

Interactive comment on “Lake El’gygytgyn water and sediment balance components overview and its implications for the sedimentary record” by G. Fedorov et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 10 November 2012

Evaluation

In a normal edition of CP I would not recommend the manuscript for publication given (i) its focus on a very specific lake system without transferable aspects, (ii) its presentation of a water and sediment balance without any new tools and without a clear connection to the current limnology or sedimentation in the lake and (iii) the small data set which leads, at best, to a first estimate of the water and sediment balance. However, in a special issue on the sediment record of lake El’gygytgyn it is important to discuss the current water and sediment balance, even if existing data are poor. As a result, I suggest the manuscript for publication in the mentioned special issue of CP, if my

C2322

comments are considered.

Please see attached pdf File for all comments (general, specific and technical)

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/8/C2322/2012/cpd-8-C2322-2012-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 8, 3977, 2012.

C2323