Clim. Past Discuss., 9, 5157–5182, 2013 www.clim-past-discuss.net/9/5157/2013/ doi:10.5194/cpd-9-5157-2013 © Author(s) 2013. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal Climate of the Past (CP). Please refer to the corresponding final paper in CP if available.

# Ensemble meteorological reconstruction using circulation analogues of 1781–1785

P. Yiou<sup>1</sup>, M. Boichu<sup>2</sup>, R. Vautard<sup>1</sup>, M. Vrac<sup>1</sup>, S. Jourdain<sup>3</sup>, E. Garnier<sup>4</sup>, F. Fluteau<sup>5</sup>, and L. Menut<sup>2</sup>

 <sup>1</sup>Laboratoire des Sciences du Climat et de l'Environnement, UMR8212 CEA-CNRS-UVSQ & IPSL, CE Saclay l'Orme des Merisiers, 91191 Gif-sur-Yvette, France
 <sup>2</sup>Laboratoire de Météorologie Dynamique, UMR8539 X-ENS-UPMC & IPSL, Ecole Polytechnique, 91128 Palaiseau, France
 <sup>3</sup>DClim, Météo France, 42 Avenue G. Coriolis, 31057 Toulouse, France
 <sup>4</sup>Centre de Recherche d'Histoire Quantitative, UMR6583 Université de Caen–CNRS, 14032 Caen, France
 <sup>5</sup>Institut de Physique du Globe de Paris, 1 rue Jussieu, 75238 Paris, France
 Received: 1 August 2013 – Accepted: 12 August 2013 – Published: 6 September 2013

Correspondence to: P. Yiou (pascal.yiou@lsce.ipsl.fr)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.





# Abstract

This paper uses a method of atmospheric flow analogues to reconstruct an ensemble of atmospheric variables (namely sea-level pressure, surface temperature and wind speed) between 1781 and 1785. The properties of this ensemble are investigated and
tested against observations of temperature. The goal of the paper is to assess whether the atmospheric circulation during the Laki volcanic eruption (in 1783) and the subsequent winter were similar to the conditions that prevailed in the winter 2009/2010 and during spring 2010. We find that the three months following the Laki eruption in June 1783 barely have analogues in 2010. The cold winter of 1783/1784 yields circulation was responsible for the cold winter of 1783/1784, of the relatively short memory of the atmospheric circulation.

### 1 Introduction and motivation

The goal of this paper is to propose an ensemble of meteorological reconstructions <sup>15</sup> around the North Atlantic from a gridded dataset of sea-level pressure that was obtained from early instrumental observations. This reconstruction is built on a technique of flow analogues that has been used in various contexts to analyse the atmospheric circulation (Lorenz, 1969; Zorita and von Storch, 1999; Vautard and Yiou, 2009).

The synoptic variability of the atmospheric circulation during the past centuries has
 <sup>20</sup> been extensively studied from early instrumental records and proxy reconstructions (Cook et al., 1998; Jones et al., 1999; Luterbacher et al., 2002; Jacobeit et al., 2003). Such studies have attempted to reconstruct one trajectory of the climate system, given sometimes loose boundary and initial conditions. It is striking that very few reconstructions of the atmospheric circulation over the North Atlantic agree on periods preceding
 <sup>25</sup> 1850 AD (Souriau and Yiou, 2001), mainly because of the lack of geographical con-

straints. Indeed, such reconstructions rely on one or two proxy records (Appenzeller





et al., 1998; Cook et al., 1998; Luterbacher et al., 1999), while the North Atlantic circulation spatial structure exhibits a complexity that can hardly be captured by just two locations (Hurrell et al., 2003; Kimoto and Ghil, 1993; Michelangeli et al., 1995; Jacobeit et al., 2003, e.g.). Hence it can be argued that it is necessary to obtain ensembles of reconstructed trajectories so that the uncertainty of reconstructions can be assessed.

Ensembles of reanalyses for the past two centuries have been proposed by Compo et al. (2011). Such exercises allow to sample this meteorological uncertainty (Palmer, 2002), which is connected to the chaos of atmospheric variability (Lorenz, 1963; Ghil et al., 2008). Here, we propose an alternative approach to produce an ensemble of meteorological conditions for 1781–1785 AD.

The motivation of our study stems from the eruption of the Icelandic volcano Laki in 1783, one of the largest volcanic eruption of the last millennium. The Laki started to erupt in June 1783 and ten eruption episodes followed until February 1784 (Thordarson and Self, 2003), releasing lar amounts of SO<sub>2</sub>, HCl, HF, CO<sub>2</sub> into the atmo-

10

- sphere. Those events killed one third of the population in Iceland. The volcanic sulfate aerosols and gases (sulfur and acids) were reported to travel to continental Europe in the days and weeks that followed the eruptions (Thordarson and Self, 2003). Such sulfate aerosols are believed to have increased mortality rates in Europe to respiratory affections (Desaive et al., 1972; Garnier, 2009a; Schmidt et al., 2011). It is probable that
- volcanic gases also affected public health (Durand and Grattan, 1999; Grattan et al., 2003; Witham and Oppenheimer, 2004). Modelling studies of the tropospheric chemistry transport have suggested that the environmental and health impact of the Laki was connected to dry deposition of sulfate dioxide rather than sulfuric acid (Stevenson et al., 2003).
- Historians have reported that the summer of 1783 had been unusually warm in Western Europe (Garnier, 2009b) and the Eastern USA, although this warmth was not felt in Eastern Europe or Central Asia (Thordarson and Self, 2003). The goal of this paper is to estimate the meteorological conditions that prevailed after the Laki volcanic eruption in 1783, although we do not model the transport of volcanic gases and aerosols.





In March 2010, the Icelandic volcano Eyjafjallajökull erupted, with an explosive phase in April 2010. This caused havoc in air transport, due to the presence of volcanic ash that traveled into continental Europe. Although the type of volcano was different from the Laki, it is interesting to investigate whether the atmospheric circulation conditions

in Spring 2010 were similar to those in Spring 1783, in order to first guess how volcanic aerosols and gases in 1783 could have been transported into Europe. Hence, we first investigate whether the atmospheric circulation of North Atlantic region during the spring of 2010 was similar to the one in spring 1783.

The winter of 1783/1784 has been reported to be particularly cold in Western Europe

- and Eastern USA (Le Roy Ladurie, 2006; Franklin, 1784; Brazdil et al., 2010). This cold winter has sometimes been associated to the Laki eruption in spring (Wood, 1992; Brazdil et al., 2010). D'Arrigo et al. (2011) have compared the winter in 2009/2010, which was a record of cold in North America and extremely cold in Europe, to the 1783/1784 winter, from proxy reconstructions of the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO)
- and the Niño 3 indexes. They conclude that although the atmospheric circulation and temperature patterns were probably similar, it is difficult to attribute a volcanic cause to the cold winter in 1783/1784. Our second issue is to re-examine the similarity between the winters of 1783/1784 and 2009/2010, and investigate the path taken by the climate trajectory between the first Laki eruption to the following winter.

Our analysis relies on a dataset of daily sea-level pressure obtained by Kington (1988). This dataset covers the period between 1781 and 1785 and has a regular grid. We use a methodology of windowed pressure analogues (Yiou et al., 2012) to infer sea-level pressure, temperature and wind fields over the North Atlantic. Such fields are reconstructed from the Kington (1988) SLP data and the NCEP reanalysis (Kalnay)

et al., 1996). The data and methodology are described in Sect. 2. Discussion and conclusion appear in Sect. 4. The results of the SLP, temperature and wind speed reconstructions from analogues are given in Sect. 3. In this section, we also compare the temperature reconstructions with observed temperatures in Western Europe.





## 2 Data and methods

# 2.1 Historical period

We used the gridded sea-level pressure (SLP) dataset of Kington (1988), as our *target* reconstruction set. This dataset is based on  $\approx$  70 early instrumental records from sev-

- <sup>5</sup> eral stations across Europe, from the French Société Royale de Médecine and the Societas Meteorologica Palatina of Mannheim (Kington, 1988, p. 23). The original surface pressure data were converted to SLP by heuristic corrections accounting for estimates of temperature (Kington, 1988). The data was cast on a regular grid (5 by 5°) covering the eastern North Atlantic (Kington, 1988). The data covers the period between
- <sup>10</sup> 1 January 1781 to 30 November 1785, on a daily timescale. The region covered by this dataset is (30° W–30° E; 35–70° N). This dataset was used by studies of the climate impact of the Laki eruption in 1783 (Thordarson and Self, 2003; Schmidt et al., 2011; Oman et al., 2006).

The datafile was provided by Prof. P. D. Jones (CRU, UEA, UK). We performed a
quality check of the data in order to remove outliers and errors in dating codes. We hence verified visually that the datafile we used in this paper conforms to the maps published by Kington (1988). Many homogeneity issues can affect the original data on which this set is built (Peterson et al., 1998; Caussinus and Mestre, 2004). Those issues include potential changes in instruments, location and surroundings. Assessing
the homogeneity of this dataset is out of the scope of this paper, but this issue is a caveat of the study. The methodology to produce the gridded dataset from station data can also induce biases that are difficult to constrain.

For verification purposes, we used observed temperature time series in 10 locations in Europe, covering the Laki period. Although quality checks of the time series were performed, their homogeneity is less constrained than for periods after 1850, when meteorological networks started to thrive in Europe. The French station data (Dijon, La Rochelle, Montmorency and Saint Malo) come from the Société Royale de Médecine (in Paris). The other European station data (Bologna, Copenhagen,





Mannheim, Munich, Prague and Rome)were extracted from the ephemerides of the Societas Meteorologica Palatina of Mannheim. The time series were digitized from the databases at: meteo.academie-medecine.fr and bibliotheque.meteo.fr.

# 2.2 Reanalysis data

- <sup>5</sup> The *base* dataset for our study is the NCEP reanalysis (Kalnay et al., 1996) between 1948 and 2012 on a daily timescale. We used the SLP, surface temperature and wind speed at 1000 hPa for the climate reconstructions. The reanalysis data was extracted over the North Atlantic region (80° W–30° E; 30–70° N), with a spatial resolution of 2.5 by 2.5°. For comparison purposes with the Kington dataset, the NCEP SLP was regrid-10 ded by averaging onto the Kington grid (smaller domain and lower spatial resolution). The effect of the construction is illustrated by a spatial resolution.
  - The effect of the spatial resolution is illustrated in the Supplementary Information movie. We also computed reconstructed fields for surface temperature and surface wind speed from the NCEP data. A land-sea mask was used to estimate continental surface temperature, especially over France.

### 15 2.3 Flow analogues

In this paper, we use the methodology and terminology of Yiou et al. (2012) to obtain atmospheric reconstructions based on analogues. This type of approach was also proposed by Schenk and Zorita (2012) in a different context. The *target* period to be reconstructed is 1781 to 1785, with a constraint on the SLP field of Kington (1988). The

<sup>20</sup> analogues of SLP are computed from the SLP of NCEP reanalysis, which we call the *base* dataset. Contrary to the simple example of Yiou et al. (2012), the base and target datasets cover very different periods of time and yield (at the origin) different spatial resolutions.

In order to reconstruct time continuous sequences, the analogues were computed on moving windows of 5 days. This means that for each sequence of 5 consecutive days between 1781 and 1785, we determine the N = 20 sequences of 5-days in NCEP





that are closer in terms of root mean square (RMS) (Yiou et al., 2012). The quality of the *N* analogues in the NCEP reanalysis "reference set" is estimated a posteriori by their Spearman spatial correlations (von Storch and Zwiers, 2001) with the "target" SLP field of Kington (1988). Hence, the RMS is optimized on 5 day sequences, and the correlation score is computed on daily reconstructions.

5

The choice of the window length is a tradeoff between the regularity of the the reconstruction (hence avoiding too many strong discontinuities in the dates of analogues) and quality of the analogues (in terms of correlation). This choice can be guided by the temporal persistence of atmospheric structures. Synoptic structures generally have an

- <sup>10</sup> average persistence of a few days. We assessed this persistence by estimating the autocorrelation observed in the Kington SLP dataset. For each gridpoint, we computed the autocorrelation function of SLP, with lags between 1 and 20 days (Fig. 1). The median autocorrelations drop rapidly to an asymptotic value near C = 0.18. We bootstrapped the dates in the SLP dataset in order to obtain confidence intervals for the
- <sup>15</sup> "background" auto-correlation of the dataset. We find that a lag of 5 days is the longest window for which more than 75% of the gridpoints yield positive auto-correlations and more than 10% of the gridpoints are below the background autocorrelation. This provides a heuristic way of justifying a window length of W = 5.

The dates of the 20 analogues allow us to make three dimensional reconstructions of the atmospheric flow and temperature for that period. The reconstruction is performed on weighted moving windows of W = 5 days shifted by increments of  $\delta = 2$  days, in order to obtain a temporal continuity of the fields, as argued by Yiou et al. (2012). Each analogue reconstruction can be viewed as a possible trajectory of the climate system that is coherent with SLP conditions. Note that each day in an analogue reconstruction s a weighted average of 2 moving windowed analogues.

The reconstructions we propose have a resolution of 2.5 by 2.5° and cover the whole North Atlantic. In this paper, we chose to reconstruct *anomalies* of SLP, surface temperature and surface wind speed. The anomalies are determined with respect to the 1971–2000 reference period. The reason for not reconstructing *absolute* fields, rather





than anomalies, is that we do not have 30 yr climatologies during the 18th century for all fields (apart from SLP and surface temperature).

# 3 Results

# 3.1 SLP analogues

<sup>5</sup> The SLP reconstruction is compared to the target dataset of Kington (1988) with a resolution of 5 by 5°. We show the scores of the N = 20 analogue reconstructions. RMS and correlation values for daily SLP anomalies are shown in Fig. 2 for each day between 1 January 1781 and 30 September 1785, and for each analogue. The RMS values exhibit a seasonal cycle, with higher values in winter and better scores in summer. The reason for this seasonal cycle is the seasonality of SLP variance in the extra-tropics, as suggested by Yiou et al. (2012).

The correlation values are on average above r = 0.7. We computed the empirical probability distribution of the correlation r of the N analogues and the target SLP (shadings in Fig. 2). We show that SLP analogues that are optimized for RMS can yield very low spatial correlation values (sometimes below 0.4), although the distribution is centered above 0.7 (red line). This is further illustrated in the Supplementary Information (movie) comparing the target dataset and the reconstructions from the daily first and tenth analogues, between 1783 and 1784. The illustration shows that the analogues are optimized over a relatively small proportion of the eastern North Atlantic and Eu-

ropean region. The summers of 1783 and 1784 are the ones with the highest average RMS values (Fig. 2). During those two summers, we find that the analogue reconstructions can yield rather different behaviors and hence low correlation values with the target SLP dataset.

In order to investigate the distribution of the trajectories on which we base the analogue reconstruction, we count the occurence of years from the NCEP reanalysis (covering 1948 to 2012) from the dates of the N = 20 windowed analogues. For a given





day in 1781 to 1785, the years of the analogues are counted only once. This avoids a potential bias when several analogues fall within the same year: for example, if the 20 analogues of a given target day fall on nearby days from the same base year, but this base year never appears in the analogues of the other days of the target month,

this would put an unwanted weight to that year. Then, for each target month (between January 1781 and October 1785), we count the number of occurrences of daily analogue years. A given year in the NCEP reanalysis is picked 5 times on average in the SLP analogues, for the whole period. Unusual frequency of a year in the SLP analogues (higher than 90th percentile) reaches 12 days in a month. We focus on the period encompassing the Laki eruption (1 May 1783 to 30 April1784) (Fig. 3).

We find that the year 2010 is frequently picked in the analogues of May 1783 (Fig. 3), but this is before the Laki eruption. From June to the end of 1783, the frequency of the year 2010 in the analogues never reaches a 90th quantile, and is below the median quantile of frequencies, apart from July, August and December 1783. This implies that the atmospheric circulation of spring 2010 is unlikely to be similar to spring 1783 that witnessed the Laki eruption.

The SLP analogues start to be picked in 2010 in a significant way in October 1783. As suggested in Fig. 3, we verified that from December 1783 to February 1784, the analogue dates are picked between November 2009 and January 2010 in a high pro-

<sup>20</sup> portion (i.e., above the 90th percentile). This can be interpreted by a high correlation between the atmospheric circulation during the winters 1783/1784 and 2009/2010. The latter winter yielded an anomalous negative phase of the North Atlantic Oscillation (Cattiaux et al., 2010; Cohen et al., 2010; D'Arrigo et al., 2011) and underwent extremely cold and snowy conditions.

### 25 3.2 Temperature estimates

15

In this section, we first focus on the 12 month period that includes the Laki eruption, between May 1783 to April 1784 (Fig. 4). The 20 analogues are spatially averaged in order to provide a composite monthly reconstruction of temperature anomalies.





We find warm temperature conditions in May 1783 (right before the first Laki eruption, on 8 June 1783) over Western Europe and Southern Greenland. This warm temperature anomaly intensifies over Western Europe until August 1783. It remains positive until october 1783. This warm anomaly is consistent with the historical records for France

<sup>5</sup> and some parts of Western Europe (Le Roy Ladurie, 2006). It is also consistent with climate model simulations after the Laki eruption (Chenet et al., 2005), although this experiment did not take the radiative response of the Laki gas and aerosol emissions.

The temperature anomaly over Europe becomes negative and increasingly cold between November 1783 and February 1784. This cooling is also found in the North

Eastern US, although not as intense as in Europe. We note that the Western Arctic remains anomalously warm. The cold European and North American cold anomaly is also evidenced by historical records in Europe (Le Roy Ladurie, 2006) and the USA (Franklin, 1784).

The time series of the analogue temperature reconstruction for France between 1781 and 1785 is shown in Fig. 5. The monthly mean of the 20 analogue reconstructions shows the warm anomaly in the summer of 1783 followed by the cold winter anomaly. In this very short time series (less than 5 yr), only 1783 and 1784 yield such a large temperature swing between a warm summer and cold winter in France. This shows that the temperature anomalies are controled by the circulation anomalies.

<sup>20</sup> We compared the analogue temperature anomaly reconstruction with early meteorological observations in France and Europe, between 1781 and 1785. The temperature observations were obtained from the Societé Royale de Médécine de Paris and Societa Mateorologicas Palatina of Mannheim. The data are monthly averaged for 10 stations (Fig. 6). The correlations between the median of 20 analogue reconstructions and the observed series exceeds r = 0.42 (with p values lower than  $5 \times 10^{-3}$ ) for all cities except Bologna, Rome and Dijon. The temperature observations yield a larger variance than the average reconstruction over France. This is due to the spatial averaging in

Fig. 5. The warm anomaly in France in the summer 1783 is well reproduced by the analogue reconstruction. The amplitude of the following winter anomaly is weaker and





lags by two months. The other periods of the reconstructions yield much weaker amplitudes than the observations, although the correlations are significantly positive. One caveat of this comparison is that the homogeneity of the observed temperature times series is barely verified. For example, it has been documented that the thermometer used for La Rochelle record was changed in 1782, from a Sigaud de Lafond thermome-

ter to a Mannheim thermometer (meteo.academie-medecine.fr), whose features could have been different.

The reconstructed temperature anomaly fluctuations over France are coherent with historical chronicles between 1781 and 1785 (Le Roy Ladurie, 1971, 2006; Garnier, 2009b). These historical qualitative compilations (partly based on diaries and crop/harvest yields) suggest this sequence of warm summers and cold winters during those five years.

This result suggests that the atmospheric circulation played a major role in the summer temperature variation in 1783. This role seems less clear in the years that precede and follow the Laki eruption. But this conclusion should be moderated by the low num-

<sup>15</sup> and follow the Laki eruption. But this conclusion should be moderated by the low number of observations before 1783.

### 3.3 Wind estimates

10

We computed 1000 and 500 hPa wind anomaly reconstructions from SLP analogues for the 12 months following the first Laki eruption (Figs. 7 and 8). Such anomalies are
<sup>20</sup> superimposed over a generally northeastward flow. The wind anomaly reconstructions in May and July 1783 does not seem favourable to an optimal transport of air masses from Iceland to continental Europe. The conditions in June, August and September seem more favourable to transport from Iceland to western continental Europe. This is coherent with the early observations of Mourgue de Montredon (1783), as pointed out
<sup>25</sup> by Chenet et al. (2005).

The northward flow over the north eastern US explains the warm temperatures that were reconstructed there. The reconstructed wind field over the Labrador region does not explain how volcanic gases from the Laki could be transported directly to the





5168

Eastern US. As found in the experiments of Chenet et al. (2005), our reconstructed field suggests a route around Greenland and the Arctic region.

The winter wind anomaly reconstruction at 1000 hPa indicates anticyclonic circulations conveying cold air from the Arctic to western continental Europe, between Novem-

ber 1783 and February 1784. This explains the cold temperature anomalies recon-5 structed in Fig. 4.

#### Discussion and conclusions 4

20

We have applied a method of analogues of circulation to propose a reconstruction of the daily atmospheric flow conditions and surface temperature between 1781 and 1785. We find that the atmospheric variability explains a significant part of the observed 10 temperature in Europe (r > 0.4 over France, Germany and Denmark). In particular, we find that the very warm summer and cold winter in Europe and East US, after the Laki eruption can be explained by the atmospheric circulation variability. This result is robust to the 20 analogue trajectories, which all correspond to this warm to cold temperature oscillation. 15

We emphasise that only *anomalies* of meteorological variables are reconstructed by this method. The absolute fields can be obtained once a background climatology is determined. This can be done from monthly reconstructions (Luterbacher et al., 2002; Jacobeit et al., 2003) during the 18th century or a contemporary climatology (from a reanalysis), so that the differences can be very large. This means that the wind transport inference is qualitative (or else strong hypotheses need to be formulated).

The results on temperature reconstructions are coherent with historical and proxy records in Europe, especially during the Laki eruption period. D'Arrigo et al. (2011) suggested that the winter conditions in 1783/1784 resembled those of the 2009/2010 winter. Our analysis confirms this inference, although the 1783/1784 winter was not as 25 cold as 2009/2010, at least in France.





This paper shows that the atmospheric circulation trajectory that lead to the cold winter in 1783/1784 does not stem from spring-summer-early fall conditions in 2009, because the dates of analogues are mostly picked in other years than 2009. The distribution of the dates of analogues shows that even though some years can be dominat-

- <sup>5</sup> ing the analogue distributions, the seasonal variability does not follow a consistent path throughout a year, and there is no link between the spring and following winter atmospheric conditions that could be identified from the dates of analogues. Therefore, if we admit that the winter of 2009/2010 is analogous to the winter of 1783/1784 in terms of atmospheric circulation and temperature, the paths that lead to such conditions were
- rather different in both cases because the Fall seasons preceding the cold winters of 1783 and 2009 have no striking analogues. Hence we find unlikely that the the cold winter in 1783/1784 was caused by the Laki volcanic eruption, because the "memory" of the atmospheric circulation ranges between 5 days to a couple of weeks (Fig. 1).

We have produced an ensemble of analogue reconstructions for SLP, temperature and wind speed over the North Atlantic, with a daily time scale and the spatial resolution of the NCEP reanalysis. Other variables have been produced for instance at various pressure levels (as was tested by Yiou et al., 2012). Those variables include temperatures, geopotential height, wind speed and relative humidity. Such a production can be used to constrain a chemistry transport model in order to investigate the trajectories of volcanic aerosols from Iceland to Europe.

Acknowledgements. We thank P. D. Jones for providing the datafiles for the Kington SLP data and the German national meteorological service (DWD) for providing the images of Ephemerides Societatis Meteorologicae Palatinae. This work was supported by the French ANR CEP project CHEDAR. All computations were performed with the R language (http://www.r-project.org).





The publication of this article is financed by CNRS-INSU.

### References

- Appenzeller, C., Stocker, T., and Anklin, M.: North Atlantic oscillation dynamics recorded in Greenland ice cores, Science, 282, 446-449, 1998. 5158 5
- Brazdil, R., Demaree, G. R., Deutsch, M., Garnier, E., Kiss, A., Luterbacher, J., Macdonald, N., Rohr, C., Dobrovolny, P., Kolar, P., and Chroma, K.: European floods during the winter 1783/1784: scenarios of an extreme event during the 'Little Ice Age', Theor. Appl. Climatol., 100, 163-189, doi:10.1007/s00704-009-0170-5, 2010. 5160
- Cattiaux, J., Vautard, R., Cassou, C., Yiou, P., Masson-Delmotte, V., and Codron, F.: Winter 2010 in Europe: A cold extreme in a warming climate, Geophys. Res. Lett., 37, doi:10.1029/2010gl044613, 2010. 5165

Caussinus, H. and Mestre, O.: Detection and correction of artificial shifts in climate series, J. Roy. Stat. Soc. C, 53, 405-425, 2004. 5161

Chenet, A. L., Fluteau, F., and Courtillot, V.: Modelling massive sulphate aerosol pollution, 15 following the large 1783 Laki basaltic eruption, Earth Planet. Sc. Lett., 236, 721-731, 2005. 5166, 5167, 5168

Cohen, J., Foster, J., Barlow, M., Saito, K., and Jones, J.: Winter 2009-2010: A case study of an extreme Arctic Oscillation event, Geophys. Res. Lett., 37, L17707, doi:10.1029/2010gl044256, 2010. 5165

- Compo, G., Whitaker, J., Sardeshmukh, P., Matsui, N., Allan, R., Yin, X., Gleason, B., Vose, R., Rutledge, G., Bessemoulin, P., Brönnimann, S., Brunet, M., Crouthamel, R., Grant, A., Groisman, P., Jones, P., Kruk, M., Kruger, A., Marshall, G., Maugeri, M., Mok, H., Nordli, O., Ross, T., Trigo, R., Wang, X., Woodruff, S., and Worley, S.: The Twentieth Century Reanalysis Project, Q. J. Roy. Meteorol. Soc., 137, 1–28, doi:10.1002/gj.776, 2011. 5159
- iscussion Paper CPD 9, 5157-5182, 2013 Circulation analogues for climate reconstructions Discussion Paper (1781–1785 AD) P. Yiou et al. **Title Page** Introduction Abstract Discussion Paper Conclusions References Tables Figures Back Close **Discussion** Paper Full Screen / Esc **Printer-friendly Version** Interactive Discussion



25

20

Cook, E., D'Arrigo, R., and Briffa, K.: A reconstruction of the North Atlantic Oscillation using tree-ring chronologies from North America and Europe, Holocene, 8, 9–17, 1998. 5158, 5159

D'Arrigo, R., Seager, R., Smerdon, J. E., LeGrande, A. N., and Cook, E. R.: The anomalous

- winter of 1783–1784: Was the Laki eruption or an analog of the 2009–2010 winter to blame?, Geophys. Res. Lett., 38, L05706, doi:10.1029/2011GL046696, 2011. 5160, 5165, 5168
  - Desaive, J., Goubert, J., Le Roy Ladurie, E., Meyer, J., Muller, O., and Peter, J.: Médecins, Climat et Epidémies á la Fin du XVIIème Siècle, Mouton & Co et Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes, Paris, 1972. 5159
- Durand, M. and Grattan, J.: Extensive respiratory health effects of volcanogenic dry fog in 1783 inferred from European documentary sources, Environ.I Geochem. Health, 21, 371–376, doi:10.1023/A:1006700921208, 1999. 5159

Franklin, B.: Meteorological imaginations and conjectures, vol. 2, Manchester Lit. Philos. Soc. Mem. Proc., Manchester, 373–377, 1784. 5160, 5166

Garnier, E.: Laki: une catastrophe européenne, l'Histoire, 343, 72–77, 2009a. 5159
 Garnier, E.: Les dérangements du temps: 500 Ans de chaud et de froid en Europe, Plon, Paris, 2009b. 5159, 5167

Ghil, M., Chekroun, M., and Simonnet, E.: Climate dynamics and fluid mechanics: Natural variability and related uncertainties, Physica D, 237, 2111–2126, 2008. 5159

- Grattan, J., Durand, M., and Taylor, S.: Illness and elevated human mortality in Europe coincident with the Laki Fissure eruption, Volcan. Degass., 213, 401–414, doi:10.1144/Gsl.Sp.2003.213.01.24, 2003. 5159
  - Hurrell, J., Kushnir, Y., Ottersen, G., and Visbeck, M. (Eds.): The North Atlantic Oscillation: Climatic Significance and Environmental Impact, in: vol. 134 of Geophysical monograph, American Geophysical Union, Washington, D.C., 2003. 5159
  - Jacobeit, J., Wanner, H., Luterbacher, J., Beck, C., Philipp, A., and Sturm, K.: Atmospheric circulation variability in the North-Atlantic-European area since the mid-seventeenth century, Clim. Dynam., 20, 341–352, 2003. 5158, 5159, 5168

25

Jones, P., Davies, T., Lister, D., Slonosky, V., Jonsson, T., Barring, L., Jonsson, P., Maheras, P.,

Kolyva-Machera, F., Barriendos, M., Martin-Vide, J., Rodriguez, R., Alcoforado, M., Wanner, H., Pfister, C., Luterbacher, J., Rickli, R., Schuepbach, E., Kaas, E., Schmith, T., Jacobeit, J., and Beck, C.: Monthly mean pressure reconstructions for Europe for the 1780–1995 period, Int. J. Climatol., 19, 347–364, 1999. 5158



- Kalnay, E., Kanamitsu, M., Kistler, R., Collins, W., Deaven, D., Gandin, L., Iredell, M., Saha, S., White, G., Woollen, J., Zhu, Y., Chelliah, M., Ebisuzaki, W., Higgins, W., Janowiak, J., Mo, K., Ropelewski, C., Wang, J., Leetmaa, A., Reynolds, R., Jenne, R., and Joseph, D.: The NCEP/NCAR 40-year reanalysis project, B. Am. Meteorol. Soc., 77, 437–471, 1996. 5160, 5162
- Kimoto, M. and Ghil, M.: Multiple flow regimes in the Northern-hemisphere winter, 1. Methodology and hemispheric regimes, J. Atmos. Sci., 50, 2625–2643, 1993. 5159

5

15

- Kington, J.: The weather of the 1780s over Europe, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, New York, 1988. 5160, 5161, 5162, 5163, 5164, 5174, 5175
- Le Roy Ladurie, E.: Times of feast, times of famine: a history of climate since the year 1000, translated by Barbara Bray illus., facsims, maps 24 cm, A rev. and updated English version of the author's Histoire du climat depuis l'an mil, originally published in 1967, Doubleday, Garden City, N.Y., 1971. 5167

Le Roy Ladurie, E.: Histoire Humaine et Comparée du Climat, Disettes et Révolutions 1740– 1860, Favard, Paris, 2006, 5160, 5166, 5167

Lorenz, E. N.: Deterministic nonperiodic flow, J. Atmos. Sci., 20, 130–141, 1963. 5159 Lorenz, E. N.: Atmospheric Predictability as Revealed by Naturally Occurring Analogues, J. Atmos. Sci., 26, 636–646, 1969. 5158

Luterbacher, J., Schmutz, C., Gyalistras, D., Xoplaki, E., and Wanner, H.: Reconstruction of

- <sup>20</sup> monthly NAO and EU indices back to AD 1675, Geophys. Res. Lett., 26, 2745–2748, 1999. 5159
  - Luterbacher, J., Xoplaki, E., Dietrich, D., Rickli, R., Jacobeit, J., Beck, C., Gyalistras, D., Schmutz, C., and Wanner, H.: Reconstruction of sea level pressure fields over the Eastern North Atlantic and Europe back to 1500, Clim. Dynam., 18, 545–561, 2002. 5158, 5168
- <sup>25</sup> Michelangeli, P., Vautard, R., and Legras, B.: Weather regimes: Recurrence and quasistationarity, J. Atmos. Sci., 52, 1237–1256, 1995. 5159
  - Mourgue de Montredon, M.: Recherches sur l'origine et sur la nature des vapeurs qui ont régné dans l'atmosphère pendant l'été de 1783, Imprimerie Royale, 1783. 5167

Oman, L., Robock, A., Stenchikov, G. L., Thordarson, T., Koch, D., Shindell, D. T., and Gao,

- C. C.: Modeling the distribution of the volcanic aerosol cloud from the 1783–1784 Laki eruption, J. Geophys. Res.-Atmos., 111, D12209, doi:10.1029/2005JD006899, 2006. 5161
  - Palmer, T. N.: The economic value of ensemble forecasts as a tool for risk assessment: From days to decades, Q. J. Roy. Meteorol. Soc., 128, 747–774, 2002. 5159





