

Interactive comment on “Early last glacial maximum in the Southern Central Andes reveals northward shift of the westerlies at ~39 ka” by R. Zech et al.

C. Hatté (Editor)

christine.hatte@lsce.ipsl.fr

Received and published: 8 December 2010

Based on both referees expertises and on my own reading of the paper submitted by Zech et al., I would recommend authors to adequately address the major concern of glacier extension in relation to precipitation and temperature. Interpretation is not as obvious as it may appear in the current version of the manuscript. Some of the deductions would benefit of being toned down and balanced. Within their response to the first reviewer, authors refer to a “submitted” paper (Waeger et al.) that could expand the discussion and support their demonstration. This article is unfortunately not available and even not validated by reviews. Their main results should be exposed

C1107

in the Zech’s paper so that they can be considered into the discussion. Authors should also consider others concerns mentioned by the second referee.

If all of these concerns are addressed in a revised version, I would consider the paper as publishable.

Christine Hatté

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 6, 1991, 2010.

C1108