

Interactive comment on “Strong summer monsoon during the cool MIS-13” by Q. Z. Yin and Z. T. Guo

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 31 December 2007

General comment. Evidence mainly from the Loess Plateau of China is used to question the view that Quaternary terrestrial interglacials were cooler and glacials milder before MS-11. The question of monsoonal strength as indicating palaeo temperatures and rainfall totals is interesting and important. It is also considerably challenging because of the multiple factors that affect the balance between the climatic components; this is evident in the present climate but assessing it for the recent geological past is very much more difficult because of the dependence on many and diverse proxy indicators.

Comment 1. Notwithstanding the regional limits of the authors main evidence, the complexities involved in extrapolation of interglacial indicators across Eurasia, and leaving aside the distinctive hemispherical effects of the Tibetan Plateau, the authors do, in my opinion, make a *prima facie* case that is worthy of further expansion and testing. However, the subject of Quaternary climatic environments of eastern Asia is bolstered

by a substantial scientific literature base, relatively little of which is evident here.

Comment 2. Although the authors' argument is nowhere affected, the quality of the written English needs the attention of a native speaker of the language. The abundant graphical data available in the literature could have been used by the authors to question and qualify their case, thus broadening the debate.

In sum, the authors have the core of a case only and would do well to explore and exemplify a much richer range of published information. This would enable both authors and readers to advance the discussion.

Interactive comment on *Clim. Past Discuss.*, 3, 1119, 2007.

CPD

3, S757–S758, 2007

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper