Clim. Past Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2017-36-SC1, 2017

Climate of the Past Discussions

Interactive comment on "Hydroclimate variability in Scandinavia over the last millennium – insights from a climate model-proxy data comparison" *by* Kristina Seftigen et al.

D.s Kaufman

darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 3 June 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the "Climate of the Past 2000 years" Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to

meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Martrat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

Essential additions for this paper:

(1) Expand the "Data Availability" section to include a Data Citation or URLs to the primary output of this study (regional SPEI nested reconstruction (ScandH17) and the 100-year smooth and estimate uncertainty).

(2) Add Data Citations or URLs (in addition to publication citations) for each of the 27 tree-ring chronologies used in this study to Table II (we note that Table II includes only 25 entires). For those raw data not already in a persistent public repository, submit the essential metadata along with the chronology itself and add the corresponding Data Citation (or URL) in Table II. The archived data must contain the modified chronologies as they were re-processed and used in this study (newest signal-free standardization; adjusted to reduce variance bias). The 'Updated by Seftigen et al. 2015' revisions should be publicly archived and the 'Seftigen et al. 2015' datasets should also be archived.

(3) Add a Data Citation for the ScandT14 reconstruction (Fig 7a). If the data have not previously been deposited in a public data repository, then submit the essential metadata along with the time series itself and add the corresponding Data Citation and publication citation to the caption for Fig 7.

We also suggest the following additions:

(4) Archive the target time series for the reconstruction (20th century 2-month June SPEI, Fig 1b), or at least include the URL link to the CRU data that underpins the time series.

(5) Archive the mean of the six GCM simulations for the last millennium, including the SPEI (Fig 2a, 7b) and temperature and precipitation (Fig 7b). Archiving the model mean data will assist others in carrying out future data-model comparisons as new tree-ring chronologies are published.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2017-36/cp-2017-36-SC1-supplement.pdf

---

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2017-36, 2017.