

Interactive comment on “Testing long-term summer temperature reconstruction based on maximum density chronologies obtained by reanalysis of tree-ring datasets from northernmost Sweden and Finland” by V. V. Matskovsky and S. Helama

A.-L. Daniau (Editor)

al.daniau@epoc.u-bordeaux1.fr

Received and published: 6 February 2014

Two referees have now assessed the manuscript. They are positive about the contribution of the study as a test of different standardization options on chronologies used in dendroclimatology. However they raise several issues about the reconstruction method used in this study but address constructive comments to solve them at some point. Main issues concern 1) the limited number of chronologies used; 2) the

C3362

potential sources not addressed analytically; 3) limited discussion about the heterogeneity of the datasets; 4) a complete statistical analysis including p-values and performance analysis. They suggest also expanding the standardisation section including other techniques and a more thorough description of the method of the correction procedure used in the Matskovsky 2011 paper. The referees have also made a number of detailed suggestions to improve clarity and flow of the manuscript.

In its present form we regret that the manuscript cannot be published. Although a significant amount of work is needed we encourage the authors to respond - point by point - to the referees' comments and provide a deep revision of the manuscript following their comments and technical corrections (including language editing). This revised version will require a second round of review.

Anne-Laure Daniau and Alberto Reyes (Editors)

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 9, 5659, 2013.

C3363