

Interactive comment on “The construction of a Central Netherlands temperature” by G. van der Schrier et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 6 January 2011

Van der Schier and co-authors describe methods used to develop a composite temperature record representative for the Central Netherlands. As argued by the authors, such a regionally representative record is useful for comparison with climate model simulation data.

The style of the text, however, resembles a technical report more than a scientific article. There is, in fact, almost no scientific discussion at all. Most of the text consists of a description of the methods chosen to construct a reference series to be used in homogeneity tests, followed by results of these tests given together with many details of station histories. Then, the composite temperature record is briefly compared to an earlier version of a Central Netherlands temperature series, which is described in a published technical report from their institute. The authors find that the two versions

are very similar. This is not surprising, since both versions are constructed from the same stations albeit with different methods chosen for the homogeneity exercises.

Although I agree with the authors that the actual type of homogeneous regional temperature record developed is important to have access to for evaluation of climate model data, I don't think their text is sufficiently interesting as a scientific paper to motivate publication in *Climate of the Past*. It would seem more natural that the authors publish a technical report that describes their new version of the Central Netherlands record. Such a report could provide even more details (e.g. some of those wished by the first referee). Then, the authors could use their temperature record in a paper that contains a proper scientific discussion, e.g. in a climate model evaluation context. Such a paper would most likely attract more readers and it would only need to summarize briefly the methods chosen to develop the regional temperature series.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, 6, 2517, 2010.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

