

***Interactive comment on “Stable isotopic evidence of El Niño-like atmospheric circulation in the Pliocene Western United States” by M. J. Winnick et al.***

**A. M. Haywood (Editor)**

eamah@leeds.ac.uk

Received and published: 18 February 2013

The authors are invited to prepare and submit a revised version of their manuscript, but the comments of reviewer 2 will require careful consideration and action as there is a lot of wisdom in the specific comments made. They are very useful for ensuring that the conclusions are not overstated and are as robust as they possibly can be.

Alan Haywood.

---

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 8, 5083, 2012.