

Interactive comment on “Pollen-based quantitative land-cover reconstruction for northern Asia during the last 40 ka” by Xianyong Cao et al.

Jonkers (Editor)

ljonkers@marum.de

Received and published: 13 December 2018

Thank you for your contribution to the inter-journal special issue ‘Paleoclimate data synthesis and analysis of associated uncertainty’ and for your help to promote open source paleoclimate science.

One of the goals of the special issue on ‘Paleoclimate data synthesis and analysis of associated uncertainty’ is to promote good data stewardship in paleoclimatology. Therefore, the data handling of all contributions to the special issue will be reviewed independently from the normal peer reviews and short comments. While we realise that this may lead to additional work on the authors’ side, we believe that good data stewardship is essential to guarantee transparency and reproducibility of the results as

C1

well as to promote the reuse of the data. The editors will be requesting evidence that all data presented in the submissions are made available freely and adhere to the FAIR concept (<https://www.nature.com/articles/sdata201618>). This applies to original data, as well as to data compilations and derived data products. Where relevant, authors are asked to adhere to the practice of attributing data to original authors through data citation and encouraged to share code used to treat original data and generate derived data products.

Specific comments for Pollen-based quantitative land-cover reconstruction for northern Asia during the last 40 ka by Cao et al.

In their data availability statement, the authors mention that the full data set will be made publicly available in a contribution to the journal Earth System Science Data. We are happy that the authors are willing to share their data. However, as far as we are aware, no such manuscript has been submitted to ESSD. This means that the data effectively remain unavailable.

Required additions:

As an alternative option to the submission of a new manuscript, we suggest that the authors make their data publicly available at this stage. If needed the data can be placed under embargo until acceptance of a revised manuscript, but reviewers and editor should have the possibility to access the data and evaluate the data handling. Also note that publication of a revised manuscript requires that the embargo be lifted and the data are publicly available. In this way the review process can continue uninterrupted and needs not to depend on publication of a second manuscript.

When making the data available, please ensure that full metadata are archived to facilitate straightforward use of the data. This would for instance include notes on the taxonomic harmonisation. In addition, please include raw pollen counts where available and include data citations where appropriate (e.g. for previously published data and the data being made available in this manuscript).

C2

Further recommended additions:

Consider making the code used to analyse the data and to make the figures accessible on a public repository (GitHub, Zenodo).

If you have any questions about the data handling guidelines, please don't hesitate to contact any of the guest editors of the special issue 'Paleoclimate data synthesis and analysis of associated uncertainty'.

With kind regards,

Lukas Jonkers On behalf of the guest editorial team

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2018-111>, 2018.