

Interactive comment on “Novel approach for ice core based temperature reconstructions – a synthetic data study for Holocene $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ data” by Michael Döring and Markus Leuenberger

PAGES Data Review Team

darrell.kaufman1@gmail.com

Received and published: 27 August 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. A team of reviewers has been constituted for the “PAGES Young Scientists Meeting 2017” Special Issue. The data team, including the editors of the Special Issue, is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy (https://www.climate-of-the-past.net/about/data_policy.html) and current best practices. The team is making recommendations for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the Special Issue. We recognize

C1

that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example below). Authors are also strongly encouraged to deposit significant code into a suitable repository and to cite it using a Data Citation.

We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly. Best wishes for the success of your paper.

YSM Special Issue Data Review Team D.S. Kaufman, M.F. Loutre, M.N. Evans, S.C. Fritz, C. Tabor, H. Plumpton, R. Barnett, Y. Zhang, E. Razanatsoa, and E. Dearing Crampton Flood —

Essential additions for this paper: (1) Add a separate “Data Availability” section as required by the publisher. Specify where all of the essential input and output data are archived, including formal Data Citations for each of the datasets (see below). This includes the ice accumulation and oxygen isotope data.

(2) For essential datasets used in the study but not already in a public repository, submit the data and related metadata to an established public data repository and cite the persistent identifier in “Data Availability”.

(3) Prior to publication of this study, submit the primary original data or results of numerical modeling to a public repository and cite the corresponding persistent identifier in “Data Availability”. This includes the final time series of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and surface temperatures and any other data that might be useful for future users to replicate the study outcomes and to readily compare the results with future studies. We also strongly encourage the authors to deposit their significant code into a suitable repository and to cite it using a Data Citation. —

What is a “Data Citation”? Data Citations track the provenance of a dataset giving credit

C2

to the data generator; this is in addition to any references to publications where the data are described. Data Citations are used in the text (or tables) alongside and in the same way as publication citations. In the Reference list, they include: Creators, Title, Repository, Identifier, Submission Year. More information about Data Citations is here: <<https://www.datacite.org/mission.html>> Here is an example of text and corresponding citations (using CP punctuation style):

The PAGES2k Consortium (2017a) assembled a large global dataset of temperature-sensitive proxy records (PAGES2k Consortium, 2017b). Among the records is the paleo-temperature reconstruction from Laguna Chepical (de Jong et al., 2016), which was described by de Jong et al. (2013).

References de Jong, R., von Gunten, I., Maldonado, A., and Grosjean, M.: Late Holocene summer temperatures in the central Andes reconstructed from the sediments of high-elevation Laguna Chepical, Chile (32° S), *Climate of the Past*, 9, 1921-1932, 2013.

de Jong, R., von Gunten, I., Maldonado, A., and Grosjean, M.: Laguna Chepical summer temperature reconstruction, World Data Center for Paleoclimatology, <https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/study/20366>, 2016.

PAGES 2k Consortium: A global multiproxy database for temperature reconstructions of the Common Era, *Scientific Data*, 4,170088, 2017a.

PAGES 2k Consortium: A global multiproxy database for temperature reconstructions of the Common Era, version 2.0.0, figshare, <https://figshare.com/s/d327a0367bb908a4c4f2>, 2017b.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2017-92>, 2017.