

## ***Interactive comment on “Variations in mid-latitude North Atlantic surface water properties during the mid-Brunhes: Does Marine Isotope Stage 11 stand out?” by A. H. L. Voelker et al.***

**P. Tzedakis (Editor)**

[p.c.tzedakis@leeds.ac.uk](mailto:p.c.tzedakis@leeds.ac.uk)

Received and published: 29 November 2009

This paper has now received an additional review, which while agreeing that the data presented are will be of great interest to the palaeoceanographic community, suggests that the potential of the results has not been fully exploited. The reviewer makes a number of useful suggestions, which the authors should pursue in a revised version.

In addition, I would like to draw the authors' attention to the first paragraph of page 14 of the MS, where the point is made that icebergs and colder surface waters reached western Iberian sites  $\sim$ 1000 years later than IODP U1313 or ODP 980. First, I would argue that in view of the uncertainties in respective chronologies this point is extremely

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Interactive  
Comment

difficult to sustain. Second, a cursory view of Fig. 6 would suggest that the derived timescales of the different records lead to significant discrepancies in their event stratigraphies in MIS 11b and 11a. A more parsimonious interpretation would suggest that the apparent lag is a function of misaligned stratigraphies instead of a steep climatic gradient. In view of this, I would urge the authors to reconsider their conclusion regarding the extent to which western Iberian sites are representative of basin-wide climate signals.

I therefore invite the authors to prepare a new version for CP, taking the reviewer's points and the comment raised above into account, while at the same time attempting to reduce the length of the MS by concentrating on the more salient points. The authors will need to provide a point-by-point response to all comments made by the reviewers. The final author comments should be posted on the Interactive Public Discussion before a revised manuscript can be submitted and considered for final publication in CP.

---

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 5, 1553, 2009.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

