

Interactive comment on “Variations in mid-latitude North Atlantic surface water properties during the mid-Brunhes: Does Marine Isotope Stage 11 stand out?” by A. H. L. Voelker et al.

P. Tzedakis (Editor)

p.c.tzedakis@leeds.ac.uk

Received and published: 17 August 2009

This paper has received two reviews and one response from the authors. Both reviewers agree that the data presented are of the highest quality, the interpretations sound and the MS well-written. However, both reviewers agree that despite the huge amount of effort that has gone into this work, the end result does not constitute a major advance in knowledge in terms of novelty and general significance. Here the reviewers recommendations diverge, with one suggesting rejection, while the second sees merit in making available to the scientific community highly detailed investigations, which contribute to data-model comparisons.

C587

On balance I hold the same view as the second reviewer that the paper should be published, but I think the authors should (1) try to highlight the general significance of their results more clearly, and to the extent that this is feasible, (2) attempt to test specific hypotheses. I therefore invite the authors to submit a revised version for CP, which addresses these points.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 5, 1553, 2009.

C588