Clim. Past Discuss., 5, C338–C339, 2009 www.clim-past-discuss.net/5/C338/2009/ © Author(s) 2009. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Tree ring-based February—April temperature reconstruction for Changbai Mountain in Northeast China and its implication for East Asian Winter Monsoon" by H. F. Zhu et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 10 June 2009

This paper is well written both in scientific and technical aspects. I have a few comments. The authors prensented only cold and warm periods in low frequecy trend. I suggest to add some interpretation on extreme years, i.e., very cold and very warm. For example, the year 1840 and 1841 is extremely cold years in central Korea (Choi et al. 1994). Choi et al. (1994) also used the same species, Korean pine. The authors did not discuss about warming trend in last few decades in their reconstruction. It will be useful to compare this warming trend with the ones shown in other reconstructions, particularly in Asian region as well as East Asia.

C338

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 5, 1215, 2009.