

Interactive comment on “Correlation of Greenland ice-core isotope profiles and the terrestrial record of the Alpine Rhine glacier for the period 32–15 ka” by M. G. G. De Jong et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 11 February 2012

I thank the authors for their detailed comments.

I still find that the 3rd and 4th order divisions are based on subjective interpretation of often subtle details in the data that are often different between cores. The comparison described on page 2 in my original review "In order for the manuscript to make any additions to ..." is still very much needed to make a convincing case that the divisions derived from 2 types of data in 3 cores are indeed internally compatible and makes glaciological sense. I find a division that does not satisfy this to be of extremely limited value. More fundamentally, I have a hard time understanding which criteria the authors use to make 3rd and 4th order divisions (and why some features did not make the cut).

C2638

I also still find that the correlation between Rhone glacier margin movements and the proposed stratigraphic division is a weak point, and the authors did not really comment my statement that "Within the combined errorbars of the ice core dating and the 14C dating and calibration, many other ways of "equating" level 3 and 4 stratigraphical units with the Rhine glacier events are possible, and no argument is made why the proposed assignment is superior." In my view, it is not sufficient to propose that the patterns of climate change were synchronous between Rhine and Greenland when the dating ties are not in place to support this proposal and the proposed "equation" of events does not seem to be better than other possible choices.

I uphold my recommendation and await the editor's decision. Should the editor decide to accept a revised manuscript, I will be willing to enter a dialogue on how best to address the issues raised above and in my original review.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 4335, 2011.

C2639