

Interactive comment on “Comment on “Aerosol radiative forcing and climate sensitivity deduced from the Last Glacial Maximum to Holocene transition”, by P. Chylek and U. Lohmann, Geophys. Res. Lett., 2008” by J. C. Hargreaves and J. D. Annan

J. C. Hargreaves and J. D. Annan

Received and published: 13 January 2009

We thank the reviewer for their comments.

We agree that it would be normal to publish as a comment in GRL, indeed as the reviewer guessed we initially followed this route. However, the Editor there decided that it was not worth the "enormous resources" to proceed with a revision to the originally-submitted manuscript! We are grateful to CP/CPD for providing space for the discussion.

We recently found Ganopolski and Schneider von Deimling (2008) which supports the reviewer's point about how globally representative the Vostock data may or may not be. We will refer to this in our revision, as they cover the point in some detail.

The questions relating to the importance of surface changes to the model simulation seem well addressed in the cited Claquin et al paper and references therein (and much better than we could do). We will extend the discussion here, no longer being so tightly constrained by article size limits.

Ref: Comment on "Aerosol radiative forcing and climate sensitivity deduced from the Last Glacial Maximum to Holocene transition" by Petr Chylek and Ulrike Lohmann. Andrey Ganopolski and Thomas Schneider von Deimling, GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS, VOL. 35, L23703, doi:10.1029/2008GL033888, 2008

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 4, 1319, 2008.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

