

Interactive comment on “Madagascar corals reveal Pacific multidecadal modulation of rainfall since 1708” by C. A. Grove et al.

N. Abram (Editor)

nerilie.abram@anu.edu.au

Received and published: 9 May 2012

Dear Craig Grove and co-authors,

The Climate of the Past discussion phase for your paper “Madagascar corals reveal Pacific multidecadal modulation of rainfall since 1708” has now closed. Your paper has received comments from two reviewers who raise substantial concerns about your manuscript as it is currently written, that would need to be adequately addressed before publication in Climate of the Past could be considered.

Summarising the major points of the reviewers, a revised paper would need to have a more thorough analysis and presentation of the raw coral data before moving into comparisons and discussion of the record with climate systems such as the PDO. Compar-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



[Interactive
Comment](#)

ison with the PDO or other climate systems would also need to be more thorough and include comparisons with more than one PDO reconstruction. As an editorial comment I also have a question about whether the multidecadal connection to the PDO that is drawn from the Madagascar corals should be such a large focus of this paper. From figure 2 it is clear that only a very small magnitude of variability is explained by the 50-70year filter, and from figure 3 that the multidecadal variability is not a significant feature of the coral spectrum.

If you feel that you can suitably revise the paper to address the reviewer comments then the next stage of the review process requires you to prepare a revised manuscript and detailed response to each of the reviewer comments that also outlines the changes made to the manuscript. I would imagine that this will involve major revisions to your manuscript and so if you need additional time to complete this beyond the deadline set by the Climate of the Past system then please don't hesitate to contact me or the editorial staff for a time extension.

Sincerely, Nerilie Abram

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, 8, 787, 2012.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)