

Interactive comment on “Caspian Sea level changes during the last millennium: historical and geological evidences from the south Caspian Sea” by A. Naderi Beni et al.

M. Siddall (Editor)

mark.siddall@bristol.ac.uk

Received and published: 13 May 2013

Dear Dr Naderi Beni,

thank you for submitting your paper to CPD. It has generated quite some interest and both positive comments and strong recommendations (which lead one reviewer to suggest rejection). It is difficult to reach a decision on such a multi-disciplinary study and the comments of the reviewers reflect the challenges of evaluating this paper. Voluntary comments from other experts also inform my decision in this case.

I feel that you have carried out a scholarly piece of work that should, eventually, be published with CP. However, the burden you must accept for such an ambitious piece

C748

of work is to achieve an acceptable standard in the evaluating the geochemical dating of the records you discuss (as indicated by reviewer 2) and an improved discussion of local tectonic effects. The minor comments of both reviewers and independent comments must also be addressed in full.

This can be therefore considered major changes and the paper will go out to review again once resubmitted to CP. I encourage you to make these changes. Perhaps to make sure that you have achieved a level of dealing with reviewers' issues which is acceptable to each of their research communities, you may need to include co-authors in the respective fields.

Kind regards,

Mark Siddall

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 9, 1397, 2013.