- Peterson, T. C., Easterling, D. R., Karl, T. R., Groisman, P., Nicholls, N., Plummer, N., Torok, S., Auer, I., Boehm, R., Gullett, D., Vincent, L., Heino, R., Tuomenvirta, H., Mestre, O., Szentimrey, T., Salinger, J., Forland, E. J., Hanssen-Bauer, I., Alexandersson, H., Jones, P., and Parker, D.: Homogeneity adjustments of in situ atmospheric climate data: A review, Int. J. Climatol., 18, 1493–1517, 1998. 5161
- Climatol., 18, 1493–1517, 1998. 5161
   Schenk, F. and Zorita, E.: Reconstruction of high resolution atmospheric fields for Northern Europe using analog-upscaling, Clim. Past, 8, 1681–1703, doi:10.5194/cp-8-1681-2012, 2012. 5162

Schmidt, A., Ostro, B., Carslawa, K., Wilsona, M., Thordarson, T., Manna, G., and Simmons,

- A.: Excess mortality in Europe following a future Laki-style Icelandic eruption, P. Natl. Acad. Sci., 108, 15710–15715, 2011. 5159, 5161
  - Souriau, A. and Yiou, P.: Grape harvest dates for checking NAO paleoreconstructions, Geophys. Res. Lett., 28, 3895–3898, doi:10.1029/2001GL012870, 2001. 5158
  - Stevenson, D. S., Johnson, C. E., Highwood, E. J., Gauci, V., Collins, W. J., and Derwent, R.
- G.: Atmospheric impact of the 1783–1784 Laki eruption: Part I Chemistry modelling, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 3, 487–507, doi:10.5194/acp-3-487-2003, 2003. 5159
  - Thordarson, T. and Self, S.: Atmospheric and environmental effects of the 1783–1784 Laki eruption: A review and reassessment, J. Geophys. Res.-Atmos., 108, 4011, doi:10.1029/2001jd002042, 2003. 5159, 5161
- Vautard, R. and Yiou, P.: Control of recent European surface climate change by atmospheric flow, Geophys. Res. Lett., 36, L22702, doi:10.1029/2009GL040480, 2009. 5158 von Storch, H. and Zwiers, F. W.: Statistical Analysis in Climate Research, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2001. 5163

Witham, C. S. and Oppenheimer, C.: Mortality in England during the 1783-4 Laki Craters eruption, Bull. Volcanol., 67, 15–26, doi:10.1007/s00445-004-0357-7, 2004. 5159

25

Wood, C.: Climatic effects of the 1783 Laki eruption, in: The Year Without a Summer: World Climate in 1816, chap. Climatic effects of the 1783 Laki eruption, edited by: Harrington, C., Can. Mus. of Nat., Ottawa, 58–77, 1992. 5160

Yiou, P., Salameh, T., Drobinski, P., Menut, L., Vautard, R., and Vrac, M.: Ensemble reconstruction of the atmospheric column from surface pressure using analogues, Clim. Dynam.,

- doi:10.1007/s00382-012-1626-3, in press, 2012. 5160, 5162, 5163, 5164, 5169
  - Zorita, E. and von Storch, H.: The analog method as a simple statistical downscaling technique: Comparison with more complicated methods, J. Climate, 12, 2474–2489, 1999. 5158











**Printer-friendly Version** 

Introduction

References

**Figures** 

Close



**Fig. 2.** Scores (correlation and RMS) of analogues. Upper panel: RMS values between Kington (1988) SLP anomalies and analogues in NCEP, between 1781 and 1785 for each day and all 20 analogues. Each dot represents one day and one analogue. Lower panel: spatial rank correlation between the Kington (1988) SLP anomalies and 20 best analogues from RMS, on monthly averages. The shaded squares represent the probability dstribution of the correlation values (dark greys indicate higher probability) for each month, for 20 analogues and daily reconstructions. The red line represents the monthly mean of Spearman correlations between the first analogue and the Kington SLP anomalies.









**Fig. 3.** Histograms of years of the 20 first analogues (between 1948 and 2012), for the months between May 1783 and April 1784. The 2010 year is outlined in red. The horizontal red lines represent the median frequency of the years of analogues. The horizontal dashed lines are the 10th and 90th quantiles of the frequency of the years of analogues.









Interactive Discussion



**Fig. 5.** Median of 20 surface air temperature anomaly reconstructions for France in 1783–1784 (red line, in °C). The grey squares represent the monthly probability distribution of the 20 analogue reconstructions.









**Printer-friendly Version** 

Interactive Discussion





zontal arrow indicates the wind speed scale (in  $m s^{-1}$ ).



Interactive Discussion