

Interactive comment on “Fallacies and fantasies: the theoretical underpinnings of the Coexistence Approach for palaeoclimate reconstruction” by G. W. Grimm and A. J. Potts

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 4 January 2016

General comments This is a well-written manuscript. The text is well structured and the figures are clear. No methods for reconstructing palaeoclimates from biotic proxies are perfect. It is important to be aware of the limitations of each method. This ms is an in-depth critical analysis of the Co-existence approach. It would have been useful to suggest alternatives to it when ever possible; otherwise we are left with nothing. The section on page 5742, lines 9 and foll. is therefore too short.

Specific comments The first part of the title is slightly too confrontational.

Technical corrections Page 5728, line 2: used to Page 5733, line 24: add call to table 1 Page 5734, line 9: add call to table 1 Page 5736, line 15: one climatic parameter Page

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



5741, line 15: species through Page 5743, line 23: some capital letters missing Figure 2b: uniformitarianism [i missing]

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., 11, 5727, 2015.

CPD

11, C2845–C2846, 2016

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C2846

