

Interactive comment on “An open-database of Grape Harvest dates for climate research: data description and quality assessment” by V. Daux et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 21 December 2011

The study of Daux and co-authors entitled "An open-database of Grape Harvest dates for climate research: data description and quality assessment" presents a comprehensive dataset of Grape Harvest Dates (GHD) for France and adjacent areas back to Medieval times. The study assesses the quality of extremely important documentary evidence for paleoclimate reconstructions. Moreover, the supplementary file is a perfect example of accompanying data and data descriptions that are very valuable and essential for scientific credibility. This paper contains no breakthrough methods nor results, but the access to high-quality raw data is essential for follow-up work for anyone.

C2115

I suggest to publish this manuscript with minor revisions that have more the character of editorial remarks.

General remark: no. Congratulations to this interdisciplinary group effort.

Minor remarks:

Title: is "open-database" catchy and precise enough? In case of changes, use the same term also in the first sentence of the abstract.

Abstract, L5 ff.: include the temporal coverage of the data and give a mean series length and a mean ratio of observations/series length. L18: "quality of the GHD series". For what? Elaborate here.

P3825 Delete the last paragraph of the abstract. If not include the webaddress here.

P3826 L9: omit decimals for lon/lat descriptions. L14: start a new paragraph

P3827 I'm not sure how the spelling and naming of laws are correct. Please check with a native speaker.

P3828 L15: check sentence structure. Very complicated now.

P3829 L7: do you plan to make accessible the original documents in the internet? I hope so. Please explain here. L8: check spelling of reference and brackets.

P3831 Consider www.ncdc.noaa.gov/paleo/phenology.html for making the data accessible and note here.

P3832 L13/14: add more examples of "special conditions" L22/23: "aggregated"??? I have no clue how you treated the data here.

P3834 L5: highlight the 8 selected series in Table 1. Bold face, star symbol...

Table 1: Consider adding one line at the bottom of the table with average values.

Fig 2: Consider landscape format and larger printing area. Include a horizontal refer-

C2116

ence to link time the series with the corresponding y-lab.

Fig 4: Include significance level as a line for easier reading.

Fig 5 Use same graphics as in Fig 4. Dots are hard to read.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 3823, 2011.