

Interactive comment on “Detecting vegetation-precipitation feedbacks in mid-Holocene North Africa from two climate models” by Y. Wang et al.

H. Renssen (Editor)

hans.rensen@geo.falw.vu.nl

Received and published: 20 September 2007

Dear authors,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Climate of the Past.

Both referees find your paper an interesting contribution, presenting an original analysis of vegetation-climate feedbacks in mid-Holocene North Africa. However, Referee #1 mentions a recently submitted paper by Notaro et al. that has very similar methodology and conclusions. Since I do not have access to the Notaro et al. paper, I cannot form an opinion on the novelty of your contribution. I therefore encourage you to submit a revised version of the manuscript that clearly discusses the novel aspects of your

results compared to the Notaro et al. paper.

All other issues raised by the reviewers should also be addressed in the revised manuscript. One particularly important issue raised by both referees is the potential impact of runoff and soil characteristics on your results. Please discuss in detail the treatment of soils and runoff in your models, including the involved assumptions and the effect they might have on the presented results. Another important point, raised by Referee #2, is that some results discussed in the text require support from additional figures. Referee #2 recommends discussing figures showing seasonal results for precipitation, evapotranspiration and soil evaporation, as well as figures showing soil humidity and surface albedo for 6k and 0k.

Thanks again.

Hans Renssen

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 3, 961, 2007.

CPD

3, S582–S583, 2007

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper