Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}$ C records. The modelled records are given by scenario MOD that assumes a constant preindustrial carbon cycle. (c) Difference between reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}$ C and modelsimulated  $\Delta^{14}$ C using averaged paleointensity data (RPI-based  $\Delta\Delta^{14}$ C; gray) and the ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be data of Adolphi et

- 1321 IntCal13-model difference, whereas dashed lines show the Hulu-model difference. The  $\Delta\Delta^{14}C$  curve indicates
- 1322 changes in  $\Delta^{14}$ C that can be attributed to some combination of carbon cycle changes, uncertainties in the reconstruction
- 1323 of the <sup>14</sup>C production rate, and uncertainties in the IntCal13 and Hulu Cave  $\Delta^{14}$ C records.



1349Fig. 8. Modelled records of atmospheric (a)  $\Delta^{14}$ C and (b) CO2, compared with their reconstructed histories (black and1350dark blue lines). Also shown are modelled records of the global average (c) surface reservoir age and (d) B-Atm  $^{14}$ C1351age offset, compared with a recent compilation of LGM marine radiocarbon data (dark blue squares) by Skinner et al.

- 1352 (2017) and model-based surface reservoir age estimates between 50°N and 50°S (solid black line) and across all
- 1353 latitudes (dashed black line) from Butzin et al. (2017), as well as (e) ideal age and (f) apparent oxygen utilization
- 1354 (AOU). Colored lines show the results of model runs using the mean paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate and the
- 1355 eight different carbon cycle scenarios described in Sect. 2.4 and Table 1. The gray envelope in (a) shows the
- 1356 uncertainty (2σ) from all production rate reconstructions and carbon cycle scenarios, providing a bounded estimate of
- $\Delta^{14}$ C change. The dashed colored lines in (c) show the surface reservoir age results from VENT and VENTx where
- 1358 atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C and CO<sub>2</sub> are prescribed. Radiocarbon ventilation ages are expressed here as radiocarbon reservoir
- 1359 age offsets following Soulet et al. (2016) which are used extensively by the radiocarbon dating community.



1386

Fig. 9. Comparison of atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C variability caused by changes in the ocean carbon cycle (b, d) with production-driven changes in atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C using scenario MOD (a, c). For the analysis of carbon cycle changes, only the results of model runs using the mean paleointensity-based <sup>14</sup>C production rate are shown. The  $\Delta^{14}$ C records in the upper panel (a, b) have been detrended by removing the mean, whereas the lower panel (c, d) shows  $\Delta^{14}$ C anomalies expressed as differences relative to the  $\Delta^{14}$ C value at 50 kyr BP. Three vertical light gray bars indicate the Laschamp (~41 kyr BP) and Mono Lake (~34 kyr BP) geomagnetic excursions, and the last glacial termination (~18 to 11 kyr BP).

- 1394
- 1395
- 1396
- 1397
- 1398
- 1399



1400

1401 Fig. 10. Comparison of <sup>14</sup>C production rate estimates inferred from a deconvolution of the atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C record and from paleointensity and ice-core <sup>10</sup>Be data. (a) <sup>14</sup>C production rate calculated as the sum of the modelled air-sea 1402 1403 and atmosphere-land <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes and the reconstructed change in the atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C inventory and loss of <sup>14</sup>C due 1404 to radioactive decay (see Eq. [2]). Model-based <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes were obtained by forcing the Bern3D carbon cycle model 1405 with reconstructed variations in atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}$ C and CO<sub>2</sub> as well as seven different carbon cycle scenarios. Results 1406 of model runs using the IntCal13 calibration curve are shown in the light blue envelope ( $2\sigma$ ), whereas the light red 1407 envelope ( $2\sigma$ ) shows the results from simulations using the composite Hulu Cave (10.6 to 50 kyr BP) and IntCal13 (0 1408 to 10.6 kyr BP)  $\Delta^{14}$ C record. The heavy black line is the mean of five available production rate reconstructions: Laj et 1409 al. (2000), Laj et al. (2004), Nowaczyk et al. (2013), Channell et al. (2018), and Adolphi et al. (2018). (b) Difference 1410 between the mean of the measurement-based production rate estimates (heavy black line) and estimates based on the 1411 deconvolution of the IntCal13 (IntCal-based  $\Delta Q$ ; blue) and Hulu Cave (Hulu-based  $\Delta Q$ ; red)  $\Delta^{14}C$  data.



1414 Fig. 11. Relative <sup>14</sup>C production rate as inferred from the Bern3D model under seven carbon cycle scenarios (see Sect. 1415 2.4). Estimates shown here are based on the composite Hulu Cave and IntCal13  $\Delta^{14}$ C record. The black line is the

- 1416 mean of the five production rate reconstructions shown in Fig. 10; the gray envelope shows its uncertainty  $(2\sigma)$ .

- 1 1 2 2