

Interactive comment on “Climate variability in subarctic area for the last two millennia” by Marie Nicolle et al.

D.s Kaufman

darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 22 May 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the “Climate of the Past 2000 years” Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular

C1

open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Martrat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

Essential additions for this paper:

(1) Add a "Data Availability" section with a Data Citation/URL for both the input dataset (PAGES 2k) and one for the primary output from this study. Also, state the source of the code/software used for the wavelet and spectral analyses.

(2) Add Data Citations plus Publication Citations for each of the records used in this study (Table S1). These can be found in version 2 of the global dataset (PAGES 2k Consortium, in press in Scientific Data). In addition, state which of your three regions each of the records is located.

(3) Submit the primary outcome of this study, the composite temperature time series by region (Fig. 2) to a public repository and include the Data Citation/URL in "Data Availability".

(4) Add a statement to explain why the analyses in this study are based on the old version of the PAGES 2k dataset. State how the new and now-discredited data in version 2 of the dataset might influence or limit the conclusions in this study. Alternatively, we highly recommend that the analyses in this study be updated using the current version of the PAGES2k dataset, the same one used by Werner et al. in this special issue

Recommended element:

(5) Archive a table that lists the beginning and ending of the LIA in each record (the data plotted in Fig. 4). These data could also be included in Table S1.

C2

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2017-33/cp-2017-33-SC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2017-33, 2017.