

Interactive comment on “Anticyclonic atmospheric circulation as an analogue for the warm and dry mid-Holocene summer climate in central Scandinavia” by K. Antonsson et al.

J. Guiot (Editor)

guiot@cerege.fr

Received and published: 12 July 2008

Dear authors

According to comments of two reviewers, the paper is acceptable for publication in Climate of the Past after significant corrections.

In particular, the comment of reviewer 1 concerning the numerous simulations already done in PMIP and PMIP2 (comment B) is of particular importance. It converges to the first major comment of rev #2 who asks about the cause of the warm and dry summers : external forcing or not ? Knowing that 10 models over 16 in PMIP (Masson et al 1999) are able to simulate that (all simulated high GDD5 in North and 10 low P-E), it is difficult

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



to conclude that insolation does not play any role. The definition of dry must also be done carefully as several papers on lake levels have clearly shown the importance of P-E instead of simply P (see Harrison et al, 1993 ; Yu and Harrison 1995, etc…). Finally these results with a transient model are not so different than what was obtained almost 10 years ago (The paper is mainly innovative in its combination of paleoclimatic simulation and instrumental analogues).

Finally another major point is how to test the hypothesis that high frequency atmospheric situation can explain a long term tendency. It is not evident that mechanisms behind high frequency variability and long term one are the same.

The correction must evidently take into accounts these major comments but also a number of minor comments done by both reviewers. I expect that you correct your paper according to these comments, that you indicate in a cover letter the changes you did (or did not do explaining why).

Best regards J. Guiot

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 4, 585, 2008.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)