

Interactive comment on “Fire, vegetation and Holocene climate in the south-eastern Tibetan Plateau: a multi-biomarker reconstruction from Paru Co” by Alice Callegaro et al.

Alice Callegaro et al.

alice.callegaro@unive.it

Received and published: 9 July 2018

PAGES Data Review Team The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing the data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. The CP Special Issue, “PAGES Young Scientists Meeting 2017” is part of this PAGES activity. The co-editors of the Special Issue are reviewing the data availability within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy (https://www.climate-of-the-past.net/about/data_policy.html) and current best practices. The editor team is making recommendations for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the Spe-

C1

cial Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example below). Authors are also strongly encouraged to deposit significant code into a suitable repository and to cite it using a Data Citation. We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly. Best wishes for the success of your paper. YSM Special Issue editor team (E. Dearing Crampton-Flood, D.S. Kaufman, R. Barnett, M.F. Loutre, M.N. Evans, S.C. Fritz, C. Tabor, Y. Zhang, E. Razanatsoa, and H. Plumpton) For this paper: All papers submitted to Climate of the Past must include a Data Availability section that details the location of the data that were used as input to the study, including previously published data that were used for comparison purposes, and the data that were generated by the study.

(1) Research input data- The paper makes use of the Global Charcoal Database (GCD). In order to adhere to the Data Policy for Climate of the Past, persistent identifiers (doi or URL from NOAA Paleoclimatology), or full data citations to the primary data must be included in the Data Availability section.

A: We thank the PAGES Data Review Team for the comments and suggestions.

Fig. 1 (c) includes data from the TRMM dataset, which is not in the reference section. Please add the appropriate data citation to the paper.

A: We have added the appropriate data citation in figure 1(c).

Fig. 3 includes proxy data from Bird et al. (2014). We were delighted to discover that the data are already available in a public repository at <https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/study/16399>. Add a data citation for this dataset to the figure caption and to the Data Availability section.

A: Now figure 3 is different and it includes data from Zhao et

C2

al. (2011) that we appropriately cited, adding the data citation as well:<http://apps.neotomadb.org/Explorer/?datasetid=14619>. Data from Bird et al. (2014) are now included in the figures 4(a,d) and 5(b). We inserted the appropriate data citation to the figures' captions and to the Data Availability section.

Fig. 4 (c) includes a summary of pollen data from Tang et al. (2000) that was digitized from the original publication. Digitizing data from previous publications is a legitimate practice, but has important disadvantages. The accuracy is often degraded by the digitizing, and without essential metadata, the data are not available for reuse. Instead of digitizing previously published data, we encourage authors of this special issue to serve as data stewards by working with data generators to rescue and properly curate important datasets that are used in their paper. Please contact Tang to explain the reuse of the data and to offer to facilitate the transfer of the dataset to a data repository. Once deposited in a repository, the data can be cited with a data citation.

A: We agree with the fact that digitizing can reduce accuracy. However, we were not able to come in contact with Tang. We therefore decided to remove the comparison with Tang's dataset from figure 4 and we choose to compare our data with pollen dataset from Zhao et al. (2011), which is uploaded in Neotoma Data Publisher public repository (<http://apps.neotomadb.org/Explorer/?datasetid=14619>), displaying this data in figure 3(c).

Fig. 6. Include a data citation to the GCD in this figure caption and in the Data Availability section.

A: Due to the revision process we changed big part of the paper, dismissing the use of the GCD and therefore removing figure 6.

(2) Research output data – Biomarker data plotted in Figs 4a-b, 5b-e, 6c: Monosaccharide anhydrides (MAs), polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs), n-alkanes, fecal sterols and stanols (FeSts) – This paper presents new and valuable biomarker data for the south-eastern Tibetan Plateau during the Holocene. These new data must be

C3

uploaded to a long-standing online data repository, and a data citation or URL link from NOAA Paleoclimatology for access to these data must be provided in the Data Availability section of the paper. Charcoal index plotted in Fig. 6b: Composite of previously published data from 43 sites – This is an important new summary of the regional fire history based on available charcoal records. The outcome of the synthesis (the time series with uncertainties) should be transferred to a repository along with a table of metadata that includes the name and location and reference for each of the 43 sites. This product could be included on the same landing page, with the same doi/NOAA URL along with the biomarker data.

A: All the research output data, except for charcoal index that was removed from the paper, are now available at this link: <https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo-search/study/24410>.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2018-19>, 2018.

C4