

Interactive comment on “Comparing proxy and model estimates of hydroclimate variability and change over the Common Era” by Jason E. Smerdon et al.

D.s Kaufman

darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 3 June 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the “Climate of the Past 2000 years” Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to

C1

meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Martinat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

For this paper: The "Data Availability" section is excellent, with all essential elements included. We commend the authors for their diligent data stewardship.

We suggest that you also submit to a public repository the data used to create the: (a) histograms in Fig 2, (b) Taylor diagrams in Fig 5, (c) histograms in Fig 6, and (d) JJA PDSI time series in Fig 8a. Add the Data Citation (or URL link) to these datasets to the "Data Availability" section of the paper.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2017-37/cp-2017-37-SC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2017-37>, 2017.

C2