

***Interactive comment on “An automated approach  
for annual layer counting in ice cores” by  
M. Winstrup et al.***

**H. Fischer (Editor)**

hfischer@climate.unibe.ch

Received and published: 4 September 2012

Dear authors

the manuscript has now been seen by two reviewers, which are both in favour of publication of the manuscript after some revisions.

The most important point in this respect is:

The method is now tested against some manually counted age scale in a time window where no absolute dating accuracy can be warranted. Reviewer 1 correctly notes that this shows that the manual counting is well resembled by your method but absolute counting accuracy is not yet illustrated. Reviewer 2 suggests to check the method also in a time window where absolutely dated volcanic markers constrain the dating.

C1439

I strongly urge you to include such a test in a revised version to meet the reviewer comments. Since such a time interval will be from a shallow depth with much higher layer thickness, some clever degrading of the ice core signal before application of your method may be advised.

Along this line the sensitivity tests should be explained in more detail as requested by reviewer 1.

Please provide a point-to-point reply how you plan to meet the reviewer comments.

All the best

Hubertus Fischer

---

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 8, 2519, 2012.