

***Interactive comment on “The quantitative reconstruction of the paleoclimate between 5200 and 4300 cal yr BP in the Tianshui Basin, NW China” by N. Sun and X. Q. Li***

**M. Claussen (Editor)**

martin.claussen@zmaw.de

Received and published: 30 November 2011

Two referees have reviewed the paper by Sun and Li. The first review is positive in general. The second review, however, raises serious concerns. (1) The scope of the study seems to be unclear, (2)+(3)+(4) the validity of the approach is questioned, and (5) references to quantitative information is missing. If the decision on acceptance of the paper would depend on the second review only, then the paper should be rejected. With the more favourable first review, however, I encouraged the authors to meticulously revise their discussion paper and to carefully respond the reviewers' comment. The revised version of the paper will be reviewed by the second reviewer.

---

C1936

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 2741, 2011.

C1937