

Interactive comment on “Hominin responses to environmental changes during the Middle Pleistocene in Central and Southern Italy” by R. Orain et al.

D. Magri

donatella.magri@uniroma1.it

Received and published: 16 November 2012

This is a very interesting review paper. It is synthetical, informative and critical, pleasant to read and well-organized. The palynological part (I am interested in) is complete and updated.

I do not have important changes to suggest, but only one point to discuss: at page 5189, line 2, *Cedrus* is reported as absent from central Italy since MIS 2. In Fig. 4 it is discontinuously represented with frequencies always <2%, which is a value not testifying to a local presence, given the dispersal ability of the pollen of *Cedrus*. Similar frequencies were found also in the long pollen records of the Velay, where there is

C2407

no doubt that *Cedrus* was locally absent. As far as I know, in no place in Europe *Cedrus* shows percentages >2% after approx. 700 ka and the age of its disappearance appears very uncertain (Magri D., *Annali di Botanica* 2012, 2: 57-66). I do not think that this subject should be discussed in the Ms., but possibly the sentence at page 5189 may be more cautious.

Minor changes: p. 5182, l. 7: more favorable than? p. 5183, l. 23: including Western Europe p. 5184, l. 23: relatively high p. 5185, l. 8: records abundant p. 5186, l. 4: been dated p. 5186, l. 17: 39 and 40 superscripts p. 5187, l. 10: remains discovered p. 5187, l. 14: belongs to p. 5187, l. 17: Polledrara di Ceganibbio p. 5187, l. 2: number p. 5187, l. 4: Apennines p. 5187, l. 13: Aucelli et al., 2011 is not in the reference list p. 5187, l. 23: mild p. 5189, l. 16: the quotation (Bertini, 2010; Corrado and Magri, 2011; Manzi et al., 2011; Orain et al., 2012) may be eliminated as it is reported again two lines later p. 5190, l. 15: target p. 5190, l. 22: at Loreto p. 5193, l. 1: the climate of Northern Italy p. 5193, l. 13: may have constituted p. 5193, l. 23: could be a consequence p. 5193, l. 26: formation p. 5195, l. 26 : granting p. 5197, l. 3 : Di Stefano, G., Tagliacozzo p. 5198, l. 5: Palaeocl., Palaeocol. p. 5199, l. 4: Pleistocene uplift p. 5200, l. 32: Palombo Fig. 1: Valle di Castiglione p. 5202, l. 5: platform Fig. 4: the names of the pollen sites represented should be indicated on the diagram, e.g. on the right side of the diagram.

Donatella Magri

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 8, 5181, 2012.

C2408