

Interactive comment on “Multi-proxy reconstructions of precipitation field in China over the past 500 years” by Feng Shi et al.

D.s Kaufman

darrell.kaufman@nau.edu

Received and published: 3 May 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. As part of this activity, a team of reviewers has been constituted for the “Climate of the Past 2000 years” Special Issue. The data team is reviewing the data handling within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy and current best practices. The team has identified essential and recommended additions for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level of data stewardship across the 2k Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example in supplement). We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion.

If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly.

Best wishes for the success of your paper,

2k Special Issue Data Review Team (Darrell Kaufman, Nerilie Abram, Belen Martrat, Raphael Neukom, Scott St. George) and ex-officio team members (Marie-France Loutre, Lucien von Gunten)

Essential additions for this paper:

- (1) Add a "data availability" section that describes where the data can be accessed, including a Data Citation for the precipitation reconstruction generated in this study (#6 below).
- (2) Add Data Citations (in addition to publication citations) for all 492 proxy datasets listed in Table S1.
- (3) For those data not already in a public repository, including the 108 time series of wet/dry records, submit essential metadata along with the time series and include the Data Citation in Table S1.
- (4) For those records with previous PAGES 2k IDs, please include cross references to those IDs. These can be found in Table 1 of PAGES2k Consortium (in press). It will be of interest to know how many of the tree rings were used to reconstruct temperature.
- (5) If this study relied on the the PAGES2k temperature data base for metadata, quality control or other aspects, then please cite that compilation (PAGES2k Consortium, in press).
- (6) Submit the primary outcome of the data analyses to a public repository and include the Data Citation. This includes (a) the detrended and infilled version of all tree-ring chronologies, (b) the resulting precipitation time series reconstruction with and without 9-year smoothing, (c) the IMFs of the reconstruction time series at multiple temporal

scales (Figs 5 and S1), and (d) the reconstructed precipitation value for each grid point at a reasonable time resolution, possibly decadal.

Recommended elements are:

- (1) Archive the instrumental precipitation target time series (Fig 4a and 4b, black lines)
- (2) Archive the precipitation anomalies for the six climate modes (Fig 9, blue lines)
- (3) Archive the code used to generate the reconstruction

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2017-2/cp-2017-2-SC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2017-2, 2017.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

