

Interactive comment on “Quasi-100 ky glacial-interglacial cycles triggered by subglacial burial carbon release” by N. Zeng

J. Hargreaves (Editor)

jules@jamstec.go.jp

Received and published: 15 September 2006

The reviews of your manuscript titled, "Quasi-100ky glacial-interglacial cycles triggered by subglacial burial carbon release", are quite critical with one suggesting rejection and the other two major review. The main criticisms of the 1st and 2nd referees seem to focus around inadequate consideration of the evidence which appears to contradict the theory you present. My impression from the 3rd referee is that they want to see more justification of the model structure, since they think that with enough tuning of enough parameters it is not that hard to produce a cycle of about 100kyr, but that does not necessarily mean that the underlying processes have been understood.

I think these points must be dealt with in the paper before the paper can be considered for publication. Otherwise you are in danger of building a substantial theory, with

several published papers, but based on very little evidence.

Also, I would like to see you make it clear which parts of this paper are an advance on your own and others' previous work. There seems to be some debate among the reviewers as to how novel the work is, and whether it is an advance on your own previous work.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 2, 371, 2006.

CPD

2, S368–S369, 2006

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper