

**Dear Dr. Yin,**

First thanks very much for assigning me to review this manuscript entitled “The response of tropical precipitation to Earth's precession: The role of fluxes and vertical stability” This work attempts to provide a dynamical explanation for comparing responses of tropical precipitation to  $P_{\min}$  and  $P_{\max}$ . The topics is very interesting. However, much work needs to improve the quality of this work from the organization structures to Figures arrangement and conclusions. For this reason, I recommend to be published on the Journal of Climate of the Past after major revision.

## Comments on the manuscript

The topic entitled “*The response of tropical precipitation to Earth's precession: The role of fluxes and vertical stability*” aims to provide a dynamical explanation for response differences of tropical precipitation to  $P_{\min}$  and  $P_{\max}$ . Substantial works needs to do and major revisions are given. To help revision, I list the issues of my concerns.

1. Title: fluxes is too general, suggest “energy fluxes” replace fluxes
2. The structures of current manuscript needs to improve and arrange as follows:  
  
First part is Introduction, and second part is Model description, and experiments design, methodology. The third part is results shows. Conclusions and discussion appear last part. However, the authors should move most of (maybe all) the formulas in section 2 with a quite clear description. Please re-organize this part.
3. Table 1 and Table 2 are not very beautiful.
4. All the title of Figurexx is not correct in your figure captions, because one more Arabic number “1” need to remove.
5. give a regression line for Figure 13 and Figure 14 and then merge into one plot.
6. All the Figures needs to make it more beautiful.