Clim. Past Discuss., 7, 1797–1824, 2011 www.clim-past-discuss.net/7/1797/2011/ doi:10.5194/cpd-7-1797-2011 © Author(s) 2011. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal Climate of the Past (CP). Please refer to the corresponding final paper in CP if available.

Holocene evolution of the Southern Hemisphere westerly winds in transient simulations with global climate models

V. Varma¹, M. Prange^{1,2}, U. Merkel², T. Kleinen³, G. Lohmann⁴, M. Pfeiffer⁴, H. Renssen⁵, A. Wagner^{1,4}, S. Wagner⁶, and M. Schulz^{1,2}

¹Faculty of Geosciences, University of Bremen, 28334 Bremen, Germany ²MARUM – Center for Marine Environmental Sciences, University of Bremen, 28334 Bremen, Germany

³Max Planck Institute for Meteorology, 20146 Hamburg, Germany

⁴Alfred Wegener Institute for Polar and Marine Research, 27568 Bremerhaven, Germany

⁵Department of Earth Sciences, Faculty of Earth and Life Sciences, VU University Amsterdam, 1081HV Amsterdam, The Netherlands

⁶HZG Centre for Materials and Coastal Research, 21502 Geesthacht, Germany

Received: 23 May 2011 - Accepted: 25 May 2011 - Published: 30 May 2011

Correspondence to: V. Varma (vvarma@marum.de)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.

Discussion Par	CPD 7, 1797–1824, 2011			
per Discussion	Holocene of the S Hemis V. Varn	Holocene evolution of the Southern Hemisphere V. Varma et al.		
	Title	Title Page		
Ē.	Abstract	Introduction		
_	Conclusions	References		
iscussi	Tables	Figures		
on P	I.∢	۶I		
aner	•			
_	Back	Close		
Discu	Full Screen / Esc			
ssion	Printer-friendly Version			
Pane	Interactive Discussion			
, C				

Abstract

The Southern Hemisphere Westerly Winds (SWW) have been suggested to exert a critical influence on global climate through wind-driven upwelling of deep water in the Southern Ocean and the potentially resulting atmospheric CO₂ variations. The investi-

- ⁵ gation of the temporal and spatial evolution of the SWW along with forcings and feedbacks remains a significant challenge in climate research. In this study, the evolution of the SWW under orbital forcing from the mid-Holocene (7 kyr BP) to pre-industrial modern times (250 yr BP) is examined with transient experiments using the comprehensive coupled global climate model CCSM3. In addition, a model inter-comparison is carried
- out using orbitally forced Holocene transient simulations from four other coupled global climate models. Analyses and comparison of the model results suggest that the annual and seasonal mean SWW were subject to an overall strengthening and poleward shifting trend during the course of the mid-to-late Holocene under the influence of orbital forcing, except for the austral spring season, where the SWW exhibited an opposite trend of shifting towards the equator.

1 Introduction

Mid-latitude westerly winds belong to the prominent features of the global tropospheric circulation. The present day positions of the Southern Hemisphere Westerly Winds (SWW) during austral summer (December-January-February) and winter (June-July-

- ²⁰ August) are illustrated in Fig. 1. The SWW dominate climate dynamics and influence the precipitation patterns between ~30° S and 70° S (e.g. Thresher, 2002; Shulmeister et al., 2004). Changes in strength and position of the SWW may affect the large-scale Atlantic hydrography and circulation through the impact on the Indian-Atlantic Ocean water exchange by Agulhas leakage (Sijp and England, 2009; Biastoch et al., 2009).
- ²⁵ Furthermore, it has been suggested that the SWW exert a crucial influence on the global ocean circulation through wind-driven upwelling of deep water in the South-



ern Ocean (Toggweiler and Samuels, 1995; Kuhlbrodt et al., 2007; Sijp and England, 2009). The potentially resulting influence on atmospheric CO₂ variations on orbital timescales has been controversially discussed (Toggweiler et al., 2006; Menviel et al., 2008; Tschumi et al., 2008; Anderson et al., 2009; Moreno et al., 2010; d'Orgeville et al., 2010). Therefore, understanding the variability and the impact of various forcings on the SWW remains a significant area of investigation.

The variability of the SWW on glacial-interglacial timescales has been discussed in some earlier works, in which contradicting results regarding the direction of meridional shift of the mean wind were presented. While some climate modelling studies suggested a poleward shift in storm tracks and SWW during the Last Glacial Maximum

- 10 gested a poleward shift in storm tracks and SWW during the Last Glacial Maximum (Valdes, 2000; Wyroll et al., 2000; Kitoh et al., 2001; Shin et al., 2003), other models simulated an equatorward (Kim et al., 2003) or no latitudinal displacement, but rather an intensification (Otto-Bliesner et al., 2006) of the mean westerlies. Likewise, proxybased reconstructions of the glacial SWW provided contradictory views with claims of
- a poleward displacement (e.g. Markgraf, 1987; Markgraf et al., 1992) standing in contrast to evidence of an equatorward shift (e.g. Heusser, 1989; Lamy et al., 1998, 1999; Shulmeister et al., 2004) compared to the pre-industrial conditions. Lamy et al. (2010) suggested that past variations in the SWW were not only characterized by latitudinal shifts but also by expansions and contractions of the wind belt. During the deglacial peak warmth in Antarctica (~12–9 kyr ago), they provided evidence for a minimal lati-
- tudinal extent of the belt, analogous to its present-day summer configuration.

An important forcing of global climate on longer time scales is accomplished by changes in the seasonal insolation caused by the varying Earth orbital parameters. This astronomical forcing is generally regarded as a dominant factor for glacial-

interglacial climate changes (Milankovitch, 1941; Hays et al., 1976; Berger, 1978; Imbrie et al., 1992). Although the climate of the Holocene is generally being considered as relatively stable compared to the last glacial (e.g. Grootes and Stuiver, 1997), it has also been suggested that there have been long-term trends in the spatial and temporal patterns of surface temperature during the Holocene (e.g. Battarbee and Binney,



2008). A considerable variation in the seasonal and latitudinal distribution of insolation, especially a decrease in austral winter-spring insolation accompanied by an increase in austral summer-fall insolation, can be observed between 7 kyr BP and present day (Fig. 2). These changes in seasonal insolation might have caused long-term variations

- ⁵ in the structure, position and intensity of the SWW on multi-millennial timescales (e.g. Markgraf et al., 1992; Lamy et al., 2001; Jenny et al., 2003; Lamy et al., 2010). The aim of this study is to analyze the response of the SWW to the changes in insolation during the mid-to-late Holocene using transient experiments with the comprehensive global climate model CCSM3. In addition, we compare this simulated Holocene evolu-
- tion of the SWW under orbital forcing with transient experiments from a range of other global climate models. The analyses will lead us to the suggestion that the annual and seasonal mean SWW experienced a poleward shifting trend in general – except for the austral spring season – during the course of the Holocene under orbital forcing, consistently in all climate models used for this inter-comparison.

15 2 Methods

To study the Holocene evolution of SWW under the influence of orbital forcing, transient experiments have been carried out using the comprehensive global climate model CCSM3 (Community Climate System Model version 3). NCAR's (National Center for Atmospheric Research) CCSM3 is a state-of-the-art fully coupled model, composed of four separate components representing atmosphere, ocean, land and sea-ice (Collins et al., 2006). Here, we employ the low-resolution version described in detail by Yeager et al. (2006). In this version the resolution of the atmospheric component is given by T31 (3.75° transform grid), with 26 layers in the vertical, while the ocean has a nominal resolution of 3° (like the sea-ice component) with refined meridional resolution (0.9°) around the equator and a vertical resolution of 25 levels.



2.1 Experimental setup for CCSM3

From a pre-industrial equilibrium simulation (Merkel et al., 2010), the model was integrated for 400 yr with conditions representing 9 kyr BP orbital forcing to reach a new quasi-equilibrium. After this spin-up, transient experiments were carried out by apply-

- ing an acceleration (by a factor of 10) to the orbital forcing year until present day. The underlying assumptions for the application of this acceleration technique are that orbital forcing operates on much longer timescales (> millennia) than those inherent in the atmosphere and surface mixed layer of the ocean (months to years), and that climate changes related to long-term variability of the thermohaline circulation during the
- time period considered are negligible in comparison with orbitally-driven surface temperature variations (Lorenz and Lohmann, 2004; Lorenz et al., 2006). Climate trends of the last 9000 yr, imposed by the external orbitally driven insolation changes, are represented in the experiments with only 900 simulation years with the application of acceleration by a factor 10. Thus, it was possible to conduct three Holocene transient
- experiments with different initial conditions within the available computer resources. While the first transient run was initialized with the quasi-equilibrated 9 kyr BP state, the second and third transient runs used the 8.9 and 8.8 kyr BP climates from the first transient run as initial conditions at 9 kyr BP. Throughout the Holocene experiments, greenhouse gas concentrations as well as aerosol and ozone distributions were kept
- at pre-industrial values as prescribed by the protocol of the Paleoclimate Modelling Intercomparison Project (PMIP), Phase II (Braconnot et al., 2007). Besides, variations in the Sun's output of energy and changes in continental ice-sheets were ignored such that variations in the orbital parameters were the sole external forcing in the model simulations.

25 2.2 Model inter-comparison

In addition to our CCSM3 experiments, results from five other Holocene transient climate model simulations are analyzed here in order to study the evolution of the SWW



under insolation changes. These models are ECHO-G (Lorenz and Lohmann, 2004; Wagner et al., 2007), COSMOS (Pfeiffer and Lohmann, 2011), ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE (Renssen et al., 2009) and CLIMBER2-LPJ (Kleinen et al., 2010). As in the CCSM3 transient runs, all these models have been forced by orbital variations only, keeping greenhouse gas concentrations constant at their pre-industrial levels. A short and very general overview of these simulations is given below and detailed descriptions are available from the given references.

2.2.1 ECHO-G (I)

5

Holocene climate has been simulated using the coupled atmosphere-ocean general
 circulation model ECHO–G (Legutke and Voss, 1999). The atmospheric part of this model is the fourth generation of the European Centre atmospheric model of Hamburg (ECHAM4, Roeckner et al., 1996). The prognostic variables are calculated in the spectral domain with a triangular truncation at wave number 30 (T30), which corresponds to a Gaussian longitude–latitude grid of approximately 3.8°. The vertical domain is represented by 19 levels. The ocean model includes a dynamic-thermodynamic sea-ice model and is defined on a grid with approximately 2.8° resolution (increased meridional resolution of 0.5° in the tropics to allow a more realistic representation of the ENSO phenomenon) and 20 irregularly spaced levels in the vertical. Acceleration by a factor 10 has been applied to the orbital forcing in these experiments to produce a two-member ensemble of transient Holocene runs covering the last 7000 vr (Lorenz

²⁰ two-member ensemble of transient Holocene runs covering the last 7000 yr (Lorenz and Lohmann, 2004).

2.2.2 ECHO-G (II)

Model and forcing are identical to ECHO-G (I), except for the fact that there is no acceleration applied on the orbital forcing for the Holocene transient run. Comparing the results of the non-accelerated ECHO-G (II) experiment with those from the accelerated

results of the non-accelerated ECHO-G (II) experiment with those from the accelerated ECHO-G (I) allows an assessment of the effect of orbital acceleration on the Holocene simulation of the SWW.



2.2.3 COSMOS

The core of COSMOS consists of the atmosphere model ECHAM5 (Roeckner et al., 2003) and the ocean model MPI-OM (Marsland et al., 2003). For long-term integrations, a low- resolution version of this model is applied with spectral T31 (3.75° trans-

form grid) resolution in the atmosphere and approximately 3° horizontal resolution in the ocean. In the vertical, atmosphere and ocean model grids are defined on 19 and 40 levels, respectively. The ocean model includes a dynamic-thermodynamic sea-ice model with viscous-plastic rheology. A dynamic vegetation module is coupled to the land surface model JSBACH allowing an interactive adaptation of the terrestrial bio sphere to varying climate conditions (Brovkin et al., 2009). Orbital acceleration with a factor 10 has been applied to simulate the past 8000 yr.

Besides the simulations with coupled general circulation models described above, two Holocene runs with Earth system Models of Intermediate Complexity (EMICs) are also included in this study, they being, ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE and CLIMBER2-LPJ.

15 2.2.4 ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE

20

The first EMIC transient run was carried out with version 3 of ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE. The atmospheric component is ECBilt, a quasi-geostrophic model with 3 layers in the vertical and T21 (~5.6°) horizontal resolution (Opsteegh et al., 1998). CLIO is the oceanic component and consists of a free-surface, primitive-equation ocean general circulation model coupled to a dynamic-thermodynamic sea-ice model (Goosse and Fichefet, 1999). CLIO is defined on 20 levels in the vertical and has a 3° horizontal resolution. VECODE interactively simulates the dynamics of trees and grasses (Brovkin et al., 2002). Orbital forcing without acceleration was applied to simulate the past 9000 yr.



2.2.5 CLIMBER2-LPJ

The second EMIC used in this inter-comparison is CLIMBER2-LPJ (Petoukhov et al., 2000). The model consists of a 2.5-dimensional statistical-dynamical atmosphere with a resolution of approximately 51° (longitude) by 10° (latitude), a zonally averaged
 ocean resolving three basins with a latitudinal resolution of 2.5°, and a sea-ice model. CLIMBER2-LPJ also contains dynamic vegetation, oceanic biogeochemistry, a model for marine biota, and a sediment model (Archer, 1996; Brovkin et al., 2002, 2007). The transient simulations were carried out with non-accelerated orbital forcing for the past 8000 yr, keeping greenhouse gas forcing fixed as in the other model experiments to pre-industrial levels.

The model descriptions are summarized in Table 1. The spatial distribution of the annual mean SWW for the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP represented in various models is given in Fig. 1 of the Supplement.

3 Results

- ¹⁵ In this section, we present the simulated insolation-forced SWW Holocene trends for all climate models used for the inter-comparison. As the strength and position of the SWW are strongly related to meridional surface temperature gradients (Brayshaw et al., 2008; Lu et al., 2010; Chen et al., 2010) we will also analyse the modelled trends in surface temperature. In order to have a time period of comparison which is common
- for all model simulations, all analyses are done for the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP. For CCSM3 and ECHO-G (I) we have used the three-member and two-member ensemble means, respectively.

3.1 Annual and seasonal mean trends in SWW

The spatial distribution of Holocene trends in the annual-mean low-level zonal wind in the Southern Hemisphere for the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP for all models is repre-



sented in Fig. 3. The zonal wind trends are plotted at 850 hPa for CCSM3, ECHO-G (I and II) and COSMOS, and at the lowermost model level for ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE (800 hPa) and CLIMBER2-LPJ. All models exhibit a general trend of strengthening in the southern and central SWW region and a weakening trend in the northern part of

- the SWW belt, which can be interpreted as a poleward displacement of the annualmean westerly circulation during the course of the mid-to-late Holocene (Fig. 3). This spatio-temporal wind pattern resembles a long-term trend of the Southern Annular Mode (or Antarctic Oscillation) towards its positive phase (e.g. Sen Gupta and England, 2006). Strengthening of the SWW in the latitudinal belt between about 40° S and
- 10 60° S (i.e. the SWW core region) is most intense and continuous in ECHO-G (I and II), followed by CCSM3. While COSMOS shows a pronounced strengthening of the SWW in the region between ~50° S and 70° S, ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE simulates a less annular pattern, but, with respect to the zonal mean, a strengthening in the core SWW latitude belt is seen. CLIMBER2-LPJ produces the weakest trends, probably due to its simplified dynamics that does not explicitly simulate eddy momentum transports.
- The simulated timeseries of the annual-mean SWW temporal evolution in all models used for inter-comparison are represented by an index and is displayed in Fig. 4. The index is defined as the difference of the zonally averaged zonal low-level winds between the latitudes 55° S and 35° S and is a measure for latitudinal displacements of the SWW belt (Varma et al., 2011). An evident trend observed in all the models is the strengthening of the low-level winds towards 55° S during the course of Holocene (Fig. 4). The strongest changes occur during the mid-Holocene (4000 to 6000 yr BP) in almost all the models. Again, ECHO-G (I) and ECHO-G (II) are very similar, CLIMBER2-LPJ follows the deterministic insolation, CCSM3 and COSMOS show pronounced internal variability for the last 3000 yr.

The zonally averaged simulated Holocene trends in low-level zonal winds separately for each season are represented in Fig. 5 (see Supplement for the maps of seasonal trends in Southern Hemisphere zonal winds). For the March-April-May (MAM) season, all models show the most pronounced southward shift and strengthening of SWW in



the latitudinal belt between about 40° S and 60° S. During the June-July-August (JJA) season, CCSM3, ECHO-G (I and II) and CLIMBER2-LPJ sustain the pattern of SWW strengthening in that latitudinal belt, whereas ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE exhibits a weakening in this region. The most striking feature in Figure 5 is the SWW behaviour during the September-October-November (SON) season. This season shows the trend of a SWW weakening (between the latitudes ~40° S and 60° S) and northward shift in all the models, i.e. opposite to the annual-mean trend.

3.2 Annual and seasonal mean trends in surface temperature

The spatial distributions of Holocene trends in Southern Hemisphere annual-mean sur face temperature for the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP is shown in Fig. 6. The most no ticeable trend pattern in all models relates to an intense cooling in the southern high latitudes especially around Antarctica. In low latitudes, the temperature trend patterns are more heterogeneous among the different models. For instance, CCSM3 exhibits a large-scale (albeit weak) tropical warming trend, while ECHO-G (II) shows more of a
 tropical cooling (Fig. 6c).

The seasonal response pattern of Holocene surface temperature trends in the Southern Hemisphere caused by variations in orbital forcing is more entangled. The zonally averaged trends in the surface temperature on a seasonal basis as simulated by the different models is displayed in Fig. 7 (see Supplement for the Southern Hemisphere maps of seasonal trends in surface temperature). Austral summers (DJF) experience

- a lower-than-present insolation during the early Holocene (Fig. 2) resulting in a general warming trend in the Southern Hemisphere during the course of the Holocene, which is most pronounced over the continents (Fig. 8 of Supplement). By contrast, the austral winter season (JJA) shows strong cooling trends over the Southern Hemisphere conti-
- nents as a direct response to decreasing insolation (Fig. 6 of Supplement). The MAM and SON seasons exhibit the most uniform trends on a hemispherical scale over both Southern Hemisphere land and ocean in all the models (Figs. 5 and 7 of Supplement). Among all the seasons, the austral spring (SON) shows the strongest seasonal cooling



trend, whereas the austral fall (MAM) exhibits the strongest seasonal warming trend (Fig. 7) as a result of insolation changes in combination with a delayed response of the climate system by 1–3 months owing to the thermal inertia of the surface ocean (cf. Renssen et al., 2005). However, even during the MAM season, the Southern Ocean
⁵ regions around Antarctica show a cooling trend, opposite to what would be expected from the local insolation trend (Fig. 2). This regional cooling trend has been attributed to a long memory of the Southern Ocean through the storage of late winter-spring surface temperature anomalies in the deep upper-ocean winter layer in combination with

sea ice-albedo and ice-insulation feedbacks (Renssen et al., 2005). While the study
 of Renssen et al. (2005) is based on a single coupled model, our multi-model inter comparison supports their results and reveals that this is a robust feature captured by
 all models. As a result, all models show a year-round Holocene cooling trend in the
 Southern Ocean (Figs. 6, 7).

4 Discussion

- ¹⁵ Surface westerlies result from the westerly momentum flux convergence by transient eddies acting against losses by surface friction. The eddies, in turn, are driven by the potential energy available in the meridional temperature gradient (e.g., Vallis, 2006). Consequently, strength and position of the SWW depends to a large extent on surface temperature patterns (Brayshaw et al., 2008; Lu et al., 2010; Chen et al., 2010). The most significant pattern that could be noted in both annual and seasonal means is
- most significant pattern that could be noted in both annual and seasonal means is the strong cooling trend in the southern high latitudes, especially around Antarctica (Figs. 6, 7). Ice cores indeed provide evidence for a widespread Antarctic Holocene cooling trend (Masson et al., 2000) underpinned by palaeoclimate reconstructions from the Ross Sea (Steig et al., 1998) and the Palmer Deep (Domack et al., 2001).
- ²⁵ The southern high-latitude cooling trend results in a steepening of the pole-toequator surface temperature gradient. Recent theoretical and modelling studies have shown that an enhanced meridional temperature gradient does not only lead to an



overall strengthening of the SWW, but that the surface temperature pattern also influences the position of the wind belt (Brayshaw et al., 2008; Lu et al., 2010; Chen et al., 2010). Accordingly, a stronger meridional surface temperature gradient at high latitudes is accompanied by a poleward shift of the surface westerlies due to enhanced

- ⁵ high-latitude baroclinic wave generation. This may explain the overall poleward shifting trend of the SWW that prevails in the annual mean in all the models. During the MAM season, when this trend is strongest, two additional effects contribute to the southward movement of the westerlies: Increasing insolation during the austral late summer with highest values in low latitudes (i.e. increasing meridional insolation gradient; Fig. 2) in
- ¹⁰ combination with the 1–3 months time lag, owing to the thermal inertia of the surface climate system (Renssen et al., 2005), leads to a further increase in the meridional temperature gradient as well as to a hemispheric-scale warming trend during the austral fall (Fig. 7). By means of general atmospheric circulation modelling and scaling arguments, it has recently been shown that an increase in the global (or hemispheric-scale)
- ¹⁵ surface temperature increases the latitudinal extent of the Hadley cell (Frierson et al., 2007) and shifts the eddy-driven surface westerlies towards the pole (Lu et al., 2010), thus contributing to the maximum insolation-response of the SWW during the MAM season (Fig. 5). During the SON season, the trend in insolation-forcing is of opposite sign (Fig. 2), leading to a hemispheric-scale cooling trend and hence an equatorward
- ²⁰ movement of the SWW (Fig. 5). The model results consistently suggest that the annual and seasonal mean SWW exhibit an overall strengthening and poleward shifting trend during the course of the mid-to-late Holocene under the influence of orbital forcing, except for the austral spring season, where the SWW exhibit an opposite trend of shifting towards the equator. Our findings for Holocene SWW shifts are largely consistent
- with a recent study by Rojas and Moreno (2010) who analyzed a multi-model-mean of PMIP2 simulations for 6 kyr BP. They found an enhanced annual-mean westerly flow between ~35° S and 45° S and a weakening south of ~45° S for the mid-Holocene time slice relative to the present.



Validating the model results with reconstructions of the paleo-SWW proves still to be elusive, as there is a substantial incongruity between different proxy records. For the SWW core region around 51°–53° S, for instance, terrestrial ecosystem proxy records from western Patagonia (Moreno et al., 2010) suggest a trend of increasing SWW strength during the past 7000 yr that is not supported by sedimentological and pollenbased reconstructions of South Patagonian precipitation by Lamy et al. (2010). As a cautionary note, we emphasize again that the model simulations suggest opposite Holocene trends in SWW variations for different seasons (Fig. 5) which may affect the proxy records and their interpretation.

10 5 Conclusions

15

The investigation of the temporal and spatial evolution of the SWW along with forcings and feedbacks remains a significant challenge in climate research. In this study, we examined the Holocene evolution of SWW under the influence of orbital forcing with transient experiments using the state-of-the-art comprehensive coupled global climate model CCSM3. In addition, a model inter-comparison has been conducted using Holocene transient simulations from four other coupled global climate models, namely, ECHO-G, COSMOS, ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE and CLIMBER2-LPJ. Analyses and comparison of the model results suggest that the annual and seasonal mean SWW were subject to an overall strengthening and poleward shifting trend during the course of the

- 20 mid-to-late Holocene under the influence of orbital forcing, except for the austral spring season, where the SWW exhibited an opposite trend of shifting towards the equator. The comparison between an accelerated and a non-accelerated ECHO-G experiment revealed that the simulation of these trends is unaffected by the orbital acceleration technique employed in some of the transient runs. In view of a substantial incongruity
- ²⁵ between different SWW simulations for the Last Glacial Maximum (Rojas et al., 2009), the agreement among the different models with respect to Holocene SWW trends is encouraging. However, the magnitude of SWW shift is much smaller in EMICs compared



1810

Anderson, R. F., Ali, S., Bradtmiller, L. I., Nielsen, S. H. H., Fleisher, M. Q., Anderson, B. E., and Burckle, L. H.: Wind-Driven Upwelling in the Southern Ocean and the Deglacial Rise in Atmospheric CO₂, Science, 323, 1443–1448, 2009.

References

5

10

25

Acknowledgements. This work was funded through the DFG (Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft) Priority Programme "INTERDYNAMIK" and through the DFG Research Center/Excellence Cluster "The Ocean in the Earth System". CCSM3 simulations were performed on the SGI Altix supercomputer of the Norddeutscher Verbund für Hoch- und 20 Höchstleistungsrechnen (HLRN). We also acknowledge the use of the NCAR Command Language (NCL) and NOAA/PMEL's Ferret in our data analysis and visualization herein.

http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/7/1797/2011/cpd-7-1797-2011-supplement. 15 pdf.

order to put the Southern Hemisphere circulation changes of the last decades into a long-term context. Supplementary material related to this article is available online at:

to the comprehensive general circulation models. Therefore, the potential feedbacks in

Whether the simulated shifts in the SWW had the potential to affect atmospheric CO₂

concentrations through degassing of the deep ocean via changes in wind-driven upwelling in the Southern Ocean (Moreno et al., 2010) remains elusive at the time being.

Moreover, the effect of increasing greenhouse gases from the mid to the late Holocene

(e.g. Raynaud et al., 2000) is not included in the orbital-forced model simulations presented here, although there is strong evidence for a CO₂-induced strengthening and

poleward shift of the SWW over the past four decades (e.g. Arblaster and Meehl, 2006;

Toggweiler and Russell, 2008). In future studies, the combined effects of orbital and

greenhouse gas forcing should be explored using comprehensive climate models in

their climate/carbon cycle simulations may be underestimated.

Discussion Paper 7, 1797–1824, 2011 Holocene evolution of the Southern Hemisphere **Discussion** Paper V. Varma et al. **Title Page** Introduction Abstract Conclusions References **Discussion** Paper Tables Figures Back Close **Discussion** Paper Full Screen / Esc Printer-friendly Version Interactive Discussion

1811

- Arblaster, J. M. and Meehl, G. A.: Contributions of External Forcings to Southern Annular Mode Trends, J. Climate, 19, 2896–2905, doi:10.1175/JCLI3774.1, 2006.
- Archer, D.: A data-driven model of the global calcite lysocline, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 10, 511–526, 1996.
- 5 Battarbee, R. W. and Binney, H. A.: Natural Climate Variability and Global Warming: A Holocene Perspective, Wiley-Blackwell, ISBN: 978-1-4051-5905-0, 2008.
 - Berger, A. L.: Long-term variations of daily insolation and Quaternary climatic changes, J. Atmos. Sci., 35, 2362–2367, 1978.
 - Biastoch, A., Böning, C. W., Schwarzkopf, F. U., and Lutjeharms, J. R. E.: Increase in Agulhas
- leakage due to poleward shift of Southern Hemisphere westerlies, Nature, 462, 495–498, 2009.
 - Braconnot, P., Otto-Bliesner, B., Harrison, S., Joussaume, S., Peterchmitt, J.-Y., Abe-Ouchi, A., Crucifix, M., Driesschaert, E., Fichefet, Th., Hewitt, C. D., Kageyama, M., Kitoh, A., Laîné, A., Loutre, M.-F., Marti, O., Merkel, U., Ramstein, G., Valdes, P., Weber, S.L., Yu, Y., and Zhao,
- Y.: Results of PMIP2 coupled simulations of the Mid-Holocene and Last Glacial Maximum Part 1: experiments and large-scale features, Clim. Past., 3, 261–277, 2007.
 - Brayshaw, D. J., Hoskins, B., and Blackburn, M.: The Storm-Track Response to Idealized SST Perturbations in an Aquaplanet GCM, J. Atmos. Sci., 65, 2842–2860, doi:10.1175/2008JAS2657.1, 2008.
- Brovkin, V., Bendtsen, J., Claussen, M., Ganopolski, A., Kubatzki, C., Petoukhov, V., and Andreev, A.: Carbon cycle, vegetation, and climate dynamics in the Holocene: Experiments with the CLIMBER-2 model, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 16, 1139, doi:10.1029/ 2001GB001662, 2002.
 - Brovkin, V., Ganopolski, A., Archer, D., and Rahmstorf, S.: Lowering of glacial atmospheric CO₂
- in response to changes in oceanic circulation and marine biogeochemistry, Paleoceanography, 22, PA4202, doi:10.1029/2006PA001380, 2007.
 - Brovkin, V., Raddatz, T., Christian, H. Reick, C. H., Claussen, M., and Gayler, V.: Global biogeophysical interactions between forest and climate, Geophys. Res. Lett., 36, doi:10.1029/2009GL037543, 2009.
- ³⁰ Chen, G., Plumb, R. A., and Lu, J.: Sensitivities of zonal mean atmospheric circulation to SST warming in an aqua-planet model, Geophys. Res. Lett., 37, L12701, doi:10.1029/2010GL043473, 2010.

Collins, W. D., Bitz, C. M., Blackmon, M. L., Bonan, G. B., Bretherton, C. S., Carton, J. A.,



Chang, P., Doney, S. C., Hack, J. J., Henderson, T. B., Kiehl, J. T., Large, W. G., McKenna, D. S., Santer, B. D., and Smith, R. D.: The Community Climate System Model Version 3 (CCSM3), J. Climate, 19, 2122–2143, 2006.

Domack, E. W., Leventer, A., Dunbar, R., Taylor, F., Brachfeld, S., Sjunneskog, C., and ODP Leg

⁵ 178 Scientific Party: Chronology of the Palmer Deep site, Antarctic Peninsula: a Holocene palaeoenvironmental reference for the circum-Antarctic, The Holocene, 11, 1–9, 2001.

Frierson, D. M. W., Lu, J., and Chen, G.: Width of the Hadley cell in simple and comprehensive general circulation models, Geophys. Res. Lett., 34, L18804, doi:10.1029/2007GL031115, 2007.

- ¹⁰ Goosse, H. and Fichefet, T.: Importance of ice-ocean interactions for the global ocean circulation: a model study, J. Geophys. Res., 104, 23337–23355, 1999.
 - Grootes, P. M. and Stuiver, M.: Oxygen 18/16 variability in Greenland snow and ice with 10⁻³- to 10⁵-year time resolution, J. Geophys. Res., 102, 455–470, 1997.

Hays, J. D., Imbrie, J., and Shackleton, N. J.: Variations in the earth's orbit: Pacemaker of the ice ages, Science, 194, 1121–1132, 1976.

Heusser, C. J.: Polar perspective of Late Quaternary climates in the Southern Hemisphere, Quaternary Res., 32, 60–71, 1989.

15

25

- Imbrie, J., Boyle, E. A., Clemens, S. C., Duffy, A., Howard, W. R., Kukla, G., Kutzbach, J., Martinson, D. G., McIntyre, A., Mix, A. C., Molfino, B., Morley, J. J., Peterson, L. C., Pisias,
- N. G., Prell, W. L., Raymo, M. E., Shackleton, N. J., and Toggweiler, J. R.: On the Structure and Origin of Major Glaciation Cycles 1. Linear Responses to Milankovitch Forcing, Paleoceanography, 7, 701–738, doi:10.1029/92PA02253, 1992.
 - Jenny, B., Wilhelm, D., and Valero-Garcés, B. L.: The Southern Westerlies in Central Chile: Holocene precipitation estimates based on a water balance model for Laguna Aculeo (33°50'S), Clim. Dynam., 20, 269–280, 2003.
 - Kalnay, E., Kanamitsu, M., Kistler, R., Collins, W., Deaven, D., Gandin, L., Iredell, M., Saha, S., White, G., Woollen, J., Zhu, Y., Leetmaa, A., Reynolds, R., Chelliah, M., Ebisuzaki, W., Higgins, W., Janowiak, J., Mo, K. C., Ropelewski, C., Wang, J., Jenne, R., and Joseph, D.: The NCEP/NCAR 40-Year Reanalysis Project, B. Am. Meteorol. Soc., 77, 437–471, 1996.
- ³⁰ Kim, S. J., Flato, G. M., and Boer, G. J.: A coupled climate simulation of the last glacial maximum, Part 2: approach to equilibrium, Clim. Dyn., 20, 635–661, 2003.
 - Kitoh, A., Murakami, S., and Kiode, H.: A simulation of the last glacial maximum with a coupled atmosphere-ocean GCM, Geophys. Res. Lett., 28, 2221–2224, 2001.



- Kleinen, T., Brovkin, V., von Bloh, W., Archer, D., and Munhoven, G.: Holocene carbon cycle dynamics, Geophys. Res. Lett., 37, L02705, doi:10.1029/2009GL041391, 2010.
- Kuhlbrodt, T., Griesel, A., Montoya, M., Levermann, A., Hofmann, M., and Rahmstorf, F.: On the driving processes of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation, Rev. Geophys., 45, RG2001, doi:10.1029/2004RG000166, 2007.
- Lamy, F., Hebbeln, D., and Wefer, G.: Late quaternary precessional cycles of terrigenous sediment input off the Norte Chico, Chile (27.5°S) and palaeoclimatic implications, Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol., 140, 233–244, 1998.

5

25

Lamy, F., Hebbeln, D., and Wefer, G.: High-resolution marine record of climatic change in

- ¹⁰ mid-latitude Chile during the last 28 000 years based on terrigenous sediment parameters, Quaternary Res., 51, 83–93, 1999.
 - Lamy, F., Hebbeln, D., Rohl, U., and Wefer, G.: Holocene rainfall variability in southern Chile: a marine record of latitudinal shifts of the Southern Westerlies, Earth Planet. Sc. Lett., 185, 369–382, 2001.
- Lamy, F., Kilian, R., Arz, H. W., Francois, J. P., Kaiser, J., Prange, M., and Steinke, T.: Holocene changes in the position and intensity of the southern westerly wind belt, Nat. Geosci., 3, 695–699, 2010.
 - Legutke, S. and Voss, R.: The Hamburg atmosphere-ocean coupled circulation model ECHO-G, Technical Report 18, Deutsches Klimarechenzentrum, Hamburg, 1999.
- Levitus, S., Boyer, T., Conkright, M., Johnson, D., O'Brien, T., Antonov, J., Stephens, C., and Gelfeld, R.: Introduction. Vol. 1, World Ocean Database 1998, NOAA Atlas NESDIS 18, 346, 1998.
 - Lorenz, S. J and Lohmann, G.: Acceleration technique for Milankovitch type forcing in a coupled atmosphere-ocean circulation model: method and application for the Holocene, Clim. Dynam., 23, 727–743, doi:10.1007/s00382-004-0469-y, 2004.
 - Lorenz, S. J., Kim, J-H., Rimbu, N., Schneider, R. R., and Lohmann, G.: Orbitally driven insolation forcing on Holocene climate trends: Evidence from alkenone data and climate modeling, Paleoceanography, 21, doi:10.1029/2005PA001152, 2006.

Lu, J., Chen, G., and Frierson, D. M. W.: The Position of Midlatitude Storm Track and Eddy-Driven Westerlies in Aquaplanet AGCMs, J. Atmos. Sci., 67, 3984–4000, doi:10.1175/2010JAS3477.1.2010.

Markgraf, V.: Paleoenvironmental changes at the northern limit of the subantarctic Nothofagus forest, Lat 37°S, Quaternary Res., 28, 119–129, 1987.



- Markgraf, V., Dodson, J. R., Kershaw, P. A., McGlone, M. S., and Nicholls, N.: Evolution of late Pleistocene and Holocene climates in the circum-South Pacific land areas, Clim. Dynam., 6, 193–211, 1992.
- Marsland, S. J., Haak, H., Jungclaus, J. H., Latif, M., and Röske, F.: The Max-Planck-Institute global ocean/sea ice model with orthogonal curvilinear coordinates, Ocean Model., 5, 91–
 - 127, 2003. Masson, V., Vimeux, F., Jouzel, J., Morgan, V., Delmotte, M., Ciais, P., Hammer, C., Johnsen,
 - S., Lipenkov, V., Ya., Thompson, M. E., Petit, J., R., Steig, E. J., Stievenard, M., and Vaikmae, R.: Holocene Climate variability in Antarctica Based on 11 Ice-Core Isotopic Records, Quaternary Res., 54, 348–358, 2000.
- Quaternary Res., 54, 348–358, 2000. Menviel, L., Timmermann, A., Mouchet, A., and Timm, O.: Climate and marine carbon cycle response to changes in the strength of the Southern Hemispheric westerlies, Paleoceanography. 23, PA4201, doi:10.1029/2008PA001604, 2008.

15

20

25

30

Merkel, U., Prange, M., and Schulz, M.: ENSO variability and teleconnections during glacial climates, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 29, 86–100, 2010.

- Milankovitch, M.: Kanon der Erdbestrahlungen und seine Anwendung auf das Eiszeitenproblem, Spec Publ, 132, 633, R. Serb. Acad., Belgrade, 1941.
- Moreno, P. I., Francois, J. P., Moy, C. M., and Villa-Martinez, R.: Covariability of the Southern Westerlies and atmospheric CO₂ during the Holocene, Geology, 38, 727–730, doi:10.1130/G30962.1, 2010.
- Opsteegh, J. D., Haarsma, R. J., and Selten, F. M., ECBILT: A dynamic alternative to mixed boundary conditions in ocean models, Tellus, 50A, 348–367, 1998.
- d'Orgeville, M., Sijp, W. P., England, M. H., and Meissner, K. J.: On the control of glacialinterglacial atmospheric CO₂ variations by the Southern Hemisphere Westerlies, Geophys. Res. Lett., 37, doi:10.1029/2010GL045261, 2010.
- Otto-Bliesner, B., Brady, E., Clauzet, G., Thomas, R., Levis, S., and Kothavala, Z.: Last glacial maximum and Holocene climate in CCSM3, J. Clim., 19, 2526–2544, 2006.
- Petoukhov, V., Ganopolski, A., Brovkin, V., Claussen, M., Eliseev, A., Kubatzki, C., and Rahmstorf, S.: CLIMBER-2: A climate system model of intermediate complexity. Part I: Model description and performance for present climate, Clim. Dyn., 16, 1–17, 2000.
- Pfeiffer, M. and Lohmann, G.: Interglacial climate evolution: a comparison between the Marine Isotope Stages 1 and 5, Clim. Dyn., in preparation, 2011.

Raynaud, D., Barnola, J, M., Chappellaz, J., Blunier, T., Indermühle, A., and Stauffer, B.: The



ice record of green house gases: a view in the context of future changes, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 19, 9–17, 2000.

- Renssen, H., Goosse, H., Fichefet, T., Masson, V., Koc, N.: Holocene climate evolution in the high-latitude Southern Hemisphere simulated by a coupled atmosphere-sea-ice-oceanvegetation model, The Holocene, 17, 951–964, 2005.
- vegetation model, The Holocene, 17, 951–964, 2005.
 Renssen, H., Seppä, H., Heiri, O., Roche, D. M., Goosse, H., and Fichefet, T.: The spatial and temporal complexity of the Holocene thermal maximum, Nat. Geo., 2, 411–414, doi:10.1038/ngeo513, 2009.

Roeckner, E., Arpe, K., Bengtsson, L., Christoph, M., Claussen, M., Dmenil, L., Esch, M.,

- Giorgetta, M., Schlese, U., and Schulzweida, U.: The atmospheric general circulation model ECHAM-4: model description and simulation of the present day climate, Report 218. Max-Planck-Institut fur Meteorologie, 1996.
 - Roeckner, E., Bäuml, G., Bonaventura, L., Brokopf, R., Esch, M., Giorgetta, M., Hagemann, S., Kirchner, I., Kornblueh, L., Manzini, E., Rhodin, A., Schlese, U., Schulzweida, U., and Tomp-
- kins, A.: The atmospheric general circulation model ECHAM5. Part I: Model description. Max Planck Institute for Meteorology Rep. 349, 127 pp., available from MPI for Meteorology, Bundesstr. 53, 20146 Hamburg, Germany, 2003.
 - Rojas, M., Moreno, P., Kageyama, M., Crucifix, M., Hewitt, C., Abe-Ouchi, A., Ohgaito, R., Brady, E. C., and Hope, P.: The Southern Westerlies during the last glacial maximum in PMIP2 simulations, Clim. Dvn., 32, 525–548, doi:10.1007/s00382-008-0421-7, 2009.
- PMIP2 simulations, Clim. Dyn., 32, 525–548, doi:10.1007/s00382-008-0421-7, 2009.
 Rojas, M. and Moreno, P. I.: Atmospheric circulation changes and neoglacial conditions in the Southern Hemisphere mid-latitudes: insights from PMIP2 simulations at 6 kyr, Clim. Dyn., doi:10.1007/s00382-010-0866-3, 2010.

Sen Gupta, A., and England, M. H.: Coupled Ocean–Atmosphere–Ice Response to Variations in the Southern Annular Mode, J. Climate, 19, 4457–4486, doi:10.1175/JCLI3843.1, 2006.

25

Shin, S. I., Lui, Z., Otto-Bliesner, B., Brady, E. C., Kutzback, J. E., and Harrison, S. P.: A simulation of the last glacial maximum climate using NCAR CCSM, Clim. Dyn., 20, 127–151, doi:10.1007/s00382-002-0260-x, 2003.

Shulmeister, J., Goodwin, I., Renwick, J., Harle, K., Armand, L., McGlone, M. S., Cook, E.,

³⁰ Dodson, J., Hesse, P. P., Mayewski, P., and Curran, M.: The Southern Hemisphere westerlies in the Australasian sector over the last glacial cycle: a synthesis, Quatern. Int., 118–119, 23– 53, 2004.

Sijp, W. P., and England, M. H.: Southern Hemisphere Westerly Wind Control over the Ocean's



Thermohaline Circulation, J. Climate, 22, 1277–1286, 2009.

- Steig, E. J., Hart, C. P., White, J. W. C., Cunningham, W. L., Davis, M. D., and Saltzman, E. S.: Changes in climate, ocean and ice-sheet conditions in the Ross embayment, Antarctica, at 6 ka, Ann. Glaciol., 27, 305–310, 1998.
- ⁵ Thresher, R. E.: Solar correlates of Southern Hemisphere mid-latitude climate variability, Int. J. Climatol., 22, 901–915, 2002.
 - Toggweiler, J. R. and Samuels, B.: Effect of Drake Passage on the global thermohaline circulation, Deep-Sea Res. Pt 1., 42, 477–500, 1995.
 - Toggweiler, J. R., Russel, J. L., and Carson, S. R.: Midlatitude westerlies, atmo-
- spheric CO_2 and climate change during the ice ages, Paleoceanography, 21, PA2005, doi:10.1029/2005PA001154, 2006.
 - Toggweiler, J. R. and Russell, J.: Ocean circulation in a warming climate, Nature, 451, 286–288, doi:10.1038/nature06590, 2008.

Tschumi, T., Joos, F., and Parekh, P.: How important are Southern Hemisphere wind

- changes for low glacial carbon dioxide? A model study, Paleoceanography, 23, PA4208, doi:10.1029/2008PA001592, 2008.
 - Valdes, P. J.: South American palaeoclimate model simulations: how reliable are the models?, J. Quaternary Sci., 15, 357–368, 2000.

Vallis, G. K.: Atmospheric and Ocean Fluid Dynamics, Cambridge University Press, ISBN-13 978-0-521-84969-2, 2006.

Varma, V., Prange, M., Lamy, F., Merkel, U., and Schulz, M.: Solar-forced shifts of the Southern Hemisphere Westerlies during the Holocene, Clim. Past, 7, 339–347, doi:10.5194/cp-7-339-2011, 2011.

Wagner, S., Widmann, M., Jones, J., Haberzettl, T., Lücke, A., Mayr, C., Ohlendorf, C.,

- Schäbitz, F., and Zolitschka, B.: Transient simulations, empirical constructions and forcing mechanisms for the Mid-holocene hydrological climate in southern Patagonia, Clim. Dynam., doi:10.1007/s00382-007-0229-x, 2007.
 - Wyroll, K.-H., Dong, B., and Valdes, P. J.: On the position of southern westerlies at the last glacial maximum: an outline of AGCM simulation results and evaluation of their implications,
- ³⁰ Quaternary Sci. Rev., 19, 881–898, 2000.

20

Yeager, S. G., Shields, C. A., Larger, W. G., and Hack, J. J.: The low-resolution CCSM3, J. Climate, 19, 2545–2566, 2006.



Table 1. Brief summary of the climate models used for inter-comparison.

Model Name	Orbital Acceleration	Resolution
CCSM3	by a factor of 10; 3 member ensemble	T31 – Atmosphere & Land: 3.75°; 26 layers Ocean & Ice: 3.6°×1.6°; 25 layers
ECHO-G (I)	by a factor of 10; 2 member ensemble	T30 – Atmosphere & Land: 3.8°; 19 layers Ocean & Ice: 2.8°; 20 layers
ECHO-G (II)	non-accelerated; 1 simulation	T30 – Atmosphere & Land: 3.8°; 19 layers Ocean & Ice: 2.8°; 20 layers
COSMOS	by a factor of 10; 1 simulation	T31 – Atmosphere & Land: 3.75°; 19 layers Ocean & Ice: 3°; 40 layers
ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE	non-accelerated; 1 simulation	T21 – Atmosphere: 5.6°; 3 layers Ocean: 3°; 20 layers
CLIMBER2-LPJ	non-accelerated; 1 simulation	Atmosphere: 51 [°] ×10° Ocean: Zonally averaged, with 2.5° latitudinal resolution; 11 layers





Fig. 1. Present-day Southern Hemisphere zonal wind climatology at 850 hPa for **(a)** austral summer (DJF) and **(b)** austral winter (JJA), based on NCEP/NCAR reanalysis data (1968–1996; Kalnay et al., 1996). Overlaid isotherms (contours) represent the climatological sea surface temperatures (°C) for the corresponding seasons based on the NODC World Ocean Atlas (Levitus et al., 1998). During DJF, the northern margin of the zonal wind shows a more southward confined pattern, while during JJA, it extends further to the north. In general, the surface westerly winds cover the region between ~ 30° S and 70° S, with the present-day strongest wind centred at around ~ 50° S.











Fig. 3. Trend in the annual mean low-level zonal wind in **(a)** CCSM3, **(b)** ECHO-G (I), **(c)** ECHO-G (II), **(d)** COSMOS, **(e)** ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE, and **(f)** CLIMBER2-LPJ for the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP. All polar stereographic plots represent the Southern Hemisphere, with latitudes placed at 10° interval, starting from equator to 90° S.





Fig. 4. Temporal evolution of annual mean SWW position during the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP in (a) CCSM3, (b) ECHO-G (I), (c) ECHO-G (II), (d) COSMOS, (e) ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE, and (f) CLIMBER2-LPJ, defined in terms of the difference between the latitudes 55° S and 35° S (southern and northern parts of the SWW belt respectively) of the zonally averaged low-level zonal winds (black curves). Time axis is plotted against the anomaly of the mean wind position. A 1000 yr boxcar smoothing with respect to orbital year has been applied to all the time series except for CLIMBER2-LPJ. Linear regression lines for the time series are shown in red. Note the different ordinate scales.





Fig. 5. Zonally averaged seasonal and annual mean trends in the low-level zonal wind in **(a)** CCSM3, **(b)** ECHO-G (I), **(c)** ECHO-G (II), **(d)** COSMOS, **(e)** ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE, and **(f)** CLIMBER2-LPJ for the Southern Hemisphere. Note the different ordinate scales.





Fig. 6. Trend in the annual mean surface temperature in **(a)** CCSM3, **(b)** ECHO-G (I), **(c)** ECHO-G (II), **(d)** COSMOS, **(e)** ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE, and **(f)** CLIMBER2-LPJ for the period 7 kyr BP to 250 yr BP.





Fig. 7. Zonally averaged seasonal and annual mean trends in the surface temperature in (a) CCSM3, (b) ECHO-G (I), (c) ECHO-G (II), (d) COSMOS, (e) ECBilt-CLIO-VECODE, and (f) CLIMBER2-LPJ for the Southern Hemisphere. Note the different ordinate scales.

