

Interactive comment on “Defining the Little Ice Age” by Ø. Paasche and J. Bakke

V. Rath (Editor)

vrath@fis.ucm.es

Received and published: 28 December 2010

Dear Authors,

after having received three reviews of your manuscript, I would like to ask you to carefully reply to the issues made by the reviewers, in order to close the discussion period.

The aim of this contribution is rather ambitious, and a thorough discussion on the spatio-temporal extent of the LIA surely would be welcome to this journal. However, the main shared criticisms of all reviewers are of fundamental character: the use of a very small subset of available observation, regional bias, "cherry-picking". I agree with the reviewers that the consequences drawn would require a much deeper and more extensive treatment of all available evidence.

I believe that this manuscript cannot be published in CP. In particular, I think that in fact

C1230

the major revisions required by two of the reviewers would amount to a totally new and different article, and new science would require a new, full review process. Therefore I cannot accept this article for Climate of the Past.

However, I encourage you to resubmit a substantially rewritten manuscript, which would be treated as a new submission, i.e., will go through a new discussion phase.

All the Best, Volker Rath

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 6, 2159, 2010.