

Interactive comment on “Fire, vegetation and Holocene climate in the south-eastern Tibetan Plateau: a multi-biomarker reconstruction from Paru Co” by Alice Callegaro et al.

PAGES Data Review Team

darrell.kaufman1@gmail.com

Received and published: 7 April 2018

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing the data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. The CP Special Issue, “PAGES Young Scientists Meeting 2017” is part of this PAGES activity. The co-editors of the Special Issue are reviewing the data availability within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy (https://www.climate-of-the-past.net/about/data_policy.html) and current best practices. The editor team is making recommendations for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort

C1

will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example below). Authors are also strongly encouraged to deposit significant code into a suitable repository and to cite it using a Data Citation.

We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper.

YSM Special Issue editor team (E. Dearing Crampton-Flood, D.S. Kaufman, R. Barnett, M.F. Loutre, M.N. Evans, S.C. Fritz, C. Tabor, Y. Zhang, E. Razanatsoa, and H. Plumpton)

For this paper:

All papers submitted to Climate of the Past must include a Data Availability section that details the location of the data that were used as input to the study, including previously published data that were used for comparison purposes, and the data that were generated by the study.

(1) Research input data-

The paper makes use of the Global Charcoal Database (GCD). In order to adhere to the Data Policy for Climate of the Past, persistent identifiers (doi or URL from NOAA Paleoclimatology), or full data citations to the primary data must be included in the Data Availability section.

Fig. 1 (c) includes data from the TRMM dataset, which is not in the reference section. Please add the appropriate data citation to the paper.

Fig. 3 includes proxy data from Bird et al. (2014). We were delighted to discover that the data are already available in a public repository at

C2

<https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/study/16399>. Add a data citation for this dataset to the figure caption and to the Data Availability section.

Fig. 4 (c) includes a summary of pollen data from Tang et al. (2000) that was digitized from the original publication. Digitizing data from previous publications is a legitimate practice, but has important disadvantages. The accuracy is often degraded by the digitizing, and without essential metadata, the data are not available for reuse. Instead of digitizing previously published data, we encourage authors of this special issue to serve as data stewards by working with data generators to rescue and properly curate important datasets that are used in their paper. Please contact Tang to explain the reuse of the data and to offer to facilitate the transfer of the dataset to a data repository. Once deposited in a repository, the data can be cited with a data citation.

Fig. 6. Include a data citation to the GCD in this figure caption and in the Data Availability section.

(2) Research output data –

Biomarker data plotted in Figs 4a-b, 5b-e, 6c: Monosaccharide anhydrides (MAs), polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs), n-alkanes, fecal sterols and stanols (FeSts) – This paper presents new and valuable biomarker data for the south-eastern Tibetan Plateau during the Holocene. These new data must be uploaded to a long-standing online data repository, and a data citation or URL link from NOAA Paleoclimatology for access to these data must be provided in the Data Availability section of the paper.

Charcoal index plotted in Fig. 6b: Composite of previously published data from 43 sites – This is an important new summary of the regional fire history based on available charcoal records. The outcome of the synthesis (the time series with uncertainties) should be transferred to a repository along with a table of metadata that includes the name and location and reference for each of the 43 sites. This product could be included on the same landing page, with the same doi/NOAA URL along with the biomarker data.

C3

What is a “Data Citation”?

Data Citations track the provenance of a dataset giving credit to the data generator; this is in addition to any references to publications where the data are described. Data Citations are used in the text (or tables) alongside and in the same way as publication citations. In the Reference list, they include: Creators, Title, Repository, Identifier, Submission Year. More information about Data Citations is here: <https://www.datacite.org/mission.html>

Here is an example of text and corresponding citations (using CP punctuation style):

“The PAGES2k Consortium (2017a) assembled a large global dataset of temperature-sensitive proxy records (PAGES2k Consortium, 2017b). Among the records is the paleo-temperature reconstruction from Laguna Chepical (de Jong et al., 2016), which was described by de Jong et al. (2013).”

References

de Jong, R., von Gunten, I., Maldonado, A., and Grosjean, M.: Late Holocene summer temperatures in the central Andes reconstructed from the sediments of high-elevation Laguna Chepical, Chile (32° S), *Climate of the Past*, 9, 1921-1932, 2013.

de Jong, R., von Gunten, I., Maldonado, A., and Grosjean, M.: Laguna Chepical summer temperature reconstruction, *World Data Center for Paleoclimatology*, <https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/study/20366>, 2016.

PAGES 2k Consortium: A global multiproxy database for temperature reconstructions of the Common Era, *Scientific Data*, 4,170088, 2017a.

PAGES 2k Consortium: A global multiproxy database for temperature reconstructions of the Common Era, version 2.0.0, [figshare](https://figshare.com/s/d327a0367bb908a4c4f2), <https://figshare.com/s/d327a0367bb908a4c4f2>, 2017b.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2018-19>, 2018.

C4