

Interactive comment on “Drought and vegetation change in the central Rocky Mountains: Potential climatic mechanisms associated with the mega drought at 4200 cal yr BP” by Vachel A. Carter and Jacqueline Shinker

PAGES Data Review Team

darrell.kaufman1@gmail.com

Received and published: 4 November 2017

The PAGES Data Stewardship Integrative Activity seeks to advance best practices for sharing the data generated and assembled as part of all PAGES-related activities. The CP Special Issue, “PAGES Young Scientists Meeting 2017” is part of this PAGES activity. The co-editors of the Special Issue are reviewing the data availability within each of the CP-Discussion papers in relation to the CP data policy (https://www.climate-of-the-past.net/about/data_policy.html) and current best practices. The editor team is making recommendations for each paper, with the goal of achieving a high and consistent level

C1

of data stewardship across the Special Issue. We recognize that an additional effort will likely be required to meet the high level of data stewardship envisaged, and we appreciate the dedication and contribution of the authors. This includes the use of Data Citations (see example below). Authors are also strongly encouraged to deposit significant code into a suitable repository and to cite it using a Data Citation.

We ask authors to respond to our comments as part of the regular open interactive discussion. If you have any questions about PAGES Data Stewardship principles, please contact any of us directly. Best wishes for the success of your paper.

YSM Special Issue editor team

H. Plumpton, D.S. Kaufman, R. Barnett, M.F. Loutre, M.N. Evans, S.C. Fritz, C. Tabor, Y. Zhang, E. Razanatsoa, and E. Dearing Crampton Flood

For this paper:

(1) Research input data – surface and atmospheric variables, charcoal, pollen data

This research contribution discusses published proxy data (pollen, charcoal) from Carter et al. (2017), which are already uploaded to long-standing data repositories. However, the URLs provided do not link to the actual data. In order to adhere to the Data Policy for submissions to Climate of the Past, URLs or full data citations to the actual data must be included in the Data Availability section. The data on surface and atmospheric variables used in the composite-anomaly analysis from NOAA also requires citation. A link to a data-viewer web interface is not a persistent identifier of the data behind the interface; a data citation of the actual dataset in a public data repository is required.

(2) Research output data – composite-anomaly values (precipitation, air temperature, 500mb geopotential height, 500mb Omega, 850mb specific humidity, 500mb vector winds)

This paper presents new and valuable composite-anomaly data for numerous climate

C2

variables for Long Lake in the Medicine Bow Mountains of southeastern Wyoming. In order to adhere to the Data Policy for submissions to *Climate of the Past*, these new data must be uploaded to a long-standing online data repository, and a Data Citation or URL link for access to these data must be provided in the Data Availability section of the paper.

What is a “Data Citation”?

Data Citations track the provenance of a dataset giving credit to the data generator; this is in addition to any references to publications where the data are described. Data Citations are used in the text (or tables) alongside and in the same way as publication citations. In the Reference list, they include: Creators, Title, Repository, Identifier, Submission Year. More information about Data Citations is here: <<https://www.datacite.org/mission.html>> Here is an example of text and corresponding citations (using CP punctuation style):

“The PAGES2k Consortium (2017a) assembled a large global dataset of temperature-sensitive proxy records (PAGES2k Consortium, 2017b). Among the records is the paleo-temperature reconstruction from Laguna Chepical (de Jong et al., 2016), which was described by de Jong et al. (2013).”

References

de Jong, R., von Gunten, I., Maldonado, A., and Grosjean, M.: Late Holocene summer temperatures in the central Andes reconstructed from the sediments of high-elevation Laguna Chepical, Chile (32° S), *Climate of the Past*, 9, 1921-1932, 2013.

de Jong, R., von Gunten, I., Maldonado, A., and Grosjean, M.: Laguna Chepical summer temperature reconstruction, World Data Center for Paleoclimatology, <https://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/study/20366>, 2016.

PAGES 2k Consortium: A global multiproxy database for temperature reconstructions

C3

of the Common Era, *Scientific Data*, 4,170088, 2017a.

PAGES 2k Consortium: A global multiproxy database for temperature reconstructions of the Common Era, version 2.0.0, figshare, <https://figshare.com/s/d327a0367bb908a4c4f2>, 2017b.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2017-107>, 2017.