Interactive comment on “Antarctic climate variability at regional and continental scales over the last 2,000 years” by Barbara Stenni et al.

D.s Kaufman
darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 16 May 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the “Climate of the Past 2000 years” Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular
open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Martrat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

Essential additions for this paper:

(1) Add a "data availability" section that describes where the data can be accessed, including a Data Citation for the temperature reconstructions generated in this study (#4 below), and the target datasets.

(2) Add Data Citations (in addition to publication citations) for all 112 datasets listed in Table S1. For those data not already in a public repository, submit essential metadata along with the time series and include the Data Citation in Table S1.

(3) For those records with previous PAGES 2k IDs, please include cross references to those IDs. These can be found in Table 1 of PAGES2k Consortium (in press). If the data are included in the Iso2k dataset, then please include a cross reference to that data product.

(4) Submit the primary outcome of the data analyses to a public repository and include the Data Citation in "data availability". This includes the (a) composite isotope time series by region (Figs 2 and 3), (b) climate-region temperature reconstructions with the different scaling and binning (Figs 4 and 5), (c) Antarctica-wide (Fig 7) and broad-regions reconstructions (Fig 8) with the different scaling and including the uncertainty statistics.

Recommended elements are:

(5) Archive the weightings used for each of the records in the weighted composite.
(6) Archive the target datasets, including the modeled data.

(7) Archive the results of the trend analyses (Fig. 6).

Please also note the supplement to this comment: