Clim. Past Discuss., 6, C599–C600, 2010
www.clim-past-discuss.net/6/C599/2010/

Climate of the Past Discussions

Interactive comment on "

Climate response to freshwater perturbations in Northern or Southern Hemispheres at the last glacial inception, the last glacial maximum and the present-day" *by* G. Philippon-Berthier et al.

U. Mikolajewicz (Editor)

uwe.mikolajewicz@zmaw.de

Received and published: 10 August 2010

Dear authors,

Both reviewers have two major objections against publication of your paper in the present form. For the first, they criticize the paper for being mostly descriptive with respect to the model results and for not containing sufficient analysis. Additionally,

they find the presentation/language not suitable for publication. Unfortunately I have to say that I fully agree with the reviewers and that major revisions are required, before the paper can become publishable.

Please address in your response all the points raised by the reviewers. Please explain carefully for each of the points, how you have modified your paper or why you have chosen not to change your paper.

Please substantiate the analysis of the model results. The main advantage of using a model of intermediate complexity is after my opinion that you can isolate the mechanisms responsible for a particular response relatively easy. I have the impression that being slightly more critical about the model and its limitations would help the paper as well (e.g. is the model's North Atlantic overturning strength of 26 Sv somewhat higher than the best guess from observations).

Please make sure that the language is appropriate, before you submit a revised version (the involvement of a native speaker might be helpful).

Given the severity of the concerns expressed by the referees and the implied substantial revisions required, the revised ms. will be sent to the reviewers again.

If you feel that you need more time for additional analysis, then withdrawal of the manuscript and resubmission at a later point would be an alternative option.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 6, 1077, 2010.