

Interactive comment on “Reconstructing Late Holocene North Atlantic atmospheric circulation changes using functional paleoclimate networks” by Jasper G. Franke et al.

D.s Kaufman

darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 5 May 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the “Climate of the Past 2000 years” Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate dedication and contribution of the

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Marttrat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

Essential additions for this paper:

- (1) Expand the "data availability" section to include details on where the input and output data are archived. A Data Citation is needed for the output data (#6 below).
- (2) Add Data Citations for all of the proxy datasets listed in Table S1.
- (3) For those data not already in a public repository, submit essential metadata along with the time series and include the Data Citation in Table S1.
- (4) For those records with previous PAGES 2k IDs, include cross references to those IDs in Table S1 (see Table 1 in PAGES 2k Consortium (in press) for PAGES2k IDs). Also, the PAGES2k temperature database version number that was used must be stated in "data availability" and in the title to Table S1.
- (5) Explain why records from the PAGES 2k database that meet the criteria for this study appear to have been excluded from this analysis.
- (6) Submit the primary outcome of the data analyses to a public repository. This includes: (a) The NAO index reconstruction (Fig S6). (b) The cross-link density time series in Fig. S4.

Recommended elements are:

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



(7) Archive the values for the NAO reconstruction in 50-year bins that was used to correlate with the output of this study (last row in Fig. S7; from Ortega et al., 2015)

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2017-41/cp-2017-41-SC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2017-41, 2017.

CPD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

