Clim. Past Discuss., 7, C1066–C1067, 2011 www.clim-past-discuss.net/7/C1066/2011/ © Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Hydrological variability in northern Levant over the past 250 ka" *by* F. Gasse et al.

M. Fuchs (Editor)

markus.fuchs@uni-bayreuth.de

Received and published: 11 July 2011

Dear Dr. Vidal,

thank you for your replies to both of the reviews. As you already recognized, both reviews raise a series of critical remarks. In my opinion, the manuscript potentially shows important aspects of paleoclimate and climate change in the Levanteand therefore I would suggest a revision and re-submission of the manuscript.

In case of a re-submission, please follow the reviewer's suggestions and focus especially on the following aspects:

• There is a strong need to focus on the new aspects of your manuscript. This

C1066

has to be stressed in the introduction and also in the discussion and conclusion chapter.

- To avoid redundancies, focus on the presentation and critical discussion of the multi-proxy approach.
- Discuss the aspects of tuning the paleoclimate interpretation in a much more critical way or delete this section in the manuscript
- The correlation of your data with e.g. the sapropels need to be discussed more critically.
- I agree with the comment of reviewer 2: Its significance is therefore in how these different data sets pollen, stable isotopes, sedimentology are integrated. I am not sure that this potential for integration is fully developed in the present manuscript. Nor do I feel comfortable with the way that the study is contextualised and justified, and hence the wider conclusions that can be drawn. This critical comment need to be considered in a revised version of the manuscript.

If you think about a re-submission, please follow in detail the given advices.

If you have any further questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Markus Fuchs

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 1511, 2011.