

## ***Interactive comment on “Strength of forest-albedo feedback in mid-Holocene climate simulations” by J. Otto et al.***

**Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 9 May 2011

In this paper, the authors aim at quantifying the role of vegetation in the simulated mid-Holocene (6ka BP) climate. They are using the ECHAM5/JSBACH model and they apply the Stein and Alpert (1993) method to estimate the pure contribution of vegetation and insolation forcing. The method requires to perform four simulations. Unfortunately the experimental design proposed by the author is not correct. The set of experiments to be performed is (1) a reference experiment with pre-industrial forcing (0ka), (2) a control experiment with mid-Holocene forcing (6ka), (3) a simulation with 6ka insolation forcing and prescribed 0ka-vegetation and (4) a simulation with 0ka insolation forcing and prescribed 6ka-vegetation. The experiment number 4 performed by the authors is a simulation with 0ka insolation forcing and prescribed 0ka-vegetation, which is not correct.

---

C426

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 809, 2011.

C427