Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2016-46-RC1, 2016 © Author(s) 2016. CC-BY 3.0 License.



CPD

Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "The effect of greenhouse gas concentrations and ice sheets on the glacial AMOC in a coupled climate model" by Marlene Klockmann et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 5 May 2016

This is an excellent paper. It discusses the role of ice sheets and atmospheric CO2 levels for the water mass distribution and meridional circulation characteristics of the LGM. It shows that the MPI model is able to produce a weaker and shallower AMOC as reconstructions suggest, but the atmospheric CO2 value used to produce it is too low.

The only comment that I am going to make on this paper is on the way comparisons are made. Instead of comparing different experiments (LGM GHG, LGM ice sheets, etc.) to a sole default run (e.g., a preindustrial run), they compare the LGM GHG experiment to an LGM run with preindustrial GHG to get GHG effects, and then compare the latter one to a preindustrial run with LGM orbital parameters to isolate ice sheet+topography

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



effects. Although correct, I think this is confusing. When looking at the pictures, I had to switch back and forth to the experiment design section because I didn't remember what was being compared with what in each of them. A way to solve this without having to restructure all the images would be to add a footnote in each panel specifying what is being compared.

Otherwise the paper should be published by Climate of the Past

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2016-46, 2016.

CPD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

