Clim. Past Discuss., 2, S273–S273, 2006 www.clim-past-discuss.net/2/S273/2006/ © Author(s) 2006. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons License.



CPD

2, S273–S273, 2006

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "On the verification of climate reconstructions" by G. Bürger and U. Cubasch

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 5 August 2006

The reviewer loses credibility from the outset by using a politically motivated non peer-reviewed report commissioned by vested interests in the U.S. congress and an unattributed comment from a blog as a motivation for his assessment. It is therefore hard to take anything he/she says seriously from that point on.

The reviewer does note a number of problems with the paper, and is correct that the paper is not acceptable in anything approaching its current form. However, the reviewer seems unaware of the more fundamental statistical flaws in the paper detailed by the other two reviewers. These flaws undermine the essence of the paper, and support the outright rejection of the manuscript.

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 2, 357, 2006.



Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper