

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “A synthesis of marine sediment core $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data over the last 150 000 years” by K. I. C. Oliver et al.

T. Kiefer (Editor)

kiefer@pages.unibe.ch

Received and published: 18 February 2010

The paper received two competent Referee Comments. While the referees give very different recommendations on the suitability of the manuscript for publication, they both bring forward and justify substantial criticism on the way the data were processed (chronology, quality criteria, correction, averaging, error assessment). Meeting this criticism could involve considerable work beyond mere changes in the text. Therefore, I suggest that the authors first reply to all points of both referee comments in the form of an Author Comment before revising the manuscript. The Author Comment will allow the editor a more balanced evaluation of how to best proceed and give the authors a more substantiated recommendation on manuscript revision. A revised manuscript could then be accompanied by an additional author comment that specifically relates

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



to the revisions, if necessary.

Other points of referee criticism are on the availability and transparency of the compiled data. For a data-centered paper as this one, these are essential issues. I believe that these points can be met relatively easily and I encourage the authors to reply in detail how they intend to do this.

In an Author Comment please also make sure to give an update on the timing of the Hoogakker et al. paper that is mentioned as in preparation and seems to contain important basic information for this manuscript.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 5, 2497, 2009.

CPD

5, C1213–C1214, 2010

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

