Clim. Past Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2019-116-RC1, 2019 © Author(s) 2019. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Interactive comment on "A survey of the impacts of summer droughts in England, 1200–1700" by Kathleen Pribyl

Neil Macdonald (Referee)

neil.macdonald@liverpool.ac.uk

Received and published: 21 October 2019

This is an interesting and enjoyable paper that presents new research on long-term droughts in South East England. I have attached an annotated version of the manuscript with suggested edits both in terms of language but also suggested additional considerations. I hope the author finds these comments helpful, the paper would also benefit from a detailed proof read, as in several places sentence structure / length needs reviewing.

Key points to address: Consider renaming the papersummer droughts in South East England... as the focus is on SE, as acknowledged.

I would encourage the author to consider the full breadth of drought reconstruction

C1

work undertaken for England, with several papers not mentioned, some of which cover the area of study (e.g. Spraggs et al., 2015 and Todd et at., 2013). This will help contextualise the work better.

The section on 1540 would benefit from strengthening with contemporary accounts, these from experience are limited, indeed only accounts are from London used (e.g. documented in Wetter 2013), an additional source for London may be present in the Cramner register, concerning call for prayers from Henry VIII. No evidence from outside London (SE) from a contemporary source?

Take care with statements on droughts in particular climates, drought is equally liable to occur in SE as NW England, however the impacts may differ.

Rename the 'Drought over the centuries' section, as this seems to be more about source material through the centuries than drought over the centuries.

I think some reconsideration of Section 6 adaptation measures is needed, some of this section addresses changes, but it is not clear how this differentiates from changes that were already being made/ how droughts drove these adaptations, rather than just coinciding with these changes. If you are making these links they need to be explicit, e.g. London New River first proposed in 1602, so not linked to drought of 1609 when first opened.

The author may like to add a sentence on the utility of this paper on better understanding droughts today? Value of such information in water resource plans.

I have suggested additional references on the annotated manuscript. The author may also find the following of interest:

Brázdil, R., Kiss, A., Luterbacher, J., Nash, D.J., ÅŸezníčková, L., 2018. Documentary data and the study of past droughts: a global state of the art. Clim. Past 14, 1915–1960. doi: 10.5194/cp-14-1915-2018

Sangster, H., Jones C., Macdonald N. (2018) The co-evolution of historical source

materials in the geophysical, hydrological and meteorological sciences: Learning from the past moving forward, Progress in Physical Geography, 42(1): 61-82 doi: 10.1177/0309133317744738

Neil Macdonald University of Liverpool

Please also note the supplement to this comment: https://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2019-116/cp-2019-116-RC1-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2019-116, 2019.