

Interactive comment on “Volcanic and ENSO effects in China in simulations and reconstructions: Tambora eruption 1815” by D. Zhang et al.

P. Brohan (Editor)

philip.brohan@metoffice.gov.uk

Received and published: 16 September 2011

Dear authors.

You have received two reviewer's comments on your paper, and both are agreed on some important limitations in your analysis. In particular, to make good use of the COSMOS ensemble it is necessary to do much more detailed and extensive work considering previous simulations and reconstructions - placing your results in the context of prior work.

Your response to the reviewers does a good job of dealing with their superficial recommendations, in particular adding substantially to the reference list. But it does not

C1413

address the fundamental limitations pointed out by the reviewers - that would require re-visiting your whole analysis, looking at how the COSMOS results should be interpreted in the light of more simulations and reconstructions. This is a much more major revision than you have so far attempted.

In the light of the critical reviews, I do not encourage the submission of a revised version of this paper; I think you would do better to re-visit your analysis and then submit a new paper.

Best regards,

Philip Brohan.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 2061, 2011.