

Interactive comment on “Pollen-based temperature and precipitation changes in the Ohrid Basin (western Balkans) between 160 and 70 ka” by Gaia Sinopoli et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 5 September 2018

This is a very interesting paper worthy to be published and here are my suggestions for some improvements following the continuity of the text.

P1, Line 25 (and p.14 lines 13-17). For me, the discussion on the stability of the Eemien rests on a misdefinition. Since Jessen, everybody know that an interglacial cycle includes a period of warming after the previous glacial, an optimum and finally a progressive cooling leading to the next glacial. In this way the instability you mention is a truism! You could just mention that “The Eemian in the Balkans was characterized by an abrupt early warming during its anathermic phase followed a central phase . . .). Most of the authors, when dealing with “instability” or “stability” try to identify some

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



short terms climate “oscillations” disturbing the classical interglacial trend on a warming followed by a cooling (as well discussed latter in your paper).

P2, l.30-35. Before Field et al. (1994), at least Beaulieu & Reille (1984,1889) already mentioned a period of transitional warming during the late Eemian.

P3, l.2 and fig. 6: be careful with the coordinates. Les Echets: 45°52'36" N, 4°55'44" E and Lac du Bouchet : 44°54'31" N , 3°47'30". Lac du Bouchet is really transitional between North and South according to your classification. As a matter of fact, this limit at 45°N is of interest as far as the Eemian is concerned, but during the Early Würm the story is more complex with the opposition between the “Odderade style” vegetation and climate successions and the “Grande Pile style” successions. It could be mentioned.

P3, l.27. : I should prefer “higher resolution”, as an interval of 400 is not high resolution in terms of vegetation dynamics. Would you accept a pollen diagram covering the whole Holocene in only 28 spectra?

P4, the first sentence is not necessary as the following description is sufficient.

P4, l.11: do not repeat “karst aquifers”.

P5, top: my copy is polluted by three lines in pseudo-latin.

P5, l.34: could you develop and explain in more details your choice of 6 modern analogues?

P6, l. 20:I suggest “pollen records “ instead of “data”

P6, l.35: again one line polluted with latin.

P9, l.5 and after: this interesting discussion could be included in the chapter “Materials and methods”?

P9, l.22: may-be a clumsy statement. If your climate reconstructions are derived from pollen spectra, it would be a great disaster for your results if they were not in agreement

[Printer-friendly version](#)[Discussion paper](#)

with their sources.

P10, l. 24-29: Very interesting but I do not understand how the discussion is inferred from fig. 4: TIC and TOC do not change (slight increase in TOC) during the interval between 137 and 135 Ka marked by high amplitude changes in PAN and TAN??

P10, l 34 : Not that slight??

Chapter 5.4. : it would be of interest to take into account the climate reconstructions based on diatoms populations established by Rioual et al. (2007) at Ribains (see also Shemesh et al., 2001)

References

Beaulieu J.-L. de & Reille M., 1984. A long upper Pleistocene pollen record from Les Echets near Lyon, France, *Boreas*, 13, p.111-132.

Beaulieu J.-L. de & Reille M., 1989. The transition from temperate phases to stadials in the long Upper Pleistocene sequence from les Echets (France). *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 72, 147-159.

Rioual P., Andrieu-Ponel V., Beaulieu J.-L. de, Reille M., Svobodova H. & Battarbee R. W., 2007. Diatom responses to limnological and climatic changes at Ribains maar (French Massif Central) during the Eemian and Early Würm. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 26 (11-12), 1557-1609.

Shemesh A., Rietti-Shati M., Rioual P., Battarbee R., Beaulieu J.-L. de, Reille M. and Svobodova H., 2001. An Oxygen isotope record of lacustrine opal from a European Maar indicates climatic stability during the last interglacial. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 28 (12), 2305-2308.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2018-71>, 2018.