

Interactive comment on “Volcanic ash layers in Lake El’gygytgyn: eight new regionally significant chronostratigraphic markers for western Beringia” by C. van den Bogaard et al.

K. Wallace (Referee)

kwallace@usgs.gov

Received and published: 4 January 2014

To: Editor, Climate of the Past

From: Kristi Wallace

Subject: Volcanic ash layers in Lake El’gygytgyn: eight new regionally significant chronostratigraphic markers by C., van den Bogaard et al.; MS No.: cp-2013-124.

January 3, 2014

Dear Editor in Chief,

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



General Comments

I have used the review tools in Adobe Acrobat and have included detailed comments and suggestions for revision directly on the manuscript. I suggest that the editor and authors look closely at the manuscript and my suggestions to see that there are far too many to list individually here. Please click on all comments, deletions, insertions, etc. to see my comments as they tend to get buried in the Adobe reviewing tools.

All specific comments and technical corrections can be found directly on the attached manuscript and are not relisted here. I have however, summarized some of my comments below.

Specific Comments

Overall I think this paper is very good in content and scientific appeal which is of most importance so bravo to the authors on achieving this goal. Most of my comments and suggestions for revisions are related to overall organization, and clarity. I spent quite a bit of time reading over the text very carefully and making suggestions and rewording to improve the clarity of the paper. In the case of this manuscript where the authors are describing 8 individual tephra layers it is particularly important that the data for each layer is presented and written in a parallel fashion so some work is needed here to clean up the writing to achieve clarity. In addition I found numerous accounts where details are inconsistent between the tables and figures and what is written in the text. These sorts of errors can be easily fixed and should not take the authors long to correct. I think that the authors should have little trouble making these minor edits and revisions and will result in a much improved manuscript. These data are very important and very detailed so it is critical that everything matches up as future workers will in fact be using these data and the authors will serve themselves and the tephra community by correcting these inconsistencies. This was a really fun manuscript to read – super exciting times!

If you have further questions please do not hesitate to contact me.

C3029

CPD

9, C3028–C3030, 2014

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Sincerely,

Kristi Wallace

4230 University Drive, Suite 201 Anchorage, Alaska 99508 Office phone: 001-907-786-7109 Fax: 001-907-786-7150 Email: kwallace@usgs.gov

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/9/C3028/2014/cpd-9-C3028-2014-supplement.pdf>

[Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 9, 5977, 2013.](#)

CPD

9, C3028–C3030, 2014

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C3030

