

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Differences between the glacial cycles of Antarctic temperature and greenhouse gases” by A. W. Omta

C. Barbante (Editor)

barbante@unive.it

Received and published: 23 July 2012

Dear Dr Omta, I read with great interest your manuscript entitled “Differences between the glacial cycles of Antarctic temperature and greenhouse gases” submitted to CPD and the comments raised by the three referees. I also carefully considered your responses to the reviewers and the Supplementary Information you uploaded, as well as the mail with additional notes and the attachment you sent me the 7th of July 2012. After reading all the material, I want to draw your attention to the fact that all the reviews suggest that the overall quality of the paper needs to be improved. I agree with the referees when they say that the MS in its present form lacks on novelty and that it has not clear objectives. The discussion of the results should also go more in detail considering other proxies and possibly different time periods and a more robust method

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Interactive
Comment

for the validation of the results. I personally think that the MS present some original thoughts especially when proposing simple statistical methods. I therefore regret to inform you that on the basis of the reports and comments received from the referees and from my independent evaluation, I do not recommend to you to re-submit a revised version to be considered for publication in Climate of the Past. I am sure the information provided by the referees is helpful to you in case you will decide to re-evaluate your data and prepare a new MS. The additional material you provided by mail was not enough convincing on the role of Fourier spectra about the causal relationship between temperature, CO₂ and obliquity. I do not want to post the documents you sent me for a better evaluation of the MS, because I think it may contain some original elaborations that you want to keep for another MS. I thank you for considering Climate of the Past for publishing your research work. Best Regards, Carlo Barbante

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 8, 987, 2012.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

