Clim. Past Discuss.,
doi:10.5194/cp-2015-165-RC1, 2016

Climate of the Past Discussions

Interactive comment on "An interactive tool for navigation within a database of water and carbon stable isotope records from natural archives" *by* T. Bolliet et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 7 March 2016

The manuscript of Bolliet et al. describes a new compilation of isotope proxy records (oxygen, hydrogen, carbon), which are key for many paleoclimate studies. According to the authors, they have compiled several hundreds of records from various archives (marine and lacustrine sediments, ice cores, tree rings, speleothems, corals). So far, these records have been either published in the literature or scattered among different other databases, e.g. NOAA libraries. This new compilation focuses on four different time periods of the past, only: (i) the last 200years, (ii) the mid-Holocene, (iii) the LGM, (iv) the last Interglacial. With this compilation, the authors aim to homogenize the format of the available data sets and enable an easier usage and wider distribution of the isotope data via the online portal http://climateproxiesfinder.ipsl.fr. This online portal

shall enable scientists to easily search and find specific subsets of different criteria within the compilation and also download the data in a homogenized format.

I rate the efforts of the authors to create such a new data compilation as worth publishing and highly valuable for the scientific community. Nowadays, more and more research time is consumed for screening the growing amount of literature and data sources, finding relevant data sets and getting them into a useful common format for own studies. Compilations like the one described by the authors might help to perform these tasks in a more efficient manner. Thus, I highly support the compilation and publication of this database (even if it is rather specific and focuses on a few selected proxies and time slices, only) and compliment the authors on their efforts.

The manuscript is well outlaid and written in a clear and concise manner. It can almost be published it its present form. However, I am still hesitating to recommend a publication in Climate of the Past for two reasons:

(i) The authors describe a database, which is not available to the public, yet. As of today (March 7, 2016), the website http://climateproxiesfinder.ipsl.fr is linked to the compilation version 1.45, updated on 2016/02/26. Graphical data presentation and access via this website look very different from the version described by the authors, and an option for downloading data in a common format does not exist, yet. Thus, I have currently no possibility of checking key statements of the manuscript about data availability as well as data selection and download options.

(ii) The article is merely a description of the new data compilation and built website interface. In my opinion, it does not contain enough new scientific insights to merit a publication in CP. Other journals (e.g. Earth System Science Data ESSD) might be much more appropriate for such kind of article. However, I realize that CP has published similar compilation efforts in the past.

Because of these demurs, I leave the final decision about the appropriateness of publication with the editor.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., doi:10.5194/cp-2015-165, 2016.